

Trade in Services Series



Facilitating Temporary Labour Mobility in African Least-Developed Countries: Addressing Mode 4 Supply-Side Constraints



By **Sabrina Varma**
International Trade Consultant



Facilitating Temporary Labour Mobility in African Least-Developed Countries: Addressing Mode 4 Supply-Side Constraints

By Sabrina Varma
International Trade Consultant



Published by

International Centre for Trade and Sustainable Development (ICTSD)

International Environment House 2

7 Chemin de Balexert, 1219 Geneva, Switzerland

Tel: +41 22 917 8492

Fax: +41 22 917 8093

E-mail: ictsd@ictsd.ch

Internet: www.ictsd.org

Chief Executive:

Ricardo Meléndez-Ortiz

Programmes Director:

Christophe Bellmann

Programme Officers:

Sheila Sabune

Acknowledgments:

ICTSD is grateful for the generous support of the Department for International Development (DFID) of the United Kingdom, the Directorate-General for Development Cooperation (DGIS), Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands and the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA).

This publication is the result of a joint effort between ICTSD's Services Programme and Competitiveness and Sustainable Development Programme. For more information about ICTSD's Programme on Competitiveness and Sustainable Development, visit our website at www.ictsd.org

ICTSD welcomes feedback and comments on this document. These can be forwarded to Marie Wilke at mwilke@ictsd.ch

Citation: Varma, Sabrina (2009). *Facilitating Temporary Labour Mobility in African Least-Developed Countries: Addressing Mode 4 Supply-Side Constraints*, Issue Paper No. 6 International Centre for Trade and Sustainable Development, Geneva, Switzerland.

Copyright ICTSD, 2009. Readers are encouraged to quote and reproduce this material for educational, non-profit purposes, provided the source is acknowledged.

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-No-Derivative Works 3.0 License. To view a copy of this license, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/us/> or send a letter to Creative Commons, 171 Second Street, Suite 300, San Francisco, California, 94105, USA.

The views expressed in this publication are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of ICTSD or the funding institutions.

ISSN 1992-4348

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|-----|
| LIST OF TABLES | iv |
| LIST OF BOXES | iv |
| LIST OF ACRONYMS | v |
| EXECUTIVE SUMMARY | vii |
| 1. INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| Notes on Nature of the Study | 2 |
| 2. MAIN FEATURES OF AFRICAN LDC LABOUR MARKETS | 4 |
| 3. SKILLS DEVELOPMENT AND LABOUR MARKET SPECIFIC TRAINING ISSUES | 8 |
| Skills Shortages | 8 |
| Addressing Skills Development through Training | 10 |
| 4. USING TEMPORARY LABOUR MOBILITY TO ACHIEVE SKILLS DEVELOPMENT | 18 |
| Existing Policy and Institutional Capacity to Facilitate Temporary Labour Mobility | 20 |
| Lessons Learnt from Existing Arrangements for Developing a Policy Framework on Temporary Labour Mobility | 22 |
| Experiences in other Selected Source Countries | 23 |
| 5. REGIONAL POLICY FRAMEWORKS: POTENTIAL FOR RESOURCE POOLING AND SETTING POLICY DIRECTIONS | 27 |
| Continent Level | 27 |
| Regional Economic Communities | 30 |
| 6. CONSIDERATIONS FOR DESIGNING A STRATEGY IN THE CONTEXT OF A REVISED GATS LDC MODE 4 REQUEST | 32 |
| Other Possible Strategies for using GATS to Enhance Skills Development | 34 |
| 7. RECOMMENDATIONS | 36 |
| National Level | 36 |
| Regional Level | 37 |
| GATS Level | 38 |
| Role of International Community and Donors | 38 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY | 39 |
| ANNEX 1: Differences in Emphasis between Manpower Planning and Labour Market Analysis | 43 |

ENDNOTES

52

The author would like to thank ICTSD, particularly Sheila Sabune, and the readers Rupa Chanda and Joy Kategekwa for their feedback. In particular, the author is grateful to Marion Panizzon of the World Trade Institute for being a source of extensive and valuable input.

LIST OF TABLES

- Table 1: African LDCs
 Table 2: Examples of identified skills shortages
 Table 3: Overview of existing TVT initiatives in selected African LDCs
 Table 4: Overview of treatment of skills development issues in selected PRSPs of African LDCs
 Table 5: Positive and negative aspects of select regional, unilateral and bilateral temporary labour mobility arrangements: lessons for developing a temporary labour mobility policy framework
 Table 6: Nine themes and sub-themes of the African Union migration policy framework
 Table 7: Summary of AU Strategy to Revitalise Technical and Vocational Training in Africa
 Table 8: Summary of African Union framework for post-conflict reconstruction and technical and vocational education and training
 Table 9: Elements of CSS-2 to incorporate low-skilled workers
 Table 10: Areas for possible inclusion in the GATS

LIST OF BOXES

- Box 1: A selection of examples
 Box 2: Examples of African LDC TVT policy/institutional initiatives
 Box 3: Cape Verde: Skills development in the context of temporary labour mobility
 Box 4: The case of the Philippines
 Box 5: The case of Bangladesh
 Box 6: Australian-funded Technical College in the Pacific to meet Regional Skill Shortages
 Box 7: Regional South-South Co-operation on Fostering a Holistic Approach to Temporary Labour Mobility

LIST OF ACRONYMS

| | |
|--------|--|
| AfDB | African Development Bank |
| AIDS | Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome |
| APTC | Australia-Pacific Technical College |
| AU | African Union |
| BAIRA | Bangladesh Association of International Recruitment Agencies |
| BMET | Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training |
| BTVET | Business, Technical and Vocational Education and Training |
| COMESA | Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa |
| CSO | Civil Society Organisation |
| CSS | Contractual Service Supplier |
| DTIS | Diagnostic Trade Integration Study |
| EAC | East African Community |
| EC | European Commission |
| ECCAS | Economic Community of Central African States |
| ECOWAS | Economic Community of West African States |
| EIF | Enhanced Integrated Framework |
| ENT | Economic Needs Test |
| EPA | Economic Partnership Agreement |
| EU | European Union |
| FDI | Foreign Direct Investment |
| FNDP | Fifth National Development Plan |
| GATS | General Agreement on Trade in Services |
| GDP | Gross Domestic Product |
| GNI | Gross National Income |
| GPRSP | Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper |
| HIV | Human Immunodeficiency Virus |
| ICT | Information Communication Technology |

| | |
|--------|---|
| ILO | International Labour Organization |
| IF | Integrated Framework |
| IT | Information Technology |
| LDC | Least-Developed Country |
| MDG | Millennium Development Goal |
| MEWOWE | Ministry of Expatriates Welfare and Overseas Employment |
| MFN | Most-Favoured Nation |
| NEPAD | New Partnership for Africa's Development |
| NGO | Non-Governmental Organisation |
| ODA | Official Development Assistance |
| OECD | Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development |
| OWWA | Overseas Workers Welfare Administration |
| PARPA | Action Plan for the Reduction of Absolute Poverty |
| PEAP | Poverty Eradication Action Plan |
| POEA | Philippine Overseas Employment Administration |
| PRGSP | Poverty Reduction and Growth Strategy Paper |
| PRSP | Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper |
| REC | Regional Economic Community |
| SADC | Southern African Development Community |
| TLM | Temporary Labour Mobility |
| TVT | Technical and Vocational Training |
| UEMOA | Western African Economic Monetary Union |
| UNCTAD | United Nations Conference on Trade and Development |
| USA | United States of America |
| WTO | World Trade Organization |

FOREWORD

Least Developed Countries (LDCs) in Africa face significant levels of poverty and vulnerability and a high dependence on international trade. Moreover, they experience high levels of unemployment, low wages and labour productivity, and rapid population growth. The General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) and its provisions regarding the temporary movement of natural persons (Mode 4) could be extremely beneficial to address some of these countries' supply-side constraints.

The following Issue Paper (No. 10) on "Facilitating Temporary Labour Mobility in African Least Developed Countries: Addressing Mode 4 Supply-Side Constraints" by Sabrima Varma, an International Consultant, argues that temporary labour mobility from LDCs should be embedded in a broader skills development strategy, which addresses skills formation and long-term development objectives in the context of national development plans and Poverty Reduction Strategies Papers (PRSPs) in LDCs.

Labour mobility can have important development implications for LDCs. Remittances represent a crucial source of national income. Of the top 10 remittance recipients in LDCs, five were in Africa (e.g. Sudan, Senegal, Uganda, Lesotho, and Togo). In these countries, resources from remittances have been directed to investment in infrastructure, education and health, among others. Moreover, labour mobility may be an important alternative to permanent as well as illegal migration and brain drain, which would be largely beneficial to both sending and host countries. Likewise, temporary labour mobility could provide an immediate strategy to stabilize the economies of LDCs.

However, in order to contribute to sustainable development temporary labour mobility should be properly and effectively planned and monitored in source and host countries. If not, it risks to contribute to brain drain, worsen existing skill and labour shortages in key areas of the economy, and thus undermine crucial economic and social development goals of LDCs. Currently, the costs and risks of temporary labour mobility are unequally shared by the public and the private sector. Source and host countries should address these costs and risks, and ensure issues relating to the duration of the stay in host countries, the enhancement of skills, and return and reintegration of workers in LDCs. Ultimately, though, temporary labour mobility should not be an end in itself, but an important element of human capital development through the provision of training, work experience, and upskilling for LDCs.

The purpose of this paper is thus to contribute to a knowledge-based discussion on how LDCs could capture the potential benefits and reduce the risks of temporary labour mobility while at the same time building their supply-side capacity. Moreover, this paper aims to show the importance of embedding temporary labour mobility schemes into sustainable development plans in LDCs.



Ricardo Meléndez-Ortiz
Chief Executive, ICTSD

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The African least-developed countries (LDCs) are amongst the poorest in the world facing serious human and economic development challenges. Despite their diversity, most are experiencing high population growth rates, low levels of labour productivity, wage rigidity, high levels of unemployment, especially amongst the youth, and persistent under-employment. The current global economic downturn provides an additional context for making attainment of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) by 2015 a serious challenge.

With a large informal sector and an abundance of low-skilled labour, the African LDCs, together with other LDCs are pursuing market access for their low-skilled workers in the context of the World Trade Organization (WTO) negotiations, specifically through the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) and its provisions relating to temporary movement of natural persons, otherwise referred to as Mode 4.

Moving beyond existing discussions which focus on either temporary labour mobility in the bilateral context or global migration governance, and using a “joined-up” policy approach, this paper argues that there are a number of policy and institutional supply-side constraints related to Mode 4 at the national level which need to be addressed if the full development benefits of market access are to be realised, and the potential costs minimised. In addition, this paper argues that temporary labour mobility should be embedded in a broader skills development strategy which addresses skills formation and development issues in the context of national development plans/Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs). This will require serious institutional and policy capacity building and expansion of effective Technical and Vocational Training (TVT), institutions and curricula which fit in with local systems as well as ensuring certification, accreditation and recognition. It will also require developing and mainstreaming policy and putting in place an institutional framework on temporary labour mobility in order to facilitate, manage, monitor and evaluate flows.

The aim should not be to use temporary labour mobility as the end objective but rather as a part of the human capital development process to provide training, work experience, work-based values and upskilling so that such skills can be reabsorbed in the economy upon return. This is why it is critical to ensure that there is a match between the needs of the domestic economy and those of international markets, using the former as the basis for action, so as to ensure that planning takes into account the number of temporary workers moving away and the implications for the economy, specific sectors and achievement of national development objectives.

If pursued in an appropriate development context, temporary labour mobility can be considered useful for reforming and addressing fundamental domestic labour market issues - including unemployment and training - together with skills development in key sectors and occupations of interest which contribute to national development objectives and increase overall competitiveness and productivity.

1. INTRODUCTION

The African least-developed countries (LDCs) are amongst the poorest in the world with poor rankings in human development indicators, as set out in the UNDP Human Development Index. Most continue to experience rapid rates of population growth; many are experiencing conflict or post-conflict situations and are seeing skills shortages in various critical sectors to which training systems are not responding effectively. Often, their labour force is threatened by high rates of emigration of skilled labour, HIV/AIDS and, in some countries, child labour. Many are also land-locked countries, vulnerable to external price shocks and tend to have a limited revenue base and export basket, together with relatively low levels of economic growth.

In terms of migration status, some serve as destinations for migrants from other African countries and are sources for migrants to OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development) countries, whilst others are both source and destination countries for African migrants. Some have shifted from being destination to source countries and some serve as destination, source and transit countries (Shaw 2007).

In the context of the multilateral trading regime, the African LDCs together with other World Trade Organization (WTO) Member LDCs have been pursuing an active agenda on securing market access for temporary service providers through the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS). Due to the otherwise nascent state of their services sector, their main area of offensive export interest has been in the temporary movement of labour, particularly in the semi- and low-skilled categories of occupations in light of the abundance of low-skilled labour. Moreover, the case has been well made for the development benefits which can be accrued by developing countries, especially LDCs, particularly in the lower-skilled categories if they were to be granted even limited yet meaningful liberalisation by developed country trading partners in this respect (Walmsley and Winters 2003; Rodrik 2002). In fact Mode 4¹, or the temporary movement of natural persons, is recognised by WTO Members as the one

area in trade in services of particular interest to developing countries and LDCs and where action is needed.² However it remains the area in which least progress has been made in the GATS negotiations despite the current Round of trade negotiations under the Doha Development Agenda.

Placed in the broader international migration discourse, temporary labour mobility is seen as an attractive development-friendly option for the upskilling of labour through the acquisition of knowledge and experience, and building of human capital which is a necessary element to strengthen overall supply-side capacity and to achieve national development objectives. The benefits to the host economy have also been studied in terms of addressing labour shortages, contribution of new ideas and the possibility of new networks for knowledge and business exchange which are mutually beneficial.

