# Peace and Security Council Report

Issue 52, November 2013



Current members of the Peace and Security Council: Algeria, Angola, Cameroon, Congo, Côte d'Ivoire, Djibouti, Equatorial Guinea, the Gambia, Guinea, Lesotho, Mozambique, Nigeria, Tanzania and Uganda

# **Peace and Security Council Protocol**

'The PSC shall encourage non-governmental organizations to participate actively in the efforts aimed at promoting peace, security and stability in Africa. When required such organizations may be invited to address the Peace and Security Council' – Article 20 of the Protocol Relating to the Establishment of the PSC of the African Union

# Early warning issues for November 2013

During November, a number of potential peace and human security threats bear watching. Despite positive signs that acts of piracy in the Indian Ocean have declined, they have not been eliminated entirely. In the Gulf of Guinea, on Africa's west coast, piracy also presents a real danger to merchant vessels and their crews.

In Somalia, al-Shabaab terrorists continue to threaten the government and citizens of that country, AMISOM troops and UN personnel, as well as the people of neighbouring countries, especially those contributing troops to AMISOM.

In North Africa, particularly Libya, Egypt and Tunisia, much needs to be done to achieve stability. In Libya tensions among the fragile central government, tribal leaders and eastern militias are ongoing. The formation in the eastern part of Libya of the Barqa shadow government could bring further instability and violence. Continuing anger in the form of street protests in Egypt, coupled with what members of civil society in that country describe as draconian curbs on human rights, risk the inevitability of further violence. In Tunisia, a constitutional impasse

and violence between supporters of the ruling Islamists and their opponents also herald an uncertain path to stability.

In the eastern Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), the ongoing rebellion by the M23 continues to destabilise North Kivu in particular. In recent weeks fighting between the M23 and the Congolese army has again erupted, with the FARDC scoring important military victories against the M23. Peace talks in Kampala had earlier reached a stalemate, but key international actors insist upon a return to the negotiating table. Armed activities by other domestic and international armed groups continue to destabilise the wider eastern DRC, with a spike in fighting in the Ituri district of Orientale Province recently displacing 100 000 people.

Finally, the aftermath of Madagascar's long-awaited presidential elections as well as preparations for local elections in Mozambique under the shadow of Renamo's withdrawal from the 1992 accord with Frelimo also promise a period of increased tension in both these countries.

# IN THIS ISSUE

Early warning issues for November 2013

1

Country analysis:

Mozambique

2

Country analysis: Kenya

Important dates to diarise 16

# **Current PSC Chair**

**Bio data:** H.E. Simeon Oyono Esono

**Current posts:** Equatorial Guinea's Ambassador to Ethiopia Permanent

Representative to the AU and UNECA and Chair of the

PSC

# Livingstone formula

'Civil Society Organizations may provide technical support to the African Union by undertaking early warning reporting, and situation analysis which feeds information into the decision-making process of the PSC' – PSC/PR/(CLX), 5 December 2008, Conclusions of a Retreat of the PSC on a mechanism of interaction between the Council and CSOs.



# Country analysis

# **MOZAMBIQUE**

#### Introduction

The last country analysis on Mozambique was published in the August 2013 edition of the PSC Report, no. 49.

# Previous SADC and AU communiqués and statements

The Southern African Development Community (SADC) is yet to make a pronouncement on the political situation in Mozambique following tit for tat violence between Mozambique's ruling Front for the Liberation of Mozambique (Frente de Libertação de Moçambique, or Frelimo) and the rebel-group-turnedmain-opposition-party Mozambican National Resistance (Resistência Nacional Mocambicana, or Renamo). During the week of 21 October 2013, Mozambican government forces overran the base of Renamo leader Afonso Dhlakama at Satangura near Gorongosa National Park. The Gorongosa forest base was Renamo's guerrilla wartime stronghold in central Sofala province. Although Dhlakama managed to escape unscathed to an undisclosed location, Renamo subsequently declared that it had ended the peace deal with the country's government, saying in a statement that the military attack by government forces signalled the annulment of the 21-year peace deal it had signed with the Mozambican government in Rome (the Rome General Peace Accords) supervised by the United Nations (UN) to end the 16-year civil war that took the lives of an estimated 1 million Mozambicans. Subsequent reports indicated an upsurge in Renamo banditry with reports that its querrillas recently ambushed a passenger minibus in central Mozambique, with several casualties. Fears that Mozambique is on the brink of a return to civil war have intensified.

These developments are hardly surprising. Political tensions have risen significantly in Mozambique since October 2012, when Dhlakama and about 800 Renamo ex-guerrilla fighters decamped to their former civil war base at Satangura, threatening to reignite war with Frelimo. Zimbabwe, the country's neighbour, is reported to have responded through its Defence Minister, Emmerson Mnangagwa, that the situation should be tabled for SADC consideration. In a Herald newspaper article dated 22 June 2013, Mnangagwa was quoted as urging SADC action against Renamo, warning that the

former rebel group could destabilise the region. At the time, Mozambique was part of the SADC Summit Troika alongside Angola and Malawi, the immediate past and next SADC chairs. SADC's former executive secretary, Tomaz Salomão, a former minister in the ruling Frelimo government, had an opportunity at the time to recommend that Mozambique be placed on the SADC agenda, although it would have been unlikely for a chair to place itself on the SADC security agenda. There must be an acknowledgement, however, that other offices in SADC, such as the executive secretary, have limited leeway to engage in independent diplomatic action primarily because of SADC's decision-making and agenda-setting protocols and the SADC doctrine of 'non-interference', which protects national sovereignty from early warning and early action. However, the security situation in Mozambique and possible regional contagion effects are early warning issues that require close monitoring. A meeting to discuss the bloody inter-party hostility between Renamo and Frelimo and likely regional spillover effects is overdue.

The African Union (AU) also released a statement on 23 October 2013 condemning 'any attempt to undermine peace, stability and development in Mozambique' and 'any attempt to undermine stability in Mozambique and the remarkable economic gains made to date'. The chairperson of the AU Commission, Dr Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma, also stated that she was following the recent developments in Mozambique, stressing 'the need for all concerned stakeholders to act in a spirit of restraint and dialogue, to allow Mozambique to continue on its remarkable path of development and growth, and to continue to consolidate its democratic institutions, including the successful and peaceful holding of the local elections planned for November 2013'. She further stated that she welcomed 'the commitment of the Mozambican Government to talks in order to address the current challenges, and [called] on the Renamo leadership to respond positively and unconditionally to this offer'.

# **Crisis escalation potential**

Mozambique's defence forces confirmed late on 21 October 2013 that the army had stormed Renamo's Satangura base camp after surrounding it for about two days before the attack. The attack forced Dhlakama, guarded by an estimated 300 armed militants, to abandon the bush camp where he had lived for over a year. The action came against the backdrop

of the volatile political situation in Mozambique, which escalated from tensions in October 2012 to outright violence in April 2013, during which Renamo attacked a police station and civilian vehicles, killing several people. Renamo subsequently declared that it was terminating the 1992 peace accord that had ended the 1975-1992 civil war in the country, lamenting that government forces had overrun its base. Renamo also claims that Frelimo is failing to create an atmosphere conducive to holding free and fair local government elections scheduled for 20 November 2013. In retaliation, Renamo militants attacked a police station in Maringue, forcing the officers to flee. No casualties were reported. Schools were closed in the area around Renamo's military base in the mountains of central Mozambique. Subsequent attacks cannot be ruled out, following Renamo's ambushing of the passenger minibus in central Mozambique on 27 October 2013.

Renamo's threats should not be dismissed as mere warmongering, as they raise serious concerns about the stability of Mozambique, a country considered to be one of the fastestgrowing African economies since the discovery of massive offshore natural gas and coal reserves. There are two dominant views on whether Renamo's threats to revert to war are probable. The first view holds that Renamo's capacity to wage a full-scale war may have diminished greatly, because the factors that essentially gave impetus to its ability to wage 16 years of civil war no longer exist or are not significantly relevant in 2013. For instance, Renamo was supported extensively by the former white-minority regime in Rhodesia, now Zimbabwe, and apartheid South Africa, and informally by the United States (US). It had substantial military capacity as a result. At the moment, Renamo's military and financial capability to sustain a war effort is in doubt, a situation exacerbated by its composition of mostly aging ex-guerrillas who are now in their 50s and 60s. Renamo's recruiting patterns in the last decade have also been ineffective, leading to low numbers of new querrillas. This can be explained by Renamo's long-standing reputation as an organisation of people recruited against their will. Consequently, the view is that, at worst, Renamo can temporarily render the country ungovernable through banditry and sporadic warfare, but will not be able to promote a full-scale civil war. However, the recent violent incidents demonstrate that Renamo is still capable of acting upon its threats to sabotage



key infrastructure, particularly in the Manica and Sofala provinces. There remain concerns that military clashes and instability may disrupt coal shipments and public transportation.