The contribution of remittances to development and poverty reduction has also been documented: for LDCs it exceeds Official Development Assistance (ODA) levels and is second to foreign direct investment (FDI) (Azam 2005). Trends in remittances for the African LDCs show that it has continued to increase as a percentage of gross national income (GNI) (UNCTAD 2006). Of the top 10 LDC remittance recipients, five were African (Sudan, Senegal, Uganda, Lesotho and Togo) in 2007 and in 2006 there were six African LDCs (World Bank 2008). Furthermore, temporary workers in the middle to lower-skilled categories tend to send a larger portion of their income home (UNCTAD 2003). Specific examples such as Mali, Senegal, Burkina Faso, Lesotho and Uganda illustrate how remittances have led to investment in African LDCs in areas such as infrastructure, education and health, housing and entrepreneurial activities and also acted as a stimulus for savings, growth and had a positive impact on foreign exchange reserves.

Moreover temporary labour mobility is seen as an alternative form of movement to developed countries than that of permanent migration of

skilled professionals which is often associated with brain drain and loss of key human capital, which has been experienced and documented in Africa, particularly in the health, science and engineering sectors, which can have serious implications for economic growth. For example the brain drain from African LDCs to OECD countries is particularly high with an emigration rate of 21 percent of the skilled population moving to OECD countries (Docquier and Marfouk 2006). Again, eight of the top 10 LDCs with the highest skilled emigration rates in 2000 were African LDCs (Cape Verde, Gambia, Somalia, Eritrea, Mozambique, Sierra Leone and Liberia) (World Bank 2008).

Importantly, temporary labour mobility is also seen as a useful strategy for not only countering permanent migration but also managing clandestine migration, with the potential to significantly enhance return migration, which is a mutually-beneficial arrangement for both sending and host countries. Finally, it is viewed as a useful immediate policy mechanism through which to stabilise an economy in the face of economic downturn which is particularly relevant in African LDCs where high structural unemployment and limited employment opportunities are common features (Chand 2004).

However, if not planned properly, there is the risk of exacerbating the costs associated with temporary labour mobility given it may worsen existing skill or labour shortages in key areas of the economy, with serious implications for undermining national development objectives. This is also related to the costs associated with temporary labour movement turning into permanent migration and issues such as duration, guaranteeing return and reintegration should be a mutually-shared responsibility among host and source countries.

The actual costs of implementing, operating

and monitoring a temporary labour mobility arrangement will also have costs which are currently unequally shared amongst public and private sector stakeholders and these costs may also be differentiated between rural and urban communities.

There is evidence of exposure risks to HIV/AIDS, sexually-transmitted diseases and other diseases, mental illness and adjustment issues on the part of workers in the host country and also anecdotal evidence in other regions of family breakdown and dependency on remittances. Returning workers may also face readjustment and reintegration issues. The abuse of human rights, particularly in the case of female domestic workers, and poor treatment and working conditions of workers in the host country has also been documented and is cause for concern (Chanda 2008).

Therefore within this backdrop, as the LDCs continue to push for pursuing their interests in Mode 4 within the multilateral trade context, African LDCs need to consider several issues, which this paper will explore:

- To what extent are they in a position to supply trading partners with suitable temporary workers?
- What are the main policy and institutional constraints which need to be addressed in order to build supply side capacity in Mode 4 and how can they be addressed?
- To what extent does the push for Mode 4 fit in with existing development objectives and what strategy should be pursued?
- What needs to be done to ensure that the development impact is maximised and the costs are minimised?
- Are there good practices to draw on?
- What measures can be taken at the national, regional and international levels to promote the development effectiveness of Mode 4 opportunities?

Notes on Nature and Scope of the Study

Temporary labour mobility is inherently multidisciplinary as it overlaps with education, training and skill formation issues, labour

market policy, trade (in the context of Mode 4), migration, human rights and development. Therefore the approach taken in this paper is one

of “joined-up” policy which seeks to capture the various aspects involved, using existing country examples and case studies.

Furthermore, much of the literature tends to focus on channels for lawful temporary labour mobility from the host country perspective, considering issues such as how countries could better manage labour market admission schemes, how burden sharing - as to temporariness of stay and guaranteeing return - should be allocated amongst host and source countries and how to organise more effectively labour market supply and demand. These studies are in the context of bilateral trade and non-trade agreements and the opportunities for access to employment and labour markets. Some of them set out irregular cross-border migration-for-employment and overstays. Overall, temporary labour mobility issues tend to be divorced from the needs of the national labour market or skills development or the role of TVT without reference to how temporary labour mobility can be used as a part of the process of skill acquisition, development and retention, particularly in the low skills occupations. Reference to migration issues tend to be in the context of the loss of skilled labour and the implications it has had for domestic labour market needs.

This study predominantly focuses on the skills dimension. There are other elements which are just as important such as access to credit, financial and business services, improved infrastructure, innovation and access to new technologies etc. which also have links to skills development and implications for improving competitiveness and increasing productivity, but these fall outside of the scope of this study.

In the migration context, forced migration, refugee movements and trafficking are important features of the African migration landscape however they are not directly addressed in this study.

Migration, labour and employment in the African context suffer from a severe lack of data. Also, inter-regional migration and out of continent migration are subject to major data and statistical challenges given such sources of information remain often incomplete or outdated. Consequently there is very limited data in the very specific area of temporary labour mobility.

Obviously the lack of data remains an important obstacle to identifying areas of interest, formulating effective policy and managing and monitoring such policy frameworks, which needs to be urgently addressed.

2. MAIN FEATURES OF AFRICAN LDC LABOUR MARKETS

Whilst characteristics of the African LDCs, and LDC economies in general, are diverse, whereby growth rates vary and the focus of economic activity can range from minerals to extractive industries and agricultural commodities, they also face similar structural issues which have been set out in various reports and presented particularly aptly in the UNCTAD LDC Report 2006, which highlights the constraints faced in the context of the development of productive capacity, namely: physical infrastructure, institutional weaknesses

(firms, financial and knowledge systems) and the demand constraint.

The report sets out the ways in which LDCs as a group have experienced little structural change. It notes that the interrelated processes of technological learning, innovation and capital accumulation which are needed to drive structural transformation, productivity growth and international competitiveness, are largely absent.

Table 1: African LDCs

| Country | Landlocked | Small Island Developing State | WTO Member |
|----------------------------------|------------|-------------------------------|--------------|
| Angola | | | X |
| Benin | | | X |
| Burkina Faso | X | | X |
| Burundi | X | | X |
| Cape Verde* | | X | In accession |
| Central African Republic | X | | X |
| Chad | X | | |
| Comoros | | X | Observer |
| Democratic Republic of the Congo | | | X |
| Djibouti | | | X |
| Equatorial Guinea | | | Observer |
| Eritrea | | | |
| Ethiopia | X | | In accession |
| Gambia | | | X |
| Guinea | | | X |
| Guinea-Bissau | | X | X |

| Country | Landlocked | Small Island Developing State | WTO Member |
|-----------------------|------------|-------------------------------|--------------|
| Lesotho | X | | X |
| Liberia | | | Observer |
| Madagascar | | | |
| Malawi | X | | X |
| Mali | X | | X |
| Mauritania | | | X |
| Mozambique | | | X |
| Niger | X | | X |
| Rwanda | X | | X |
| Sao Tome and Principe | | | Observer |
| Senegal | | | X |
| Sierra Leone | | | X |
| Somalia | | | |
| Sudan | | | In accession |
| Togo | | | X |
| Uganda | X | | X |
| Tanzania | | | X |
| Zambia | X | | X |

** Whilst Cape Verde graduated from LDC status in December 2007, it has been kept in this study for illustrative purposes, given that it provides some insights in the context of temporary labour mobility.*

Related to the issue of temporary labour mobility, the problem of productive absorption of labour is a severe challenge in LDCs in general and can lead to outward migration pressure (Lucas 2008). A decline in agricultural production leads to a drop in adequate formal employment and hence an increase in employment in the informal sector and low value-added services involving basic

equipment and low skills, leading to low labour productivity.³ This is further exacerbated by poor infrastructure in key areas such as energy, communications and transport.

Increasing urbanisation has meant that one of the main challenges for African LDCs is that 46 percent of the increase in the economically

active population is forecast to be outside of the agriculture sector between 2000 and 2010, particularly for countries such as Benin, Equatorial Guinea, Sierra Leone, Zambia, Liberia, Lesotho, Mauritania and Republic of the Congo (UNCTAD 2006). This is of particular concern given high unemployment (including amongst youth due to

restrictive labour policies in many countries), persistent underemployment and very low income levels commonly found in many African LDCs (Denu, Tekeste and Deijl 2005). This is even the case in LDCs which are considered to experience reasonable growth rates such as Benin, Burkina Faso, Mali and Senegal.

Box 1: A selection of examples

Senegal's population growth rate is 2.8 percent with 100,000 new job seekers entering the job market annually, with more than 50 percent having not attended school. The unemployment rate amongst the youth is 38 percent and it can take an average of four years to find a job. Approximately three percent have a TVT qualification (AfDB 2008). High emigration rates, especially clandestine movements remain a major issue despite the granting of visas to young Senegalese under the relatively new agreement with Spain (Cape Verde DTIS 2008).

In Burkina Faso, the unemployment rate is 7.8 percent in rural areas and 17.7 percent in urban areas whilst it is 29.4 percent in the 15-24 year old age group compared to 21.4 percent for 25-29 year olds. Ethiopia continues to experience a high unemployment rate of 26 percent and in some urban areas it can reach up to 40 percent. Unemployment in Niger is 16 percent, rising to 24 percent for youth.

The service sector makes the largest contribution to African LDCs' GDP. However for African LDCs, as in the case of other LDCs, the sector's potential has yet to be fully realised.

The gender dimension is also an important component of the temporary labour mobility picture given many women are engaged in the service sector, particularly in areas where there is a growing demand, such as domestic workers, carers, teachers and nurses (ILO 2002). Yet the participation rates are still lower for females in primary and secondary education, hence affecting access to vocation education and the difference is more pronounced in tertiary education.

The informal sector⁴ forms an important part of all African LDC economies, making up to 56-60 percent in terms of employment and contribution to output in some African LDCs (ILO 2004). It is responsible for most rural non-farm and urban employment. For example in Benin, on average the informal sector accounts for 78 percent of non-farm employment and more than 92 percent of all employment (Johanson and Adams 2004). The informal sector continues to grow and

consists of three main segments: subsistence self-employment (to which there is a gender dimension in areas such as retail trading, hairdressing and handicrafts), micro-enterprises serving rural markets and small scale enterprises, all with their own constraints. Small-scale trading around personal services and provision of wholesale goods for end consumption is a key feature. Given that the emergence of the informal sector is due to factors such as the lack of absorption capacity of the formal sector, many entrants have no or low education levels. In some countries such as Tanzania, Zambia and Senegal, half of workers in the informal sector have no education or primary education, with less than five percent with post-secondary education or training (DFID 2007).

However there is also a dynamic element to the labour market, with people entering and leaving it, or being in both formal and informal sectors, and with the entrance of a new generation of entrepreneurs engaged in new areas such as cyber cafés. It has been found in some West African LDCs that education plays a key role for informal sector entrepreneurs as they need less time to enter into self-employment (Xaba *et al* 2002).

The nature of expansion of the informal sector is based on the low end type of activities and saturation and lack of absorption capacity are becoming evident as more people continue to enter. Whilst countries are recognising the importance of the informal sector and developing elements of informal sector policies, there is still no coherent policy framework for its development (Kingdon *et al* 2005).

Expenditure in TVT is mainly focused on the formal sector, with minimal portions allocated to training and programmes in informal education. Gradually, there is a shift towards more focus on formulating informal TVT and finding funding to support it, including at donor level. Development of a skills agenda must actively include the informal sector.

3. SKILLS DEVELOPMENT AND LABOUR MARKET SPECIFIC TRAINING

Skill Shortages

Skill shortages exist across various occupations and skill levels in African LDCs. From doctors, nurses, engineers, teachers and scientists to managers and specialist technicians, the skills shortage in the high-skilled and skilled professions is acute and is a serious constraint to building productive capacity (Barrett, Carter and Little 2006). Regional labour mobility could play a potential role here but clearly there is also a need to address this type of shortage through labour market planning and the education system. However, there is also a shortage in the trades such as plumbing and carpentry and in the semi-skilled and some low-skilled occupations

particularly in the social services sectors such as health and education. There is still little work which undertakes a comprehensive assessment of the skills challenge, identifying specific occupation levels within each sector of priority. Once this exercise is undertaken it could be used as a basis for assessing whether and how temporary labour mobility may play a positive role in addressing some of these shortages through provision of relevant skills training/work experience (this could also be done in turn in the context of surpluses in certain occupations) (Singh 1994). The table below provides some examples of skills shortages in some African LDCs.

Table 2: Examples of identified skills shortages⁵

| Country | Skills area |
|--------------|---|
| Benin | Construction, tourism, food processing, craft sector, telecommunications, health care and transport. |
| Burkina Faso | Hotel-related skills, maintenance, joinery and plumbing. |
| Cape Verde | IT (back office support and off shore services), construction, sea-related careers, care workers and tourism (including health and retirement-centred tourism for tourists and retirees of the diaspora). |
| Mozambique | Tourism, customs personnel, fisheries management, energy/oil sector. |
| Rwanda | Tourism and hospitality, ICT, business-related skills such as management and marketing, banking, engineering, agricultural techniques, policy-making and administration, trades such as mechanics, and carpentry. |
| Senegal | Port-related skills such as expertise in product quality management tools, equipment maintenance, expertise in shipping procedures and related services (warehousing, packaging, transit) and design and production of logistics systems. |

| Country | Skills area |
|--|---|
| | Construction sector: foremen to ensure coordination and quality as sector is dominated by informal workers with little skills training or qualifications. Supervisors for plumbing, masonry and tiling jobs. Specialised jobs such as topographers and surveyors. |
| Tanzania | Carers for the elderly and disabled, tourism, Information Communication Technology (ICT). |
| Zambia | Trades: plumbers and bricklayers. Specialised engineering skills, nurses and health care workers. |
| Ethiopia, Gambia, Guinea, Malawi, Mali, Mozambique, Sierra Leone, Uganda | Tourism |

The above serves merely as an example and is not exhaustive. In fact, in most of these countries there is likely to be shortage of many of the types of skills listed but the difference lies in specific identification and emphasis, as discussed further below. The skills can be grouped under the following categories:

- Private sector/business skills (e.g. entrepreneurial skills, marketing and management);
- Vocational skills (e.g. building and construction, handicrafts, tailoring, carpentry, equipment repair, mechanics, electrical installation and maintenance);
- Agricultural skills (e.g. food preservation and storage, agricultural techniques, diversification);
- High skills (e.g. science and technology, teaching, engineering, advanced technical skills in computing and science);
- Service-related skills (e.g. banking and accountancy, tourism and hospitality); and
- Public sector skills (e.g. policy-making, project design, management and evaluation).