The second view holds that Renamo's actions are not widely accepted within its leadership structures, given that the party also has 51 representatives in Mozambique's parliament. As such, the warring guerrillas may represent a faction in Renamo that remains 'stuck' in a mindset that is inseparable from guerrilla movement warfare and thus not representative of those parliamentarians who seek to organise and transform Renamo into a viable political party with a political vision sustained by popular support.

It is not immediately clear what Renamo's next move will be. However, the tensions and their escalation potential are not only of concern to investors, the international community and the local population, but also cast a shadow on the November 2013 local government elections and the 2014 presidential and parliamentary elections.

## Key issues and internal dynamics

Renamo's spokesperson, Fernando Mazanga, said in a statement that the military attack on Satangura signalled the annulment of the peace deal it had signed with the Mozambican government in Rome. According to him, the military intended to kill Dhlakama. Mozambique's defence force has confirmed that the army had attacked Renamo's base, arguing that they were provoked by Renamo guerrillas and had fought back to ensure order in the region. Since the beginning of the year, dialogue between the government and Renamo on these issues has failed to make any progress. Dhlakama has threatened to boycott the municipal elections unless the country's election laws and the composition of the national election commission (CNE) are changed to ensure fair and free participation by the opposition.

In addition to accusing Frelimo of an exclusive political governance strategy and the politicisation of state institutions such as the security forces and the CNE, Dhlakama has been pushing desperately to secure Renamo's stake in the country's natural resource wealth. This is taking place in a context where the short-term selfish interests of political actors have the potential to undermine long-term national interests, as natural resource extraction is associated with high levels of corruption, rent capture by well-connected elites and ineffective governance, all of which have

contributed to provoking the current volatile situation.

# **Geopolitical dynamics**

#### **Africa and RECs**

Mozambique has not officially asked for bilateral or regional assistance to address its growing insecurity, nor has the security situation been discussed at recent SADC meetings. The political situation is also yet to be tabled officially for discussion by SADC's security body, the Organ Troika. In addition, there has not been any official regional position regarding early warning or early mediation efforts relating to Mozambique. This is despite defined laws and processes in SADC's Organ on Politics, Defence and Security Cooperation (OPDC) Protocol and the Defence Pact, guiding the nature of issues over which the Organ and Summit may seek to prevent, resolve or manage conflicts. SADC encourages mediation and preventative diplomacy in situations that exhibit 'significant conflict' at inter- and intra-state levels. Intra-state conflicts, which describe the Mozambique situation, are defined in the OPDSC Protocol to include 'conflicts over which an act of aggression or other form of military force has occurred or been threatened'. Moreover, the Organ's subsidiary bodies, like the Inter-State Defence and Security Committee (ISDSC), can also be tasked with advising on early warning and security issues in Mozambique without Mozambique officially being tabled on the SADC agenda. In terms of the AU's role and response, the pan-African body, which has urged dialogue between the two political parties, is most likely to defer to SADC, as required by the subsidiarity principle. The situation also appears to be a 'low-level risk' despite the high potential for escalation. For now, the tensions between Frelimo and Renamo and the volatile security situation in Mozambique remain a domestic matter.

Some SADC countries that share borders with Mozambique have voiced their concerns. The transportation corridor running to Beira port in Mozambique is an economic lifeline for landlocked Malawi, Zambia and Zimbabwe. The Malawi government, which recently revised its power agreement with Mozambique in addition to signing three cooperation agreements in the areas of security and public order, migration, and science and innovation, said that it would keenly watch developments unfolding in Mozambique.

Dhlakama was on the run at the time of writing and some officials from Zimbabwe suggested that Renamo

should renegotiate the peace deal rather than threaten to wage war, or Zimbabwe would send troops to support the Mozambican government against Renamo, as it had in the 1980s. Earlier, in June 2013, Zimbabwe's Minister of Defence had expressed concern at the tensions between Mozambique's two main political parties and the violent incidents in the country. He had urged SADC to engage the Mozambican parties in order to prevent the conflict spilling over the border. In November 2012, Zimbabwe reportedly increased its military presence along its 1 231km border with Mozambique to monitor the threat of armed conflict. Zimbabwean officials feared that Dhlakama could be used by 'hostile forces' to destabilise Zimbabwe's Marange diamond belt and threaten the 287km-long Feruka pipeline from Beira in Mozambique to Zimbabwe's oil refinery just outside Mutare. Indeed, Mozambique's 16-year civil war had spilled over into Zimbabwe, with Renamo orchestrating heinous crimes against Zimbabwean citizens, particularly those in Manicaland Province.

South Africa's Presidency similarly expressed concern over the political and security developments in Mozambique and potential regional spillover. However, South Africa also held the view that the Mozambican government could deal with the matter without South Africa's involvement, particularly given the fact that such a request had not been made by the Mozambican government.

## International community

Individual responses from the international community have been strong for the most part, cautioning Renamo against a power struggle that would see Mozambique descend into chaos and instability. Notably, former colonial ruler Portugal and foreign donor governments such as the US have all called on Frelimo and Renamo to negotiate their differences and avoid a return to war. The US government advised that the Mozambican government and Renamo opposition should take 'visible and decisive steps' to de-escalate tensions. France issued a travel alert to its citizens and said it was working closely with other European Union (EU) member states and the US embassy to monitor political and security developments in Mozambique.

Nineteen international donors, working together as programme aid partners (PAPs), play an important role in Mozambique's politics. The grouping, known as the G-19, provides substantial direct support to the Mozambican state budget. At one time the PAPs funded



about 51 per cent of the country's national budget. Although the international donor community claims to follow a non-interventionist approach in its relations with the Mozambican government while respecting the principle of the country's sovereignty, the G-19's exertion of pressure on the Frelimo government on matters concerning the management of external aid, transparency in the public sector and inclusive growth is well documented. The G-19 reportedly shares concerns around Frelimo's centralisation and exploitation of power and its neo-patrimonial agenda.

# **United Nations**

Notwithstanding SADC silence, on 23 October 2013 the UN, through the Office of the Secretary General Ban Ki-moon, called on Mozambique's government and the Renamo rebels to cease violence and its escalation and 'fully engage in an inclusive dialogue to resolve differences within the established democratic order and to ensure that the country continues to achieve social inclusion and sustainable development for all'.

## Civil society

Civil society activists and the media have continued to call upon Frelimo and Renamo to engage in sincere dialogue in pursuit of a political resolution to the inter-party tensions. Prior to the recent capture of Renamo's base in the Gorongosa Mountains, such engagement had included meetings between Dhlakama and a delegation from the Electoral Observatory (Observatório Eleitoral), a coalition of religious and civil society groups that is by far the most representative body involved in observing Mozambican elections. The Observatory also scheduled meetings with President Armando Guebuza as part of efforts to influence the resolution of the country's political and security crises. However, the efforts of civil society and the media may be undermined by the fact that, at the time of writing, they had no access to Dhlakama, whose whereabouts were not officially known. Civil society actors and the media have, however, continued to urge Renamo parliamentarians to prioritise political dialogue with Frelimo over the 'bush' agenda of Renamo's warmongering.

Civil society plays an increasingly instrumental role in the country's electoral processes, one of the contentious issues between Frelimo and Renamo. A prominent figure in Mozambican civil society, Sheikh Abdul Carimo Nordine Sau, who is the deputy

chairman of the Islamic Council (the Conselho Islâmico de Moçambique) and executive director of the Electoral Observatory, heads the CNE.

Civil society, as with all Mozambique's political parties and the media, was heavily engaged in scrutinising and politicking over the country's new electoral register. The compilation of the register was completed in July 2013 to ensure its readiness for use in the local elections on 20 November. The electoral register will also be used in next year's general elections. Despite a problematic start to voter registration, including equipment and logistical failures, the process has improved owing to unprecedentedly strong monitoring by civil society. This civil society monitoring reportedly helped curb historically manipulative Frelimo habits. A civil society watchdog, the Centro de Integridade Pública, played an instrumental role in monitoring voter registration, including the publication of periodic reports. Civil society actors and the media have also been monitoring the ongoing voter education and political campaign processes.