In addition, upon review of the selected PRSPs and Diagnostic Trade Integration Study (DTISs), it was also evident that many countries are seeking

improvements in areas such as basic skills (e.g. functional numeracy and literacy, domestic skills, basic health and knowledge), generic/transferable skills (e.g. creative thinking, computer skills, communication skills, problem-solving and analytical skills) and citizenship skills (e.g. awareness of culture and history, morals and values, attitudes to authority).

The selected PRSPs reviewed also reflect a difference in the perception of the skill shortage issue. For example, some countries felt that there is an absolute shortage in critical areas and they hence rely on foreign labour, whereas others are concerned with the need to upgrade the existing skills pool and expand training in order to address new demands. This reflects the different socio-economic, cultural and political contexts of countries such as those recovering from conflict situations and associated loss of human capital as well as those which may have a greater dependence on the agricultural sector and lower levels of urbanisation, hence requiring a different skill set.

There are various approaches for assessing skills shortages, such as labour market analysis approach and manpower planning.⁶ Within the African LDCs a combination of broad approaches

are used in some cases whilst in others it is apparent that there is a leaning towards the traditional manpower planning approach. Obviously the country context will dictate the type of approach which is most relevant and useful. However, the overview of the PRSPs do indicate that specific mechanisms need to be put in place to effectively monitor skills needed as part of the broader skills development strategy.

Labour market analysis and follow up at the micro level in the training process have been weak as has been the case at the macro level in

terms of collation, processing and analysing of data to guide skills development policies. There have been various failed attempts around the development of “labour market observatories” which were advocated by the World Bank and have been concretised by some bilateral agreements due to lack of capacity and a shortage of basic data and information. However, there are alternative useful examples such as community skill development centres in Namibia and the creation of regional employer associations in Madagascar, both providing signals to training providers (Brown *et al* 2001).

Addressing Skills Development through Training

The evolution of the education and training systems and skills development in African LDCs have been influenced by forces such as globalization (impacting on traditional methods), colonialism and the role of religious organisations in education and skills training (DFID 2007). As previously discussed, attainment of universal primary education still remains a major challenge in most African LDCs and illiteracy rates are high in many countries, especially in rural areas. In the context of provision of informal education and training there are issues related to lack of funding, adequately qualified trainers, poor quality and lack of coherence. Tertiary education, although expanded in previous decades, has not produced enough qualified graduates in the right areas and this has been exacerbated by situations of conflict, prevalence of HIV/AIDS and outward migration especially in high-skilled professions (Black 2004).

There has been a strong bias towards academic training rather than vocational learning and in many cases access to technical and vocational secondary education has been limited. On gender, the situation is complex whereby in some cases enrolment in TVT is even but biased in areas of focus, whereas in other cases there is an overall imbalance. However access of females to TVT remains an issue and stems from poor participation in primary and secondary levels of education.

Although these are only indicative, TVT enrolment figures vary across African LDCs as they do not

include all aspects of TVT provision. For example, in Malawi, Niger and Eritrea the proportion of TVT enrolment in secondary education is under two percent, for Senegal and Lesotho it is closer to two percent, for Uganda, Togo and Mozambique it can fall between 5-9 percent and in Mali it is over 10 percent (AfDB 2008).

Technical and vocational training systems in African LDCs differ from country to country and are delivered at different levels in different types of institutions, including technical and vocational schools (both public and private), polytechnics, enterprises and apprenticeship training centres. They can be delivered by government or private sector providers, ranging from NGOs and church-based organisations to firms, each with their relative strengths (such as targeting of vulnerable groups, flexibility, self financing and on-the-job learning) and relative weaknesses (such as poor training quality, non-accessibility and unsuitability). It is worth noting that through traditional apprenticeships, the informal sector is the main provider of vocational training in African LDCs, especially in West and Central African countries.

In general terms the TVT system in African LDCs suffers from poor funding; existing resources can be better utilised and donor support has been sporadic and inadequate to endure quality and access. For example, on average only 2-6 percent of education budgets are directed at formally-provided TVT,

whilst the share of bilateral ODA commitments to TVT remains at 3-4 percent in the period 1995 to 2006, compared to commitments to primary education which have increased from 11 percent to 34 percent in the same period (AfDB 2008).

Whilst it is not within the scope of this study to explore the strengths and weaknesses of different approaches to the provision of TVT, it is for countries to assess the best mix which meets their requirements and stage of economic development. Skills and TVT-related policies are most effective when they are in line with overall development objectives and the needs of the labour market and this can only be achieved when there is a proper assessment of how vocational training contributes to skills development and the development process (Kingombe 2008). However lack of monitoring and evaluation (including lack of data collection) of TVT programmes, particularly in youth unemployment, means that it is difficult to improve service delivery, planning and resource allocation and to enhance overall impact.

Given the prominence of the informal sector in African LDCs focusing on the lower-skilled occupations in the context of temporary labour mobility can lead to significant benefits enhancing competitiveness and economic growth, contributing to productive employment, poverty reduction and social inclusion. In this context, TVT and skills development are critical areas where concerted effort must be mobilised. However, existing assessments show that there is a lack of a coherent strategy by African countries, including LDCs, concerning where TVT is situated in a country's national development policy and skills needed and corresponding educational curricula, together with weak links to post-secondary and tertiary institutions, as well as firm-based and informal training (AfDB 2008). Also, institutional issues such as clear mandates and authority, broad ownership, clear regulatory frameworks and local/ decentralised management are instrumental in determining the effectiveness of TVT (DFID 2000).

Moreover, by and large, despite giving attention to aspects of education and training, such issues do

not feature within the context of a comprehensive approach which makes the linkages between economic development objectives, human resource development and TVT within PRSPs. The reduced attention to skills development has been accompanied by the emphasis on the provision of basic education which has been reflected in the international development agenda.

An overview of existing TVT-related institutions, policies, initiatives and reforms in selected African LDCs leads to a number of observations in the context of skills development and training:

- Overall responsibility is often shared amongst a number of ministries which can lead to problems of lack of coordination and clear roles and responsibility;
- Lack of TVT strategy vis-à-vis the informal sector (identifying the strengths/ comparative advantage of certain types of informal training on global labour/skill marketplace, such as certain forms of artisanal work etc) (Muganda 2001);
- Funding by donors of (outdated) curricula, which no longer reflect global labour market needs and often funding is unmatched by opportunity for circular migration for training and education purposes;
- Circular mobility of university professors (joint chair appointments in host and home countries), return incentives for expatriate professors and other educational, scientific and medical personnel have often failed, even if laid down in bilateral migration-related agreements on exchange of scientific and technical personnel or broader migration management agreements;
- Diffused responsibility for training and education at the international level and among institutional donors;
- Decentralisation is only found in a few cases;
- Funding is erratic and generally low as a proportion of GDP;
- Poor infrastructure, outdated materials, lack of equipment and low levels of qualified trainers;
- Inadequate focus on use of ICT in education and training due to the low level of skills

- training in this area (Pigato 2001);
- Problems around the relevance of curricula in terms of matching education and training
 - Private sector involvement is the exception rather than the norm.

Table 3: Overview of existing TVT initiatives in selected African LDCs⁷

| |
|---|
| <p>Angola</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TVT under Ministry of Public Administration, Labour and Social Security and overseen by the National Institute of Vocational Training within the ministry. • Reintegration of former combatants into the labour market, especially in the informal sector, is a major objective but initiatives have not been sustained. • Unlike other countries, there is a preference for technical training but it is viewed as a stepping stone to higher education rather than for immediate entry into the labour market. • Although there was a three year plan (2005-2007) to develop TVT, little progress has been made in major areas such as curricula and staff. • Current capacity cannot cope with demand given that 300,000 job seekers enter the labour market annually and the quality of training is also considered inadequate. • There is lack of coordination and quality of basic education provision is low. • Specific areas have been construction and IT. • New vocational training centres have been established in remote areas. • An observatory collects and disseminates data, and there are initiatives for internships, self-employment and creation of micro enterprises. |
| <p>Benin</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Current TVT system does not meet the needs of the economy and places too much focus on providing diplomas as a means for further study and less focus on training for skills development for labour market entry. • Many institutions are underequipped and do not have qualified teachers. Supply is unevenly distributed geographically. There is a bias towards administrative and management skills over agriculture and technology. • Various initiatives including: a TVT master plan, efforts to address teacher training, refurbishment, a fund and expansion of training centres, have led to some progress. |
| <p>Burkina Faso</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor TVT provision with only eight percent of the total number of students represented. • Dominated by private sector provision. • Vocational training centres provide main training and focus on agriculture yet only take five percent of students and have high registration fees. • Poor links with private sector yet many enrolled in services and industry-related areas. • Two major five-year training projects launched in 2007 to train 25,000 students as service contractors and 50,000 in trades such as electricians and plumbers. • Focus on improving qualifications of those in the informal sector. • TVT falls under Ministry of Labour, Employment and Youth, created in 2006 whilst the Minister for TVT (post created in 2002) is within the Ministry of Secondary and Higher Education and Scientific Research with additional ministries responsible for sectoral training. • There have been other initiatives in the trades and training in craft trades, vocational integration and the establishment of a national observatory to analyse data on employment and training. • A national employment policy with strong TVT is being developed due to the complex institutional arrangements. • One major area for reform is fees in areas such as hotel trade, maintenance, joinery and plumbing. |

Democratic Republic of the Congo

- Negative perceptions regarding TVT, resulting in poor enrolment and it not being seen as a priority.
- TVT-related infrastructure and tools in disrepair reflecting lack of investment.
- Quality of teaching and curricula inadequate and therefore supply of labour not meeting labour market needs.
- Lack of management, organisation and coordination.
- Recommendations have been identified including implementation of the 2006 ministerial order on education policy.

Equatorial Guinea

- Only two vocational training centres in the country with poor infrastructure and few qualified trainers and offering few courses relevant to the needs of the economy.
- Major reform has been introduced in 2008 with a view to modernising training facilities, build capacity of staff and increase providers.
- New areas of focus will be in industrial design, accounting and stock management, and industrial maintenance.

Ethiopia

- Extensive system of TVT for both formal and informal sectors.
- Despite considerable TVT outreach, demand is exceeding supply.
- Agriculture, health and teaching are the main focus areas.
- TVT is the responsibility of the Ministry of Education; however the Ministry of Capacity Building has been involved.
- Government considering TVT governance and management reform through establishment of autonomous TVT authorities at state and federal levels together with a TVT Council.
- Reviews have found quality has not kept up with expansion and most TVT graduates did not meet requirements of employers.
- Lack of systematic testing and certification.
- Lack of qualified teachers and adequate funding.
- Third Education Sector Development Programme in place with a view to increasing enrolment to 315,000 by 2009/2010 through enhanced training delivery, being more demand-driven and outcome-based with labour demand directly informing TVT design.
- Government also to adopt new funding mechanisms including bringing in the private sector.

Liberia

- National objective for TVT is to empower rural residents and vulnerable groups.
- Initiatives have focused on quick employment and reintegration programmes for ex-combatants given the TVT system had collapsed under civil conflict.
- Ministry of Labour and Ministry of Education work together on TVT.
- Skills focus on IT, agriculture, domestic skills, computer repair and carpentry.
- Bureau for Vocational and Technical Services within Ministry of Education is responsible for overall TVT oversight.

Malawi

- Under the Ministry of Labour, review of TVT took place in the late 1990s and as a result Technical, Entrepreneurial and Vocational Education and Training policy was formulated and the Technical, Entrepreneurial and Vocational Education and Training Authority was established.
- Main focus of the policy is to promote a demand-driven competency-based system founded on labour market needs and sustainable funding.

- There is extensive competency-based training through a national apprenticeship scheme, some on-the-job-training and a private sector training programme which supports training needs analysis and development of staff.
- However lack of skilled labour continues to be an issue, there is confusion with types and levels of testing and certification.
- Firms are not providing enough training to workers (e.g. only half of the formal sector provides any training).
- Variation in weaknesses between TVT in the informal and formal sectors with weaknesses in theory over practice in the case of the former and vice versa in the case of the latter.
- As the manufacturing sector shrinks, more semi-skilled and skilled workers are moving into the informal sector however whilst there are entrepreneurial training programmes there are challenges in identifying needs as applicable in the informal sector.

Mozambique

- TVT initiatives have been slow in responding to increased demand for medium to high skills in the gas, metals and telecommunications sectors.
- TVT provided through technical schools under the Ministry of Education and Culture. However other ministries such as Agriculture and Transport also offer TVT courses.
- High failure and drop out rates, under-qualified staff and poor materials and infrastructure.
- Dependence on government funds which are inadequate.
- TVT carried out in uncoordinated and ad-hoc manner with little overall framework to integrate and coordinate and provide quality assurance.
- Most institutions based in major towns limiting access and shortage of training for informal sector.
- Private institutions which offer specialised skills training are considered more successful.
- New reforms launched for 2006-2011 to facilitate transition to a demand-led system through a governance framework, involvement of all stakeholders, a new qualifications framework with standards for sectors with shortages and diversified funding and decentralisation.
- To date little progress has been made in coordination, development of one policy and qualifications framework. Shortage of funding and poor facilities has also led to little progress in pilot projects for competency-based training in tourism, agriculture, industrial maintenance and administration.