#### Scenarios

There are real concerns about security and stability in the country. However, the potential for conflict will be based on the following scenarios:

## Scenario 1

Renamo's warmongering leads to another chapter of hostilities between Renamo and Frelimo in the build-up to the 2014 elections. Although Renamo's capacity to wage a full-scale war may have diminished due to its depleted ex-fighter base and lack of logistical capability, it could engage in sporadic banditry and the sabotage of key infrastructure. This activity could see the Frelimo government, having already destroyed Renamo's Gorongosa base camp, opting for a military resolution to the crisis. This strategy could become protracted and propel instability that would impede Mozambique's economic development.

# Scenario 2

The logjam in the inter-party negotiation process could persist, but without an outright violent confrontation similar to those that have occurred previously. In this scenario, some banditry by armed partisans of Renamo would occur and political tensions would be on the rise. However, government capacity would be able to quell insecurity and re-negotiate with Renamo moderates. The potential for crisis escalation could also be

diminished by the fact that both Frelimo and Renamo could act upon their expressed willingness to resume the hitherto abortive inter-party dialogue.

#### Scenario 3

Frelimo and Renamo put the national interest first, detoxify their relationship and reach a political solution to the crisis in order to place Mozambique firmly on the path to stability and economic prosperity. This scenario may also give rise to a clear split in Renamo and the emergence and clearer consolidation of a moderate faction.

# **Options**

The early response options that the Mozambican parties and SADC could consider include the following:

# **Option 1**

Negotiations between Frelimo and Renamo remain the best means for defusing tensions between the two parties. With active SADC support, Mozambican civil society and the media should continue to urge the leaders of the parties to engage in sincere peace dialogue.

## Option 2

With presidential and parliamentary elections scheduled for 2014, one of the issues causing friction between Renamo and Frelimo, which is electoral reform, could be addressed. In the unlikelihood of such a move, confidence-building measures are put in place by the government, including dealing with the attendant Renamo allegation of electoral fraud.

# **Option 3**

There is a need to focus on the nation-building project and prevent possible popular protests. The government of Mozambique would need to accelerate investment in climate reforms; improve provision of public services to facilitate inclusive growth (e.g. infrastructure, education, health); set up well-targeted safety nets for the most vulnerable; and promote greater public and citizen participation while building transparent and accountable systems, including those related to the country's extractive industries.

# Option 4

Malawi as the current chair of SADC, Zimbabwe as its deputy, and state parties that would directly and adversely be impacted by instability in Mozambique, should consider initiating SADC multilateral diplomacy for the country in the event of a continuing political impasse.



# **Country analysis**

# **KENYA**

#### Introduction

The previous country analysis on Kenya was published in the PSC Report of February 2013, no. 43. It focused on the potential security threats in the lead-up to Kenya's 4 March 2013 general elections. This analysis, however, examines the events and security threats surrounding the 21 September terrorist attack on the Westgate Mall in Nairobi.

# Previous PSC and AU communiqués and statements

On the same day as the 21 September terrorist attack on the Westgate Mall in Nairobi, the chairperson of the Commission of the African Union (AU), Dr Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma, released a press statement condemning the attack and terming it a dastardly act. Dlamini-Zuma affirmed the AU's solidarity with the government and people of Kenya and called for renewed efforts by AU member states and partners to deal with terrorism attacks on the continent as a whole and those emanating from the al-Shabaab militant group in particular. She also underscored the need to enhance inter-African counterterrorism cooperation and efforts to stabilise and promote peace and security in Somalia through the African Union Mission in Somalia (AMISOM). Dlamini-Zuma's statement was backed by the Regional Oversight Mechanism of the Peace, Security and Cooperation Framework a UN initiative that brings together the International Conference on the Great Lakes Region (ICGLR), the Southern African Development Community (SADC), the AU and the United Nations (UN) to work collaboratively for peace and stability in the Great Lakes region held on the margins of the 68th UN General Assembly on 23 September in New York. This meeting was meant to reflect on the situation in the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) and the region broadly, but strongly condemned what it called the 'deplorable act of terrorism' committed at the Westgate Mall and expressed its deepest condolences to the government and people of Kenya.