Niger

- TVT falls under a number of ministries including Basic Education and Literacy, Secondary and Higher Education, Research and Technology, Social Development, Women's Rights and Child Protection, Sports, Youth Employment, etc. There is a lack of coordination or integrated vision.
- There are laws which provide the basis for TVT policies which are rather general.
- Most receive vocational skills through on-the-job training with little theoretical training.
- TVT training itself is considered effective but its applicability to the labour market is subject to discussion.
- Facilities are considered good but institutions often do not work to full capacity.
- Focus is on the tertiary sector and there is no vocational training aimed at rural workers.
- In order to promote employment, TVT initiatives are focused on inclusion of the rural sector, coordinating the training system, strengthening the informal sector, sustainable funding and development of apprenticeship programmes. Training centres in community development contexts have also been expanded.

Rwanda

- Labour market reforms since 2003 to address skills shortages and provide upskilling in preparation for membership into EAC underlying TVT efforts.
- Priority is given to labour and employment policies focusing on women, skills auditing and vocational training centres.
- Demand exceeds supply of training and there are weaknesses in staff in terms of qualifications and technical competencies with an impact on quality.
- Underfunding of the TVT sector is a structural problem and budget allocation remains low.
- More on- the- job training and practical skills are being requested by the private sector.
- Major TVT reform was undertaken in 2007 with development of a policy framework, decentralisation and the establishment of the Rwanda Workforce Development Authority which focuses on skills development across all sectors, improving quality and capacity, addressing negative perceptions and promoting priority sectors.
- Introduction of national occupational standards, examination, certification and accreditation to enhance the role of the private TVT providers.
- Stimulating private investment, undertaking improved efficiency and cost savings to address resource issues.
- Eventually a national qualifications framework and national occupational standards through the establishment of a Technical Education and Training Authority.

Senegal

- 2002 policy adopted which re-orientated TVT towards needs of the economy and identified areas for reform such as training and apprenticeships.
- Ministry established in May 2008 for Technical Education and Vocational Training. However other ministries with a mandate also include Youth and Youth Employment, Public Service, Work/Employment and Education, Technical Vocational and Professional Training. The Ministry for Senegalese Abroad and Tourism also has a number of agencies which deal with TVT.
- National Office for Vocational training set up in 1986 to work with training centres to provide short-term training courses focusing on craftsmen and associations, in sectors such as fishing, livestock and family economics and crafts in the context of the informal sector.
- Focus on tourism, fishing, ICT, construction and agribusiness.
- Budget allocation to TVT has been erratic.
- Currently in phase two of a 10-year education and training programme, considered consistent with its PRSP with a focus on TVT together with basic education.
- Plans call for raising TVT enrolments from 5000 to 20,000 by 2010 and to achieve a 70 percent rate of employment among young people after completion of training.

Tanzania

- Whilst implementation of the Technical Education and Training Policy has led to some improvements, supply of suitable labour has not kept pace with demand and skill shortages remain a major challenge.
- Formation of Vocational Education Authority in the mid-1990s facilitated spread of TVT in both public and private institutions.
- Budget allocation has been increased (due to donor assistance).
- National Employment Creation programme, 2007 is focused on lifelong learning.

Uganda

- Business, Technical and Vocational Education and Training (BTVET) policy established in 2003 under Ministry of Education and Sports covering both formal and informal institutions.
- Aim of policy to provide framework for technical skills development at post-primary level so that direct labour force entry and/or tertiary/TVT level entry is facilitated.
- Distinction between training delivery and quality assurance issues together with mechanisms for regulation of qualifications (assessment, certification).
- Reforms being undertaken with a view to having more balance between academic and TVT.
- BTVET comprises mainly private institutions, followed by public and an unknown number of apprenticeships and enterprise training programmes. Whilst enrolment in public institutions has been rising, these do not meet demand and have been subject to cuts. The full number and nature of private programmes remain unknown.
- Subject areas include agriculture, tourism and health.
- Main challenge is lack of a legal framework (to provide a national qualifications framework for classification and recognition of formal and informal training programmes, establishment of a central registry) and central coordination to upgrade and maintain standards, together with inadequate human and physical infrastructure, low staff salaries, negative perceptions and lack of recent data to inform curricula development.

Zambia

- Technical Education, Vocational and Entrepreneurship Training Policy established in 1996 by Ministry of Science, Technology and Vocational Training but is also the joint responsibility of the Ministry of Education.
- Technical Education, Vocational and Entrepreneurship Training Authority has reinforced government's efforts to work closely with the private sector and all stakeholders are represented on its board. Its main function is to develop curricula based on occupation profiles, quality assurance on training standards through regular auditing and management of a training fund.
- Government funding has been increasing for public institutions and is supplemented with student fees.
- Most students enrolled in private institutions; most popular courses were engineering, construction, business and IT and there is strong female participation.
- Challenges in addressing varying quality, improving quality of staff and addressing existing skill shortages.

Source: Adapted from AfDB 2008.

Despite the weaknesses, it is worth noting that there are specific TVT policy initiatives which have been formulated within some African LDCs, which can be reviewed, lessons learnt and built upon.

Some African LDCs have specifically identified targets for 2015 within TVT such as Ethiopia which

plans to increase admissions to 624,095 by 2015 from 103,708 in 2005, Rwanda and Gambia which have committed to a 50 percent increase in the number of TVT institutions, Mozambique which is undertaking reforms to increase participation in TVT and Mauritania which has launched a programme of reforms to facilitate skills training to match labour market needs.

Box 2: Examples of African LDC TVT policy/institutional initiatives

Benin: addressing skills needs in the informal sector through dual training system within traditional apprenticeships.

Zambia: establishment of Technical, Vocational and Entrepreneurship Training Authority which provides a regulatory framework and facilitates long term planning.

Senegal: has a TVT ministry which has launched TVT programme of reform viewing it as a tool for building competitiveness. Certification level goals have been developed.

Rwanda: promoting skills development

Rwanda has developed a proactive human resource development agenda which includes the establishment of a Human Resources Development Agency that has overall responsibility for skills development. Under the Ministry of Education there are approximately 70 TVT schools and considerably more youth training centres under the Ministry of Youth. Training is provided in the context of the work agenda which is directly linked to infrastructure development needs and includes courses related to construction, plumbing, welding and electrical installation.

Rwanda: promoting skills development

Rwanda has developed a proactive human resource development agenda which includes the establishment of a Human Resources Development Agency that has overall responsibility for skills development. Under the Ministry of Education there are approximately 70 TVT schools and considerably more youth training centres under the Ministry of Youth. Training is provided in the context of the work agenda which is directly linked to infrastructure development needs and includes courses related to construction, plumbing, welding and electrical installation.

Absence of practical experience in training programmes in some countries means that temporary labour mobility could fill an important gap and can be considered as part of a broader training and skills development agenda.

4. USING TEMPORARY LABOUR MOBILITY TO ACHIEVE SKILLS DEVELOPMENT

Given that temporary labour mobility is of great interest to most African LDCs and they are pursuing a strategy focused on pursuing market access overseas, this section reviews to what extent labour mobility is identified as an area of priority and more broadly to what extent skills development training issues are not only prioritised but considered within the context of building productive capacity and competitiveness in selected African LDCs.

Most, if not all countries, mention the importance of job creation and tackling unemployment to reduce poverty. In addition, some highlight their concern with underemployment; however there is a general lack of strategy on how skills development will be geared towards meeting labour market needs and addressing the main goals in the national development plan/PRSP.⁸ Many refer to their visions of national development where they exist however, it would be interesting to compare the approaches undertaken in their national development plans and PRSPs, which may raise issues related to the relationship between acquiring skills to reduce poverty and meet development targets in the short term, and acquiring skills for developing long term global competitiveness.

There are three different approaches in the visions set out in the PRSPs: 1. a clear articulation of a vision such as that of Rwanda which wants to be a high skills service-based hub in the region, 2. a more broad-based gradual approach, such as Tanzania, or 3. a more basic approach, such as Gambia which is looking to address basic needs and requirements through developing adequate human capital.

Many LDCs have specifically addressed human resource development as a priority or main pillar/theme. Some LDCs have addressed it in the context of education and training issues, as a cross-cutting issue or as a human development/wellbeing issue in the context of access to social services. A smaller number of LDCs have addressed human resource development in the context of competitiveness and private sector development. Only in a few cases is skills development addressed comprehensively.

Interestingly, there is generally little discussion on the link between the needs of the social sector (seen mainly as an access issue) and skills development where the potential of temporary labour mobility could be used, as in the case of certain categories of health workers such as carers.

Most PRSPs give considerable prominence to TVT-related issues and make the linkage between the need to make skills development and training more in tune with labour market needs. Many PRSPs focus on expansion of institutions, enrolments and quality issues whilst separately identifying human capital requirements and training needs in some of the priority sectors (if at all), but very few make the links with employment and labour issues. Relevance of curricula is hardly mentioned.

Despite extensive experience in intra- and inter-migration, very few countries (Zambia is an exception with its PRSP mentioning the health sector) include the interface between migration-related issues and skills development despite dealing with large inward and outward migration (brain drain). Only Rwanda has mentioned the aim of becoming a net exporter of skills in the region and Senegal has mentioned the role of the diaspora and managing migration.

Although there is no recognition of temporary labour mobility in PRSPs in the context of trade or skills development, the next generation of DTIS, which are being undertaken in the context of the Enhanced Integrated Framework (EIF) (an international trade-related technical assistance programme directed at African LDCs) are taking on board this aspect in the context of export potential in countries such as Cape Verde.⁹ After a process of fostering ownership, the identified priorities and related plans of action are supposed to be mainstreamed into the country's PRSP.

The development of information systems in the context of the labour market and targeting of the informal sector is also mentioned only in exceptional cases.

Table 4: Overview of treatment of skills development issues in selected PRSPs¹⁰ of African LDCs

| COUNTRY | Treatment within overall objectives and as priority | Linked with labour mobility issues |
|----------------------------------|--|------------------------------------|
| Benin | Human resource development is a key priority. Based on a stronger vocational training system according to the needs of the labour market. Sectors of interest such as tourism and construction are mentioned in the context of skills development. | Recognition of migration issues. |
| Democratic Republic of the Congo | No mention of skills development and training in sectors of interest in PRGSP. Education issues covered under priority related to improving access to social services but no mention of TVT. | No |
| Gambia | Relates to “Vision 2020” on developing human capital. Refers to skills and training in isolation in terms of expansion and increased enrolments. Particular focus on government sector skills issues. Mentions training needs in sectors of interest such as tourism, livestock and fisheries. | No |
| Guinea | Whilst PRSP-2 acknowledges there has been a poor match between training and needs of economy, there is little mention of how this will be improved except for mention of the need for vocational training centres improving quality and increasing training staff. Qualifications in fisheries, using the Si fossi focomining sector to address unemployment and the need for skills in craft are mentioned. | No |
| Malawi | Social development is a key theme in the growth and development strategy which includes addressing education issues. Training needs in some priority sectors is mentioned together with strategies on TVT. | No |
| Mali | GPRSP-II focuses on employment policy and training issues in the context of the priority of strengthening the social sector and access to social services. Nothing on sectoral skills/training needs. TVT is highlighted as a key area. | No |
| Mauritania | Of the five priorities, development of human resources is one and is linked to expansion of basic services. Reference to “Vision for 2015” which is to have upgraded human resources to meet labour market needs. Recognises weaknesses and outlines comprehensive TVT-related strategy focusing on improving and strengthening relevance of TVT. | No |

| | | |
|------------|--|---|
| Mozambique | PARPA II identifies human capital as a major priority. | No |
| Rwanda | Refers to “2020 Vision” of being a regional trade and services hub and therefore identifies human development as a priority. Mentions skills issues in sectors of interest such as garments, ICT, agro-processing and tourism and TVT-related response. | Aims to be net exporter of skills in region |
| Senegal | Importance of skills/training through education and building human capital seen as a main priority in context of access to social services. In sectoral priorities there is no mention of skills requirements. Employment policy is seen as a support measure for wealth creation (a main priority) and TVT expansion and rehabilitation seen in the context of labour market needs. | No but managing and tracking migration and encouraging role of the diaspora |
| Tanzania | Skills and human resource development viewed as priority in context of improvement of life and wellbeing. Reference to expansion of TVT as a priority under Tanzania’s “Development Vision 2025”. | No |
| Uganda | PEAP III recognises TVT as a priority particularly in the context of matching TVT with needs of labour market for achieving one of the main priority themes related to production, competitiveness and incomes. | No |
| Zambia | Technical skills/TVT is one of the priorities in the FNDP and builds on the following reforms: development of suitable training, assessment and qualifications system to meet labour needs, improve training quality, strengthen regulatory capacity and increase participation of women. Targeting of informal sector to identify skills gaps and development of information systems. | No but brain drain a concern |

Existing Policy and Institutional Capacity to Facilitate Temporary Labour Mobility

In 2000, 56 percent of low-skilled workers present in OECD countries could be found in Europe and one third in North America. However this does not differentiate between temporary and permanent low-skilled workers. Geography has been a large determinant in directing low-skilled flows with only nine percent of low-skilled workers from LDCs (Docquier and Marfouk 2006).

Obviously African LDCs have considerable experience with migration issues given the

history of inter/intra and outer (legal/illegal) migratory movements. However, there is still no comprehensive framework to address such issues and as a result there are sporadic initiatives in aspects of managing labour mobility (Adebusoye 2006). The recent emergence of a possible new generation of labour mobility partnership agreements in certain African LDCs will contribute to the development of an overall policy and legal framework on temporary labour mobility. Nevertheless some of the existing initiatives are

useful and could be retained and/or built upon in the context of development of a broader framework. For example, Ethiopia provides visa-free entry to the diaspora to foster ties and countries such as Mali, Senegal and Burkina Faso have established ministries/agencies to foster cultural exchanges, information dissemination and investment by the diaspora. Whilst some cases such as Senegal reflect real impact, other cases remain subject to discussion and it is clearly an area where more research is required (Shaw 2007).