# **Crisis escalation potential**

Before its incursion into Somalia, Kenya had witnessed incidences of terror, but they were largely targeted at non-Kenyan nationals and/or their interests. Such terror attacks were far apart and isolated. However, with the incursion into Somalia by the Kenya Defence Forces (KDF) in October 2010, the situation changed. Kenya's intervention in Somalia was caused by abductions of aid workers from the Dadaab refugee camp in Kenya's North Eastern Province and attacks on several tourists along the country's coastline. Tourism is Kenya's second largest foreign exchange earner. The justification for Kenya's intervention was, therefore, seen in terms of efforts to protect the country's territorial borders and, in particular, its tourism industry. There are, however, those who believe that Kenya had planned much earlier to intervene in Somalia with the aim of creating a buffer zone for the purpose of inoculating itself from security threats emanating from Somalia, and that the abductions of aid workers and attacks on tourists only served as a trigger to hasten this intervention. All in all, the KDF's move into Somalia resulted in low-level attacks by individuals deemed to be al-Shabaab sympathisers (al-Shabaab never claimed responsibility for these attacks, until the attack on Westgate Mall). Notably, the frequency of these attacks also increased, especially in the North Eastern town of Garissa and in some suburbs of Nairobi. Al-Shabaab also threatened to 'flatten Nairobi's tall glass buildings' as long as the KDF continued its operations in Somalia. While Kenya knew that it was a likely periodic target for terrorist attacks and that it remained vulnerable, it seemed the necessary level of alertness was not maintained.

During the Westgate Mall attack, the al-Shabaab leadership, including the group's head, Moktar Ali Zubeyr (otherwise known as Ahmed Abdi Godane), resumed its threats of continued attacks, not only against Kenya but also against Western countries for their meddling in Somalia. In response, however, Kenya's President Uhuru Kenyatta reiterated Kenya's commitment to remain in Somalia for as long as necessary, saying: 'We went there to help them bring order in their own nation and we will remain there until they bring order in their nation.'

Overall, the period following Kenya's intervention in Somalia has had its fair share of controversy, with allegations that Kenya was attempting to establish 'a buffer state' (Jubaland) to take care of its security interests. Kenya variously denied a number of other allegations, including of taking sides in the stand-off over Jubaland, broadly, and Kismayo city, in particular, by supporting Sheikh Ahmed Madobe, the Ras Kamboni leader and KDF ally, for the presidency of Jubaland. Mogadishu went as far as calling for the replacement of the KDF

with a neutral force, accusing the KDF of violating its mandate. This was revealed in July 2012 in a letter from the Somali Minister of Foreign Affairs, Fawzia Yusuf Adam, who is also the Deputy Prime Minister. The letter was accidentally published although it was apparently intended exclusively for the AU. Mogadishu had also made other accusations against KDF forces, including allegations of attacking civilians and arresting a top government army commander.

In June 2013, a confidential report by the UN Monitoring Group on Somalia and Eritrea accused Kenyan soldiers in the AMISOM force of facilitating illegal charcoal exports from the port city of Kismayo. Kismayo has, for some time now, been seen as a strategic city, bringing with it generous revenues from charcoal exports, port taxes and illegal imports. The UN Security Council banned the export of charcoal from Somalia in February 2012 to cut off what was seen as a key source of income for al-Shabaab. The Kenyan military dismissed the UN Monitors' findings, terming it a 'poorly researched' report. The then Kenyan Defence Force's spokesperson, Bogita Ongeri, argued that the charcoal business was not within the KDF's jurisdiction and that issues concerning the charcoal trade were within the remit of local Somali politics.

Overall, since Kenya's incursion into Somalia there has been an intermittent string of low-level terror incidents, mostly involving hand grenades aimed indiscriminately at the public, although some of the attacks specifically targeted Christian churches. The upshot of these attacks has been increased security alerts and increased prejudice, especially in areas largely populated by Somalis, including Kenyan Somalis, and other ethnic Kenyans. The perception in these contexts is often that any Somali could be a potential terrorist.