Senegal's agreement with Spain is a reflection of a new generation of development co-operation in the context of labour mobility which is characterised by institutionalisation and shared responsibility in key aspects of the process, including managing flows, training and skills development, orientation and reintegration. For example, Spain is responsible for providing pre-departure orientation, linguistic and pre-employment training to low-skilled workers who have been selected to work in the country.

Senegal was able to follow a two-pronged strategy of pursuing market access for its low-skilled workers on a quota basis, while obtaining development-orientated support and capacity building to effectively implement the arrangement in order to maximise the development benefits. This approach also serves to improve benefits for the host country in terms of having access to suitable labour and ensuring their return (Panizzon 2008).

However, reintegration into the domestic labour

market remains an issue and recent concerns have been raised with the nature of the administrative process around the issuing of visas from Senegal together with the continuing surge in clandestine movements to Spain (Cape Verde DTIS 2008).

Cape Verde has recently entered into a pilot mobility partnership with the European Union (EU) designed for the joint management of migratory flows between the EU and other countries in order to reduce illegal migration and ensure return. Implementation will take place through bilateral agreements with individual member states. Four European countries have entered the partnership: Portugal, Spain, France and Luxembourg. The partnership provides for the setting up of a joint centre which will accept applications for short-stay visas, building Cape Verde's capacity to manage migration, for example, by establishing a centre designed to implement measures for the information, integration and protection of migrants and returnees. Development of job opportunities in Cape Verde is also on the agenda. The partnership also provides for initiatives to enable the Cape Verdean diaspora to contribute to the development of the home country by encouraging transfers of money and skills and facilitating circular migration and return, as a way to mitigate the impact of the emigration of highly qualified individuals. It is not clear what occupational categories will be included in the scheme as yet. The content of the partnership is currently being negotiated however, given the development nature of the agreement, it will contribute to addressing various existing policy and institutional constraints.

Box 3: Cape Verde: Skills development in the context of temporary labour mobility

An increasing portion of Cape Verdeans are working in Southern Europe as carers for the elderly. This is a general demographic trend within Europe and there are many Cape Verdeans working throughout Europe in homes for the elderly. The growing demand for such services may be met not only in Europe, but also through the development and diversification of the Cape Verdean tourist industry into specialised services for the elderly who visit or return to Cape Verde (i.e. including return migrants and the diaspora).

Source: Cape Verde DTIS 2008

There are also ongoing discussions within the EU to extend the pilot scheme to Senegal which has a significant supply of low-skilled labour.

By way of contrast, the EU is continuing to take the same approach on temporary labour mobility in line with its GATS Mode 4 commitments in the

context of the Economic Partnership Agreements (EPAs) currently being negotiated with each of the RECs within Africa. Hence the EPAs are only covering very limited commitments on the category of contractual service supplier (CSS) with stringent qualification requirements, together with the categories of graduate trainees, independent professionals, technical experts and management

personnel associated with commercial presence. Moreover, these are subject to the use of restrictions, ENTs, recognition requirements and lack of clarity. However the exclusion of semi- and low-skilled service providers means that overall there is little on offer which is of direct development interest or benefit to African countries in the area of Mode 4.

Lessons Learnt from Existing Arrangements for Developing a Policy Framework on Temporary Labour Mobility

Existing regional and bilateral initiatives provide important lessons, both positive and negative, for African LDCs to take into consideration in the context of developing a policy framework to manage temporary labour mobility and therefore

facilitate movement in a way which maximises the development benefits and minimises the potential costs. Table 5 below presents a list of the positive and negative elements:

Table 5: Positive and negative aspects of select regional, unilateral and bilateral temporary labour mobility arrangements: lessons for developing a temporary labour mobility policy framework¹¹

| Positive | Negative |
|---|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Specificity on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - category and number of workers - sectoral and occupational focus - scope of work - duration - obligations and responsibilities on part of both countries and employer and worker - wages and working conditions - flexibility in design and implementation to allow for local labour market conditions | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Unclear coverage of whether foreign workers fall under host country labour laws |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use of combination of disincentives (penalties) and incentives (refund of social security and pension contributions upon return) | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coordinated documentation and administrative mechanisms and institutional frameworks for undertaking processes related to selection, recruitment, departure and return | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Broad-based stakeholder participation | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strong inter- and intra-agency policy coordination | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Regulation and oversight over intermediaries | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Failure to address unregulated recruitment practices and sub-contracting |

| Positive | Negative |
|--|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Holistic approach to temporary labour mobility including coherence with other relevant policy spheres | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mechanisms to protect workers' rights in both host and source country | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inadequate redressal provisions for foreign workers |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Granting of social and legal right and protection | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lack of recourse by foreign workers to workers' associations |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Support and advisory structures for workers in preparation for departure, through duration of work in host country and upon return | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Incentivisation for formal banking channels through which to send remittances | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Registration and tracking mechanisms, plus regular review capacity | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Capacity building through co-development projects and community level programmes | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provision of vocational training | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reporting requirement on return and reintegration policies such as business support services, building entrepreneurship and advice and education on productive investments | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Insufficient use of positive incentives to facilitate return |

Source: Chanda 2008.

Experiences in other Selected Source Countries

The experience of developing countries in addressing Mode 4 supply-side constraints is varied. Most are still in the process of developing adequate infrastructure (physical and administrative) together with appropriate training programmes which meet both domestic and international labour market needs. There are also examples of countries which have not placed temporary labour mobility interests within the context of a broader development framework, particularly related to domestic labour market needs and skills development. Whilst there

is a clear attempt in some cases to provide a regulatory framework, reintegration policies and enhance training capacity to meet both domestic and international needs, much of the problem lies in a lack of capacity to implement and enforce regulations. Furthermore, there is also inadequate sensitisation, which is reflected in existing illegal movements, abuse, exploitation and trafficking, particularly in the case of women workers, even in countries with relatively advanced frameworks for managing temporary labour mobility.

Box 4: The case of the Philippines

The Philippines is a well-documented case of government policy which has actively sought to export its labour through meeting global demand in certain sectors such as nursing and seafarers. In particular, the case of nurses and doctors is well known, mainly in the context of the acute shortage of health personnel being experienced in the Philippines' health sector: 85 percent of 177,000 nurses are working overseas (UNCTAD 2008). This is clearly a case of temporary labour mobility not being adequately placed within a national development and planning context. However this must also be viewed in the broader economic context in the Philippines where there are little incentives for professionals to remain in the country.

It must be recognised that the institutionalisation and regulation of its workers are perhaps among the most developed through the active roles of the Philippine Overseas Employment Administration (POEA) and the Overseas Workers Welfare Administration (OWWA) which are attached to the Department of Labour and Employment. Non-governmental organisations also play a large role in areas such as pre-departure preparation and reintegration. There are strong oversight and verification systems, licensing procedures, strict documentation processes (including IDs and certificates), regulatory and monitoring mechanisms to ensure transparency and legitimacy. The POEA provides skills training and testing. Overseas Labour Offices provide on the ground support services and a welfare fund to which employers contribute.

Incentivisation of remittances and savings are used to encourage workers to return and there are specific investments and savings packages. Certain provisions are also extended to dependents of workers. There are resource centres for returning workers, which provide educational and training services, together with investment advice with a view to encouraging entrepreneurial activities.

Despite the elaborate institutional mechanisms and procedures, problems are cited including ongoing illegal recruitment, abuse and exploitation, lack of enforcement of workers' rights, inadequate pre-departure training and monitoring and poor coordination of reintegration policies. This reflects the importance of capacity to undertake implementation and enforcement, together with evaluation.

Source: Chanda 2008.

Box 5: The case of Bangladesh

With a population of approximately 140 million, one of the highest population densities in the world, and an abundance of low-skilled workers, labour mobility is of great interest to Bangladesh and has been pursued as a conscious policy since the mid-1970s. Approximately 225,000 workers leave Bangladesh annually for contract employment mainly to the Middle East and South East Asia. Data collection is not disaggregated based on age and on education, however, research indicates that most workers tend to be between 15-30 years old.

The Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training (BMET), which is located within the Ministry of Expatriates Welfare and Overseas Employment (MEWOE) is the executing agency for temporary labour mobility. It is charged with control and regulation of recruiting agencies, collection and analysis of labour market information, registration of job seekers for local and foreign employment, development and implementation of training programmes, including apprenticeships, in the context of both domestic and international labour needs, organisation of pre-departure briefings and resolving legal disputes. They have identified four categories of migrant workers: professionals (doctors, teachers, nurses), skilled (drivers, garment workers), semi-skilled (tailors and carpenters) and unskilled (cleaners, house maids). Movement in the unskilled category has experienced the most numbers. The MEWOE has the power to implement the 1982 Emigration Act which includes promoting, monitoring and regulating migration. Other ministries which are involved in the policy process include those of civil aviation, tourism, finance and foreign affairs. Overseas missions are also used to explore potential labour market opportunities, certify documents for recruitment, provide support services to workers and ensure welfare of migrants.

The recruitment process is characterised by a host of intermediaries, some official and legitimate, while others are less credible and act without authority in terms of poaching people and collecting fees. Recruitment is undertaken by private recruiting agents and individuals. In 1986 the government set up the Bangladesh Overseas Employment Services which became organised as the Bangladesh Association of International Recruitment Agencies (BAIRA) which has 700 member agencies.¹² In addition to working in the interests of its members, BAIRA has also launched a number of initiatives in the area of insurance and banking for migrant workers, the setting up of a medical testing centre, short-term language courses and briefing sessions. Civil Society Organisations play a limited role, some may provide legal advice or be involved in the provision of pre-departure briefing.

A large proportion of remittances in fact by-pass the banking system, although they still have a positive impact on the economy and on poverty reduction. Remittances are the country's second-biggest source of foreign income after ready-made garments, totalling USD7.91 billion in the 2007/08 financial year.¹³

Assessing the impact of the framework provides a mixed picture with on the one hand huge development benefits through remittances, but on the other, the lack of an integrated development-based strategy has meant that there are gaps in key areas. For example, the enforcement of workers' return is done at the host country end, especially in Asian countries. However, there is an absence of a policy framework for facilitating their reintegration which is one of the major weaknesses of Bangladesh's labour mobility framework. Despite having training issues for both national and international needs located within the same bureau, skills development remains a key challenge for the country. In addition, lack of protection of rights and migration of undocumented workers remain serious problems in light of the dominance of the private sector recruitment agencies and the role of intermediaries.

Sources: Siddiqui 2004; Miyan 2003.

Box 6: Australian-funded Technical College in the Pacific to meet Regional Skill Shortages

- In order to address serious gaps in vocational training within the Pacific Island Forum Countries, the Australia-Pacific Technical College (APTC), was established in 2007 in Papua New Guinea as an Australian government-funded initiative. It was created as a centre of excellence for obtaining Australian standard vocational qualifications in areas such as tourism and hospitality, automotive, manufacturing, construction, electrical trades, health, and community services.
- The aim is to provide skills training for labour requirements in the region, which also includes LDCs, and the areas of training include those in which Australia has a shortage of suitable labour.
- Training centres will also be established in Samoa, Vanuatu and Fiji which will focus on tourism. The APTC offers Australian Certificates III and IV level vocational training. The qualifications are accredited in Australia
- Courses are delivered by Australian-registered training organisations which have to meet specific standards.
- Quality assurance is governed by the requirements of the Australian Quality Training Framework, which is endorsed by Australian employers and the industry, which means the qualifications are recognised in Australia and internationally.
- Recognition of prior learning is provided.
- It presents opportunities for further training or higher education at Australian educational institutions.

Source: www.aptc.edu.au

Box 7: Regional South-South Co-operation on Fostering a Holistic Approach to Temporary Labour Mobility

The Abu Dhabi Declaration is a pilot project launched by India, Philippines (as the sending countries) and the United Arab Emirates (as the host country) and is an excellent example of south-south co-operation in the area of Temporary Labour Mobility (TLM). The idea is to test and identify best practices in managing TLM and the lessons learnt will form the basis for developing a comprehensive regional framework. The focus will be in the sectors of construction, health and hospitality and will concentrate on introducing improvements to recruitment, working and living conditions in host country and reintegration.

Source: International Organization for Migration, www.iom.org

5. REGIONAL POLICY FRAMEWORKS: POTENTIAL FOR POOLING RESOURCES AND SETTING POLICY DIRECTIONS

Continent Level

There are a number of continent-wide/regional policy frameworks/initiatives which apply to the African LDCs in terms of their implications for temporary labour mobility and skills development. This section provides a review of the main ones and provides an assessment of their approach.

In light of the implications posed by migration in the context of political, socio-economic and environmental conditions, together with the broader globalisation process itself, the African Union (AU) adopted the Migration Policy

Framework, a non-binding reference document which is presented as a comprehensive migration policy strategy with policy recommendations and principles and guidelines to assist governments and the RECs in the formulation of national/regional migration policies. It does not address prioritisation, resource mobilisation or monitoring and evaluation functions. Moreover, it has a strong focus on labour movement within Africa and makes little distinction between temporary labour mobility and migration-related issues.

Table 6: Nine themes and sub-themes of the African Union Migration Policy Framework

1. Labour Migration

- National labour migration policies, strategies and legislation
- Regional co-operation and harmonisation of labour migration policies
- Labour movement and regional economic integration
- Border management

2. Irregular Migration

- Migrant smuggling
- Human trafficking
- Return and re-admission
- National and international security and stability

3. Forced Displacement

- Refugee and asylum-seekers
- Internally-displaced persons
- Protracted displacement situations
- Crisis prevention, management and conflict resolution

4. Human Rights of Migrants

- Legislation and policies
- Principles of non-discrimination
- Integration and re-integration
- Stateless persons

5. Internal Migration

6. Migration Data

- Collection and analysis of migration data
- Regional migration data exchange

7. Migration and Development

- Collaboration with African diaspora
- Brain drain
- Remittance transfers

8. Inter-State and Inter-Regional Co-operation**9. Other Social Issues**

- Migration, Poverty and Conflict
- Migration and Health
- Migration and Gender
- Migration and Environment
- Migration and Trade
- Migration, Children, Adolescent and Youth
- Migration and the Elderly

Source: Adapted from African Union 2006.

Interestingly, migration and trade are addressed under theme 9, “Other Social Issues”, which calls for the treatment of GATS Mode 4 not only as a trade issue but also as a migration issue and for undertaking training of government officials in this regard. Specifically, the growing relevance of short-term migration in the context of trade in services is recognised, together with the need for more information on losses and gains from the temporary movement of skilled workers in order to assess its impact. The need to put in place modalities to give effect to temporary labour mobility in the GATS framework is also highlighted. Strengthened co-operation on migration and trade amongst the regional economic communities, in addition to bilaterally and multilaterally amongst and beyond African countries is proposed. Finally, the setting up of channels of dialogue amongst government agencies dealing with migration, trade and labour to specifically address temporary labour migration issues is mentioned.

The sensitivities around the issue of low-skilled workers is reflected in its specific treatment under theme 1, “Labour Migration”, in the context of regional movements within Africa, with the suggestion of establishing quotas for unskilled workers in situations of economic crisis. Other recommended strategies in the context of labour migration worth highlighting include: creation of transparent and accountable labour recruitment and admission systems, harmonisation of labour

laws with immigration policies, building national capacity to manage labour migration, promoting gender-specific approaches, promoting HIV/AIDS awareness, improving national and regional data collection, facilitating integration of migrants - including through equal opportunity measures such as social protection, social security and trade union membership - and incorporation of ILO conventions relating to migrant workers' rights.

Given the importance of remittances, particularly from temporary workers, it is also worth noting the recommended strategies for remittances which include: improving the quality of data, strengthening collaboration to create incentive strategies and investment opportunities in commercial, savings and entrepreneurial activities, and promoting policies that encourage the outreach of relevant institutions such as financial establishments, post offices and credit unions.

Whilst migration is not explicitly mentioned as a sectoral priority in the context of the New Partnership for Africa's Development (NEPAD), reversal of brain drain is identified as a key outcome to be addressed mainly through political, social and economic issues in order to facilitate retention of African human resources, together with harnessing both the financial role and the skills of the diaspora. Additionally, skills

development does not feature on the agenda, apart from the identification of the need for ICT specialists.

The African Union has designed a strategy to revitalise technical and vocational training in Africa which provides a framework to

guide national policies to promote quality TVT and outlines roles of stakeholders with a view to “promoting skills acquisition through competency-based training with proficiency testing for employment, sustainable livelihoods and responsible citizenship” (African Union 2007b).

Table 7: Summary of AU Strategy to Revitalise Technical and Vocational Training in Africa

| Summary of AU Strategy to Revitalise Technical and Vocational Training in Africa | |
|---|--|
| Objectives: | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • revitalise, modernise and harmonise TVT in Africa and transform it into a mainstream activity for African youth development, youth employment and human capacity building; • position TVT programmes and institutions as vehicles for regional co-operation and integration and socio-economic development; and • mobilise all stakeholders in a concerted effort to create synergies and share responsibilities for the renewal and harmonisation of TVT policies, programmes and strategies. |
| Issues: | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • poor perception of TVT; • gender stereotyping; • instructor training; • links between vocational and general education; • traditional skills, business management and entrepreneurial training; • harmonising TVT programmes and qualifications; • links between formal and non-formal TVT; and • linkage between TVT and the labour market. |
| Roles: | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • sensitisation of all stakeholders on the importance of TVT; • investment in TVT and its related components; • building leadership and management capacity to drive TVT; • providing training within national policy framework; • funding TVT research and advocacy; • mainstreaming vocational education into the general education system; and • lobbying local authorities for TVT. |

Source: Adapted from African Union 2007.

The AU has also adopted a framework for post-conflict reconstruction and TVT, with the main objective to use TVT in post-conflict areas in order to contribute to the reconstruction process, with a particular focus on promoting youth skills and employment. Based on the approach set out, this initiative should contribute to enhancing the capacity, quality and focus of training institutions.

Table 8: Summary of African Union Framework for Post-Conflict Reconstruction and Technical and Vocational Education and Training

Summary of AU Strategy to Revitalise Technical and Vocational Training in Africa

Strategies:

- Curriculum based on market demand and employment;
- Practical training methodologies;
- Deliver concurrently with basic and family life skills (i.e. creative thinking, analysis, language) ;
- Focus areas for acquisition of skills should include infrastructure development, basic socio-economic activities and local community needs;
- Other areas for possible focus in post-conflict situations include:
 - agriculture
 - building and construction (masonry, carpentry, painting and decorating, plumbing, electrical installation)
 - water and sanitation maintenance
 - welding and fabrication
 - vehicle repair and maintenance
 - electrical and electronic equipment repair
 - handicrafts and traditional crafts
 - basic ICT skills
 - tourism-related skills (hotel management, tour guides, chefs and waiters)
- Encourage private training providers to play lead role;
- African Union Commission to coordinate and monitor TVT programmes, identify and share best practices and sensitise governments on using TVT.

Source: African Union 2007a.

This is a useful framework which could be used (of which there are many among African LDCs) as a guide especially for post-conflict countries particularly to identify specific skills areas for focus.

Regional Economic Communities

African LDCs are also members (often simultaneously) of various regional economic communities including the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS), the West African Economic Monetary Union (UEMOA), the Economic Community of Central African States (ECCAS), the Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (COMESA) and the Southern African Development Community (SADC). These are underpinned by the development of human capital (through improving education systems, strengthening and expanding new institutions, and harmonising and coordinating policies) and have the long term objective of promoting the free movement of persons.¹⁴ Initiatives to realise this are at different levels of implementation in the various RECs,

however the focus has been on facilitating short-term stays in member countries rather than an environment where citizens can move and work freely, although ECOWAS has made most progress in moving towards this direction. Nationals of the East African Community (EAC) and SADC have visa-free entry in member states. Whilst the idea of labour mobility is supported throughout the RECs, it is underpinned by a gradual approach in light of the limited employment opportunities to local workers and security concerns. Having said this, COMESA's provisions on temporary labour mobility provide an example of south-south ambitious and extensive free movement of labour within an economic region.

Whilst some RECs have a pure economic focus such as COMESA, others, such as SADC, involve co-operation in areas such as education and training through the SADC Protocol on Education and Training (1999) which aims to achieve equivalence, harmonisation and standardisation in education and training systems, sharing of resources and encourage student/staff mobility in the region. The Southern African Development Community has developed an inventory of training institutions and training award programmes. In COMESA, co-operation in the harmonisation of higher education policies is reflected in EAC members. There are discussions between SADC and COMESA on possible co-operation in education and training. However, concerted efforts to develop human resources in Africa are considered to be marginal and most efforts have been focused on harmonising and coordinating

education policies including on certification, accreditation and curricula (UNECA 2004).

Although there are few common education institutions across RECs as the focus has been more on a continent-wide approach, some do provide capacity building including the African Regional Centre for Engineering Design and Manufacturing, the African Regional Centre for Technology and the United Nations African Institute for Economic Development and Planning. Other initiatives include the African Virtual University and the Association for the Development of Education in Africa which facilitates sharing and exchange of practices and strategies. There is also a migration dialogue for Southern Africa and the Dakar Declaration (initiated by International Organisation for Migration) which has been signed by most West African countries.

As in the case of TVT-related issues, despite numerous relevant initiatives, it appears that regional co-operation in human resource development and related areas of education, training and labour mobility in Africa is not as advanced in terms of implementation as it is in other regions (e.g. Caribbean and Pacific). This may be related to lack of capacity and expertise within RECs, persistent unemployment and high population growth rates in countries, lack of resources and the numerous initiatives at various different levels which can appear fragmented and lacking prioritisation (ILO-EU/EAC 2004). Moreover, there is little reference to such regional initiatives at the national level.

6. CONSIDERATIONS FOR DESIGNING A STRATEGY IN THE CONTEXT OF A REVISED GATS LDC REQUEST IN MODE 4

One of the key objectives set out in the GATS Preamble is to increase the participation of developing countries in trade in services and to expand their services exports. In addition, Article IV: 1 of the GATS recognises that the liberalisation of sectors and modes of supply of export interest to developing countries is a means to increase their participation in international trade. In this respect, Article IV:3 accords special priority to LDCs. Given the nascent state of their services sector and in light of their abundant availability of low-skilled labour, LDCs have identified Mode 4 market access, particularly in the semi-skilled and low-skilled categories, as the most important offensive area of development interest to them in the GATS negotiations. This is reflected in Paragraph 9 of the LDC Modalities which highlights Mode 4 as potentially benefitting both sending and recipient WTO Members. The development benefits of liberalising low-skilled categories of service suppliers will continue to hold as long as there continues to be a disparity between the abundance of low-skilled labour in LDCs and the shortage in developed countries. Therefore, WTO Member countries are called upon to consider undertaking commitments to provide market access in Mode 4 and in particular taking note of the categories of natural persons as identified by LDCs in their requests. Therefore, this not only illustrates the importance of Mode 4 to LDCs in achieving the broader objectives set out in the GATS - which is reiterated in the LDC Modalities giving an institutional recognition amongst all WTO Members of this importance - but also shows that there is no exclusion of skill categories of service suppliers.

The African LDCs, together with other LDCs in the WTO, have submitted joint requests for Mode 4 market access to the WTO membership and have been met with no satisfactory response. Their most recent request covered a broad range of sectors and occupational categories within those, ranging from skilled to semi- and low-skilled (WTO 2006). The request was submitted to all WTO Members.

Least-developed WTO Member countries have also submitted a proposal which suggests a way forward for operationalising “special priority” as set out in the GATS and further supported in the LDC Modalities. If implemented, this proposal would serve to provide LDCs with priority market access in sectors and modes of interest, including Mode 4, which is currently not available in the context of the GATS, contrary to the case of trade in goods. Therefore this should also remain an important component of the strategy for LDCs in the WTO.

Mode 4 has experienced the least progress in the GATS negotiations due to the political sensitivities and perceived loss of flexibility in the context of most-favoured nation (MFN) obligations, and therefore it follows that progress in the main area of interest to LDCs, the low-skilled categories, has been non-existent despite all the various development-orientated proclamations in this regard within the GATS architecture. Existing commitments for semi- and low-skilled categories of service suppliers are mainly unbound both horizontally and in the sector-specific schedules. The focus of liberalisation has been on high-skilled categories of service providers such as business visitors, specialist personnel and management personnel associated with commercial presence.

Now, with the prospects of lower economic growth and recession in the context of the current global economic downturn, together with ongoing national security concerns, it may be that LDCs should refine their expectations so as to realise feasible outcomes. However, given that there has been no progress in this area (or any other area for that matter) of interest to LDCs, they should continue to push for improvements, especially as the global economic downturn will have a disproportionately adverse impact on LDCs. At the same time, LDCs should be willing to provide some flexibility to host countries and undertake institutional capacity building to be in a position to undertake joint obligations which involve managing the administration surrounding Mode

4 flows including in selecting workers, tracking and monitoring and ensuring return. If LDCs are seen to be proactively willing to share some of the responsibility related to managing Mode 4 flows, the prospects for Mode 4 may appear more appealing to other WTO Member countries.

It is worth noting some of the main administrative features in the most recent Mode 4 request submitted by LDCs, which have direct implications for addressing Mode 4 supply side constraints on the part of African LDCs:

- Establishment of skills testing facilities;
- Alternative methods of assessment of competencies beyond minimum qualifications, such as experience, occupational and proficiency certification;
- Acceleration of the process for verification and recognition of competence, skills and qualifications within three months;
- Direct receipt of remuneration by service suppliers; and
- Option for contract renewal.

These themes are beneficial and appropriate for LDCs to push for in the context of Mode 4 market access. In particular it is worth noting that LDCs have opened the path to a more innovative approach to Mode 4 by suggesting to widen its scope through the inclusion of a broader range of categories and sectors, through de-linking it from commercial presence and the expansion of the ways in which to test competence. One of the key issues which will determine the extent of effective market access relates to recognition and ensuring that, in addition to acceleration of the verification process, certification is recognised by target markets. These are measures which will assist in facilitating temporary movement in the context of low-skilled workers.

In the context of another possible revised Mode 4 request, LDCs may wish to consider further re-visiting the specific sectors and occupation categories in the context of their individual development strategies and undertaking further refinements. For the African LDCs, it may be possible to take a REC perspective where

appropriate and consider those occupations where regional movements may better address (more immediate) professional skill shortages and develop a common list of lower-skilled occupations where Mode 4 market access at the multilateral level could be appropriate. Therefore, it may be more prudent to prioritise a few sectors and occupations (within the expanded parameters suggested by LDCs in the previous request) which will yield the most benefits and relate them to the target markets.

Further consideration should be given to identifying and targeting specific countries for any revised request. As in the above case, this will also involve a degree of preparation, requiring information gathering and analysis on the skill needs of certain WTO countries which hold the best prospects in the sectors/occupations of interest. This task can be assisted through several means: there is considerable existing research on labour market/skill gaps in OECD countries, OECD itself has undertaken considerable work in this area, the WTO Secretariat could assist in research and WTO Member countries could be encouraged to be forthcoming with information under the transparency provisions of the GATS.

Least-developed countries also need to consider carefully the political implications for their strategy on whether to target developing countries with a revised request, as was previously done.

In order to ensure that GATS Mode 4 arrangements take into account the human development dimension of temporary labour mobility, existing work illustrates that it is feasible to include relevant issues within the GATS architecture in a way which is consistent with the existing GATS framework and addresses concerns with loss of flexibility, enforcement of temporary stay and tracking in the host country. This can be done by emphasising specificity, clarity and transparency particularly in areas such as employment conditions and terms and administration of ENTs.

Much of the approach is dependent on the possible expansion of the existing nomenclature in the GATS Mode 4 context relating to CSS to

become “CSS-2”, to incorporate low-skilled requirements, recognition of non-formal/job workers through reducing minimum eligibility based qualifications and institutional affiliation.

Table 9: Elements of CSS-2 to incorporate low-skilled workers

| |
|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A service supplier under the CSS-2 would: • perform a service pursuant to a contract between the deploying government/authorised agency/occupational guild and a client located in the host country; • be without affiliate presence in the host country; • be screened and deployed by agencies/government or guilds from the sending country; and • fulfil qualification and competence test requirements based on local forms of aptitude testing, apprenticeships, etc. |
|---|

Source: Chanda 2008.

Areas for possible inclusion in the GATS context and unilateral temporary labour mobility schemes to ensure a more holistic approach, based on lessons learnt from existing bilateral, regional and unilateral temporary labour mobility schemes are shown in Table 10 below:

Table 10: Areas for possible inclusion in the GATS

| Issue | GATS framework |
|--|------------------------|
| Conditions relating to social security, benefits and taxes and administration of ENTs. Penalties and sanctions to ensure worker rights. | Horizontal commitments |
| Quota which can be adjusted to suit sectoral needs. Targeted and improved administration of ENTs. Conditions on wages, duration of stay. | Sectoral commitments |
| Ensure use in order to act as counterbalance to degree of flexibility in use of quotas. | Transparency |
| Commitments can be subject to obligation by source countries to have a role in managing and coordinating movement process. | Additional conditions |
| Define scope of domestic labour laws on Mode 4 and address in context of domestic regulation. | Article VI:4 |

Source: Chanda 2008.

Other Possible Strategies for using GATS to Enhance Skills Development

Least-developed countries may also wish to consider other possible avenues provided through GATS to facilitate temporary labour mobility as a part of their overall strategy on Mode 4. Paragraphs 4, 7 and 8 of the LDC Modalities enable LDCs to attach conditions to liberalisation commitments to achieve GATS Article IV objectives which are the main special and differential treatment provisions for developing countries and LDCs in the GATS.¹⁵ For example, if considering undertaking commitments in Mode 3, countries could pursue skills development by requiring

on-the-job training of local workers within the skills development context (Panizzon 2008). This could be accompanied by other conditions such as identifying specific skills (e.g. managerial and/or technical) in which training is required, requirement to engage a percentage of the local workforce, establishing capacity building programmes and requirements for training to be provided locally so that capacity is built amongst local trainers.

Furthermore, it can be noted that rapid technological developments are having serious implications for the nature of temporary labour mobility and multinational companies are having to adapt and find different ways of working to suit such changes. The outsourcing phenomenon which also includes lower-skilled services such as back office support (including data entry, processing and customer call centres) means that communications are more regular between company headquarters and other subsidiaries and often requiring more frequent work trips both

ways. For African LDCs, such as Rwanda which perceive themselves as a future outsourcing hub, it is worth noting this as an additional window of opportunity for facilitating temporary labour mobility. Alternatively it is feasible to consider setting a requirement of physical presence for a particular duration in order for adequate skill transfer or local worker training to take place.

Countries could also reap the benefits of Mode 4 through Mode 2 whereby the skills which are acquired through Mode 4 could then be applied in the context of the tourism sector. For example, policies could be designed to encourage tourists to use the services of carers, domestic workers and recreational workers (who may have worked abroad in the Mode 4 context in such occupations and would be familiar with the particular market from which tourists may originate). Investment into and capacity building of the TVT sector could also eventually lead to it being considered as a destination for regional and international vocational students through Mode 2.

7. RECOMMENDATIONS

National Level

Recognising that the process for developing a holistic temporary labour mobility (Mode 4) strategy must begin with African LDC, the following can be used as a starting point:

Skills development

- Develop a core vision for skills development within the context of the country's development objectives.
- Identify and implement appropriate tools for assessing skills development and undertake labour market analyses with a view to identifying priorities and strategies in relation to the national vision, including identifying capacity issues (outward and inward migration - including temporary - as well as inter-migration issues - rural to urban - will also need to be incorporated in the analysis).
- Ensure skills strategy is linked into regional policies and frameworks.
- Use a broad definition of basic education to incorporate elements of vocational training.
- Strategies for promoting equity in skills development through targeting of groups such as women and youth.

Technical, vocational education and training

- Where appropriate, establish a sector-wide approach which is linked to national skills development priorities and areas identified for temporary labour mobility and adapt curricula accordingly.
- Increase and sustain funding and investment in skills development and consider supplementary alternative sources.
- Provide a strong regulatory framework to ensure quality and coherence, for example in curricula and qualifications standards.
- Given the widespread nature of informal training in African LDCs, trade testing schemes should be considered which will provide a pathway for recognition in the formal training system through certification.

- African LDCs should consider developing national qualifications frameworks and establishing national qualifications authorities where they do not exist. This could also be considered in RECs where labour mobility is featured.
- African LDCs should evaluate impact of existing TVT-related policies to enhance effectiveness.
- Based on the identification of specific occupations of interest, an inventory should be made of relevant post-school training institutions and their capacity, together with their potential for upgrading and expansion in training, with a view to enhancement in order to ensure that training is provided to a standard which satisfies the target market's regulations and requirements.
- Specific strategies to address the quality of trainers which could be considered in the context of RECs.

Temporary labour mobility

- The merits of a temporary labour mobility strategy and its application should be assessed within the context of national development plans and the agenda for skills development prioritised accordingly. It should demonstrate how it meets specific development objectives, and ensure that adequate levels of skills are maintained in critical sectors. This includes identifying key sectors with potential for economic growth and employment generation where temporary labour mobility can play a useful role in enhancing skills development, which can then be absorbed and utilised in the economy upon return.
- Skill shortage forecasts in both target market and national context should be used as the basis for pursuing Mode 4 market access demands. For example, if there is a shortage of nurses, specialist nurses should be excluded or only small numbers should be considered until nursing training capacities are expanded and instead nurse aides and

caregivers could be the target groups. Other programmes should be considered such as a national programme on language.

- Focus should be in areas where upskilling and/or the acquisition of new skills can take place, and also in areas where technologies are relevant to the context of the home country.
- Address relevant policy and institutional gaps in facilitating temporary labour movement which will maximise the development benefits and minimise possible costs:
 - institutional capacity for identifying and monitoring skill shortages in overseas markets, promoting interest and recruiting people, pre-movement screening and selection of appropriate candidates based on a transparent criteria guided by policy, regular tracking and monitoring mechanisms, developing a legal framework on migration (temporary and permanent), accepting and facilitating return and efforts to address illegal migration. This will include the establishment of a mixture of appropriate incentives and penalties;
 - on the welfare aspects, pre-departure briefings/workshops, sending groups of persons, establishment of duration, together with effective ongoing monitoring of welfare in the host country, available support measures and mechanisms to enforce rights and decent working conditions;
 - in countries where social, unemployment insurance and super-annuation is applicable, mechanisms for reimbursement to service providers on their return;
 - ability to promote the use of remittances for productive use through capacity building and addressing transaction costs;
 - effective reintegration policies based on entrepreneurial training and support, skills development; and
 - giving attention to the potential of the diaspora (where applicable) in

contributing to national development and policies for encouraging return migration in the context of skills development.

- In the context of bilateral arrangements/EPAs, seeking Mode 4 market access should be done in the context of development co-operation which could assist in providing support for addressing related policy and institutional gaps, particularly in areas such as screening and selection, pre-departure preparation including language and cultural awareness and enforcing return. Also, target markets should provide funding for specific training institutions/centres which are providing training in specific areas of interest and have input into the design of curricula with relevant training providers so that specific requirements are met.

Capacity building, policy coordination, coherence and management:

- Considerable resources need to be directed at building capacity of various relevant line ministries, such as labour, national planning, gender and youth affairs, migration and education, and national statistics offices to collect, analyse and maintain data on a regular basis, together with applying standardised methodologies for data collection.
- Create a supportive and coherent policy environment with other policy areas such as women, youth, science and technology.
- Institutionalise communication and coordination and establish clear roles and responsibilities with one inter-governmental agency responsible for oversight of skills development across sectors and in the context of temporary labour mobility.
- Develop supportive legislation.
- Ensure stakeholder participation.

Regional Level

The RECs provide an important platform through which to develop human resources, skills development and coordinate training and temporary labour mobility policies. Prioritisation should be given to:

- Creating databases and information systems;
 - Establishing training centres for training trainers;
 - Developing curricula based on needs;
 - Creating a regional national qualifications authority and framework;
 - Harmonisation of education policies to facilitate movement of skilled workers which would also assist in addressing immediate shortages in critical areas; and
 - Design, production and distribution of teaching materials.
- use of sectoral commitments to set quotas with flexibility based on effectively administered ENTs and to address wage conditions and duration;
 - use of transparency provisions to ensure transparency and objectiveness in the administration and setting of quotas and ENTs; and
 - use of horizontal commitments to address general issues such as access to benefits and social security.

GATS Level

As discussed in the previous section, in further developing their strategy for Mode 4 market access in the context of the GATS at the WTO, African LDCs should seek to:

- Formulate a revised request which is further refined and targeted at a few specific occupations of priority interest, particularly in the low-skilled category;
- Target specific WTO Member countries whose skill needs are in line with those of common interest to LDCs in the context of the national development objectives/skills development strategies;
- Extend the definition of CSS to “CSS-2” to cover low-skilled workers by introducing institutional affiliation and taking into account competence-based qualifications;
- Submit a model framework along with the revised request which could set out how the development dimension of Mode 4 could be addressed in the GATS context, for example:
 - use of horizontal commitments to address rights of workers through use of penalties and address applicability of national labour laws relating to Mode 4, including in context of GATS Article VI;
 - use of additional commitments to set obligations on the part of requesting countries to have the necessary institutional capacity to manage worker flows (i.e. undertake screening and monitoring of workers);
- Consider using other GATS modes through which skills development can also be enhanced.

Role of International Community and Donors

Much of the above will require assistance at all levels including regional, international organisations and donors, especially in the areas of developing adequate information systems, funding identified priorities, capacity building and development co-operation for implementation, monitoring and enforcement.

- Funding for enhancing training provision and institutions, trade testing schemes through various mechanisms including ODA, Enhanced Integrated Framework and in the context of bilateral agreements and Economic Partnership Agreements (EPAs).
- Assistance of international organisations and programmes such as the Enhanced Integrated Framework should be utilised especially in the context of diagnostics and skills development, temporary labour mobility frameworks and labour market analysis.
- Actively co-operate with LDCs to prioritise and put in place a skills development strategy which includes providing effective market access for temporary low-skilled workers, particularly in the context of the WTO Doha Development Agenda.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adebusoye, P. (2006). *Geographic Labour Mobility in Sub-Saharan Africa*, IDRC, Working Paper 1, March 2006. XX: IDRC.
- African Development Bank. (2008). *African Economic Outlook*. Tunis: AFDB.
- African Union. (2006). *Migration Policy Framework for Africa, 25-29 June 2006*. Addis Ababa: African Union.
- African Union. (2007a). *Framework for Post-Conflict Reconstruction and Technical and Vocational Education and Training*, January 2007. Addis Ababa: African Union.
- African Union. (2007b). *Strategy to Revitalise Technical and Vocational Training in Africa*, May 2007. Addis Ababa: African Union.
- Azam, R.H. 2005. Those in Kayes: The Impact of Remittances on their Recipients in Africa. *Revue Economique* 56:1331-1358.
- Barrett, C.B., Carter, M.R. and P.D. Little. (2006). Understanding and Reducing Persistent Poverty in Africa. *Journal of Development Studies* XX.
- Black, R. (2004). *Migration and Pro-Poor Policy in Africa*. Working Paper C8. Sussex: Sussex Centre for Migration Research.
- Brown, P., Green, A. and H. Lauder. (2001). *High Skills: Globalisation, Competitiveness and Skills Formation*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Chand, S. (2004). *Labour Mobility for Sustainable Livelihoods in Pacific Island States*. Canberra: The Australian National University.
- Chanda, R. (2008). *Low Skilled Workers, Bilateral, Regional and Unilateral Initiatives*. New York: UNDP.
- Democratic Republic of the Congo, Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, 2006
- Denu, B., Tekeste, A. and H. van der Deijl. (2005). Characteristics and Determinants of Youth Unemployment, Underemployment and Inadequate Employment in Ethiopia. Geneva: ILO, Employment Policies Unit, Employment Strategy Department.
- DFID. (2000). *Skills for Development*. London: DFID.
- DFID. (2007). *Technical and Vocational Skills for Development*. London: DFID.
- Docquier, F. and A. Marfouk. (2006). International Migration by Education Attainment 1990-2000. In *International Migration, Remittances and the Brain Drain*, edited by C. Ozden and M. Schiff. Washington, DC: World Bank
- Enhanced Integrated Framework (2008). Cape Verde, Draft 1, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Government of Malawi. (2006). *Growth and Development Strategy 2006-2011*.

- Government of Mali. (2006). Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper-2 2007-2011.
- Government of Rwanda, Strategy for National Development for the Year 2020, 2000
- Government of Rwanda, Towards a Human Resources Development Framework for Rwanda, Discussion Paper, 1999
- Government of Rwanda (2006). Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper.
- ILO. (2002). *Women and Men in the Informal Economy*. Geneva: ILO.
- ILO. (2004). World Employment Report 2004-2005, Employment, Productivity and Poverty Reduction. Geneva: ILO.
- ILO-EU/EAC Labour Migration Project, Summary, Conclusions, Recommendations and the Way Forward. East Africa Launch and Stakeholders' Meeting, Arusha, 13-16 December 2004.
- Integrated Framework. (2005). Benin, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Integrated Framework. (2007). Burkina Faso, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Integrated Framework. (2004). Ethiopia, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Integrated Framework. (2007). Gambia, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study
- Integrated Framework (2003). Guinea, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Integrated Framework. (2002). Malawi, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Integrated Framework. (2004). Mali, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Integrated Framework. (2004). Mozambique, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Integrated Framework. (2005). Rwanda, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Integrated Framework (2005). Senegal, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Integrated Framework. (2006). Sierra Leone, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Integrated Framework. (2005). Tanzania, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Integrated Framework. (2005). Uganda, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Integrated Framework. (2005). Zambia, Diagnostic Trade Integration Study.
- Islamic Republic of Mauritania. (2006). Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper 2006-2010.
- Johanson, R. and A. Adams (2004). *Skills Development in Sub-Saharan Africa*. Washington DC: World Bank.

- Kingdon, G., Sandefur, J. and F. Teal. (2005). *Patterns of Labour Demand in Sub-Saharan Africa. Centre for African Economies, Department of Economics*. Oxford: University of Oxford.
- Kingombe, C. (2008). *Evaluating the Effects of Vocational Training in Africa*. OECD Development Centre, Policy Insight No. 61. Paris: OECD.
- Lucas, R.E.B. (2008). *International Labour Migration in a Globalising Economy*. XX: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace.
- Miyan, M.A. (2003). *Dynamics of Labour Migration in the Bangladesh Context*. Dhaka: International University Of Business Agriculture And Technology.
- Muganda, C. (2001). *Globalisation, the State and Contemporary Education Policy: Tanzania's Experience*. Dar es Salaam: Open University of Dar es Salaam.
- Panizzon, M. (2008). *Labour Mobility as a Win-Win Model for Trade and Development in the Case of Senegal*. Working Paper. Bern: Swiss National Centre of Competence in Research.
- Pigato, M. (2001). *Information and Communication Technology, Poverty and Development in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia*. Washington DC: World Bank.
- Republic of Benin. (2007). *Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper*.
- Republic of The Gambia. (2006). *Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper 2007-2011*.
- Republic of Guinea. (2007). *Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper-2 2007-2010*.
- Republic of Mozambique. (2006). *Action Plan for the Reduction of Absolute Poverty II 2006-2009*.
- Republic of Senegal. (2006). *Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper-2*.
- Republic of Zambia. (2006). *Fifth National Development Plan 2006-2010*.
- Republic of Uganda. (2004). *PEAP 2004/05-2007/08*.
- Rodrik, D. (2002). *Feasible Globalisations*. NBER Working Paper 9129. New York: National Bureau of Economic Research.
- Shaw, W. (2007). *Migration in Africa*. Washington DC: World Bank.
- Siddiqui, T. (2004). *Mobility Patterns and HIV Vulnerability*. Canberra: Asia Pacific Migration Research Network.
- Singh, A. (1994). *Global Economic Changes, Skills and International Competitiveness*, *International Labour Review* 133 (2):167-183.
- South Centre. (2005). *GATS Conditions to Achieve Developing Country Policy Objectives*. Occasional Paper 13. Geneva: South Centre.

- UNCTAD. (2006). *The Least Developed Countries Report*. Geneva: UNCTAD.
- UNCTAD. (2008). *Assuring Development Gains and Poverty Reduction from Trade: The Labour Mobility and Skills Trade Dimension*. Geneva: UNCTAD.
- UNECA. (2004). *Assessing Regional Integration in Africa*. Addis Ababa: UNECA.
- United Republic of Tanzania. (1999). *The Tanzania Development Vision 2025*.
- United Republic of Tanzania. (2005). *National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty*.
- Walmsley, T.L. and A.L. Winters. (2003). *Relaxing the Restriction on the Temporary Movements of Natural Persons: A Simulation Analysis*. Discussion Paper 3719. London: Centre for Policy Research.
- World Bank. (1993). *From Manpower Planning to Labour Market Analysis*. Washington DC: World Bank.
- World Bank. (2008). *Migration and Remittances, Fact Book*. Washington DC: World Bank.
- WTO. (2006). LDC Group Request on Mode 4. JOB (06)/155, 6 May 2006. Geneva: WTO.
- Xaba, J., Horn., P. and S. Motala. (2002). *Informal Sector in sub-Saharan Africa*. Geneva: ILO.

ANNEX 1: DIFFERENCES IN EMPHASIS BETWEEN MANPOWER PLANNING AND LABOUR MARKET ANALYSIS

| Manpower planning | Labour market analysis |
|-------------------------------|--|
| Manpower | Analysis/policy making |
| Planning | Labour force |
| Firm labour surveys | Household surveys |
| Counting heads | Measuring wages |
| Opinion Surveys | Tracer studies |
| Occupational profile | Educational profile |
| Public sector | Private and informal sector |
| Production efficiency | Equity/poverty |
| Technical efficiency | Economic efficiency |
| Output-labour relationships | Cost-benefit analysis |
| Fixed wages | Flexible wages |
| Manpower needs | Labour supply and demand |
| Skill specific training | General training |
| School based training | Firm based training |
| Public education/training | Private education/training |
| Filling long term skills gaps | Correcting present labour market distortions |

Source: World Bank 1993.

ENDNOTES

- 1 Being one of the four modes of supply of services identified in the context of the GATS: Mode 1 refers to cross border supply, Mode 2 refers to consumption abroad and Mode 3 refers to commercial presence. Although “temporary labour mobility” is a broader concept, it is used interchangeably with Mode 4 for the purpose of this paper.
- 2 This is set out in the Modalities for the Special Treatment of LDCs in the Trade in Services Negotiations, paragraphs 27 and 47 of the WTO Hong Kong Ministerial Declaration, paragraphs 15 and 42 of the Doha Ministerial Declaration and paragraphs c and d in Annex C of the July Package. Moreover the interest by LDCs in Mode 4 has been articulated in all LDC Trade Ministers’ Declarations to date (i.e. Zanzibar, Dhaka, Dakar, Livingstone and Maseru) and in the submission of two formal joint requests to other WTO Members in the GATS negotiations, specifically in Mode 4.
- 3 UNCTAD 2006 makes a distinction between converging, weak growth and regressing LDCs based on sustained real GDP per capita growth rates whereby 16 African LDCs are in the last category, 11 are in the middle category and five are in the first category.
- 4 The definition of informal sector is subject to different views and as a result data may not always be comparable.
- 5 Based on select country Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) and Diagnostic Trade Integration Studies (DTISs) available at www.integratedframework.org, accessed on March 2009.
- 6 See Annex 1.
- 7 The selection of countries is random and based on available information.
- 8 This paper has used national development plans / PRSPs as they tend to be readily accessible however this does not mean specific objectives are not articulated in other relevant or related policy documents. The point being made is that specific objectives must be articulated in the context of the overall development objectives and mainstreamed accordingly.
- 9 The Rwanda DTIS (2005) also identified Mode 4, particularly in the low-skilled occupations as an area of priority interest.
- 10 This overview is based on current PRSPs and selection of countries is random but should reflect the differences in how skills development is addressed in PRSPs and also illustrate the point that temporary labour mobility is not identified as an area of interest.
- 11 This is based on Chanda 2008, which examines the following schemes: Spain-Ecuador, Canadian Seasonal Agricultural Workers Program, USA H2A Agricultural Worker’s Programme, USA H2B Non-agricultural Workers Programme, UK Seasonal Agricultural Workers Programme, Korea Employment Permit System for Foreign Workers and Japan-Philippines Economic Partnership Agreement.
- 12 http://www.hrexport-baira.org/bureau_of_manpower_employment_training.htm
- 13 <http://in.reuters.com/article/domesticNews/idINDHA37122520081012>

- 14 COMESA, EAC, ECCAS, ECOWAS, SADC and UEMOA.
- 15 Article XIX:2 of the GATS provides this for developing countries and is the basis for the similar provision in the LDC Modalities. For full discussion on use of such conditions refer to South Centre 2005.

SELECTED ICTSD ISSUE PAPERS

Agricultural Trade and Sustainable Development

Value Chains and Tropical Products in a Changing Global Trade Regime by Charles Mather.
Issue Paper No. 13. May 2008.

Trade Effects of SPS and TBT Measures on Tropical and Diversification Products by Anne-Celia Disdier, Belay Fekadu, Carlos Murillo, Sara A. Wong.
Issue Paper No. 12. May 2008.

Tropical and Diversification Products Strategic Options for Developing Countries by Santiago Perry.
Issue Paper No. 11. March 2008.

Implications of proposed modalities for the Special Safeguard Mechanism: a simulation exercise.
Issue Paper No. 10 Raul Montemayor, November 2007.

Trade and Sustainable Land Management in Drylands.
Selected Issue Briefs, 2007.

A Comparison of the Barriers Faced by Latin American and ACP Countries' Exports of Tropical Products.
Issue Paper No. 9 by Jean-Christophe Bureau, Anne-Celia Disdier and Priscila Ramos, 2007.

South-South Trade in Special Products.
Issue Paper No. 8 by Christopher Stevens, Jane Kennan and Mareike Meyn, 2007.

Competitiveness and Sustainable Development

Looking for a Meaningful Duty Free Quota Free Market Access Initiative in the Doha Development Agenda.
Issue Paper No. 4 by David Laborde, 2008.

Impact of Origin Rules for Textiles and Clothing on Developing Countries by Munir Ahmad.
Issue Paper No. 3, 2007.

Special and Differential Treatment for Small and Vulnerable Countries Based on the Situational Approach.
Issue Paper No. 2 by Werner Corrales-Leal, Felipe Baritto, and Sarah A. Mohan, 2007.

Basic Concepts and Proposals on the use of Policy Spaces in Trade-supported Strategies for Sustainable Development.
Issue Paper No. 1 by Werner Corrales-Leal, 2007.

Dispute Settlement and Legal Aspects of International Trade

Compliance and Remedies against Non-Compliance under the WTO System: Towards A More Balanced Regime for All Members.
Issue Paper No. 3 by Virachai Plasai, 2007.

Access to Justice in the WTO: The Case for a Small Claims Procedure, A Preliminary Analysis.
Issue Paper No. 2 by Håkan Nordström and Gregory Shaffer, 2007.

Appeal Without Remand: A Design Flaw in the WTO Dispute Settlement System.
Issue Paper No. 1 by Joost Pauwelyn, 2007.

Fisheries, International Trade and Sustainable Development

Fisheries, International Trade and Sustainable Development.
Policy Discussion Paper by ICTSD, 2006.

Aquaculture: Issues and Opportunities for Sustainable Production and Trade.
Issue Paper No. 5 by Frank Asche and Fahmida Khatun, 2006.

Market Access and Trade Liberalisation in Fisheries.
Issue Paper No. 4 by Mahfuz Ahmed, 2006.

Trade and Marketplace Measures to Promote Sustainable Fishing Practices.
Issue Paper No. 3 by Cathy Roheim and Jon G. Sutinen, 2006.

Fisheries Access Agreements: Trade and Development Issues.
Issue Paper No. 2 by Stephen Mbithi Mwikya, 2006.

Intellectual Property Rights and Sustainable Development

Intellectual Property and Competition Law
Policy Discussion Paper by Carlos Correa, 2007.

Intellectual Property Provisions in European Union Trade Agreements: Implications for Developing Countries.
Issue Paper No. 20 by Maximiliano Santa Cruz S., 2007.

Maintaining Policy Space for Development: A Case Study on IP Technical Assistance in FTAs.
Issue Paper No. 19 by Pedro Roffe and David Vivas with Gina Vea, 2007.

New Trends in Technology Transfer: Implications for National and International Policy.
Issue Paper No. 18 by John H. Barton, 2007.

Trade in Services and Sustainable Development

Maritime Transport and Related Logistics Services in Egypt by Ahmed F. Ghoneim, and Omneia A. Helmy,
Issue Paper No. 8, December 2007.

Opportunities and Risks of Liberalising Trade in Services in Pakistan by Abid A. Burki,
Issue Paper No. 7, December 2007.

Regulatory Principles for Environmental Services and the General Agreement on Trade in Services by Massimo Geloso Grosso,
Issue Paper No. 6, December 2007.

Opportunities and Risks of Liberalising Trade in Services in Mozambique by Alberto Teodoro Bila, Eduardo Mondlane, Hélder Chambal and Viriato Tamele,
Issue Paper No. 5, December 2007.

Opportunities and Risks of Liberalizing Trade in Services in Tanzania by Daima Associates Limited, National Consultant,
Issue Paper No. 4, December 2007.

Trade and Sustainable Energy

Intellectual Property and Access to Clean Energy Technologies in Developing Countries:
An Analysis of Solar Photovoltaic, Biofuel and Wind Technologies.
Issue Paper No. 2 by John H. Barton, 2007.

Climate, Equity, and Global Trade.
Selected Issue Briefs No. 2, 2007.

The WTO and Energy: WTO Rules and Agreements of Relevance to the Energy Sector.
Issue Paper No. 1 by Julia Selivanova, 2007.

Linking Trade, Climate and Sustainable Energy.
Selected Issue Briefs, 2006.

These and other ICTSD resources are available at <http://www.ictsd.org>

ICTSD's Programme on Trade in Services and Sustainable Development aims at empowering developing country policy makers and influencers at bilateral, regional and multilateral levels through information, dialogue, capacity-building, and well-targeted research, to influence the international services trading system such that it advances the goal of sustainable development. Specifically, it seeks, among others, to:

- Identify and clarify key sustainable development issues and prospects in relation to the agenda on trade in services;
- Assess systematic issues for developing country policy makers and influencers in the GATS legal architecture;
- Facilitate interaction among negotiators, policy makers, policy influencers, civil society and business communities on GATS discussions and negotiations.

For further information, visit www.ictsd.org

ABOUT ICTSD

Founded in 1996, the International Centre for Trade and Sustainable Development (ICTSD) is an independent non-profit and non-governmental organisation based in Geneva. By empowering stakeholders in trade policy through information, networking, dialogue, well-targeted research and capacity building, the Centre aims to influence the international trade system so that it advances the goal of sustainable development.