Inside Somalia, al-Shabaab has capitalised on real and imagined grievances around the perceived meddling by the KDF in southern Somalia to wage a campaign against Somali nationalism. This campaign is often conflated with international jihadism by sections of the extremist militant group. Indeed, following the Westgate Mall attack, al-Shabaab declared that its actions were intended as retribution for Kenya's meddling in Somalia. Overall, the spreading of al-Shabaab's tentacles outside of Somalia is attributed to foreign radicals within the militant group. The evolving nature of al-Shabaab's attacks as



reflected in its change of tactics in deciding to strike a soft target such as the Westgate Mall is also instructive. This shows the group's ability to inflict harm despite its losing ground inside Somalia.

#### Key issues and internal dynamics

The Westgate Mall attack, which left more than 69 people dead, was followed by immediate threats of further attacks. These threats raised questions around Kenya's intelligence failings and the country's continued involvement in Somalia. In the aftermath of the attack, fingers pointed at Kenya's National Intelligence Service (NIS) for its failure to detect the terrorism plot, with reports suggesting that there was incriminating intelligence forewarning specifically of attacks against several soft targets, including the Westgate Mall and the Holy Family Basilica Church, but that these warnings were not acted upon. It is, however, important to take cognizance of the challenges in being constantly on high alert in anticipation of terrorist acts and also the fact that the advantage, in such circumstances, is usually with the attacker. He/she determines where and when to attack. Anneli Botha, a senior researcher at the Institute for Security Studies, puts it more succinctly: 'You have to be right all the time and the terrorist only has to be right once.' So while one can apportion blame to weaknesses in Kenya's intelligence gathering and early action, there is also a need to recognise that Kenya has made progress in preventing attacks and other security incidents.

In terms of operations against the attackers at Westgate Mall, there were questions around institutional rivalry within the Kenyan security agencies that some have linked to the amount of time it took to contain the attackers. The government has continued to defend the security apparatus for its handling of the situation despite allegations of poor coordination and incidents of pillaging. It is, nonetheless, important to consider that this was the first time that Kenya had to deal with an armed terrorist attack against a soft target such as a crowded shopping mall.

On the issue of Kenya's involvement in Somalia and the question of whether or not the country should withdraw its forces, President Kenyatta has indicated that Kenya will stay in Somalia as long as the latter remains in a state of chaos. This means that Kenya is still determined to pursue the domestic security and possibly economic interests that motivated its initial intervention. This implies that the country has to brace itself for similar threats in future, particularly given the porous border it

shares with Somalia. Kenya has also in the recent past been one of al-Shabaab's key sources of recruitment. Reports suggest that al-Shabaab has been attempting to build an even more multi-ethnic generation of fighters in the larger Eastern and Horn of Africa region, sometimes using local Kenyans to do its 'dirty work'. There are reports that al-Shabaab has also developed local roots in Kenya, with suggestions that it is affiliating with local movements such as the al-Hijra group, which operates in the Majengo slum in Nairobi. Poverty and unemployment in Somalia and the region seem to constitute a fertile environment for the recruitment of youths by al-Shabaab. In Somalia itself much of the country's population is politically disenfranchised and without economic opportunities.

In the short term, it looks as though Kenya will need to refine its counterterrorism strategies by reforming its security sector and building trust and cooperation with ordinary citizens, especially Somalis, if it is to have an advantage in pre-emptive measures. Long-term efforts obviously lie in addressing the structural causes of radicalism, such as poverty. There is a sense that responses have been heavy-handed, including against Somalis and sections of the Muslim religious leadership in Kenya's Coast Province that, even if well-founded, might be counter productive. The country also needs to revisit allegations made against the KDF in Somalia and address them in case they turn out to be true.

The Westgate Mall attack and related threats from al-Shabaab have also found their way to the UN Security Council, where they constitute part of the mitigating factors in the appeal by African countries to have the trials of President Kenyatta and his deputy William Ruto in The Hague deferred. According to the AU, the deferral request is aimed at allowing the two leaders to deal with the threats to peace and acts of aggression likely to occur in the light of the prevailing and continuing terrorist threat in Eastern Africa and the Horn of Africa.

# **Geopolitical dynamics**

# Africa and RECs

Over the past two years, AMISOM forces have driven al-Shabaab out of Somalia's main cities of Mogadishu and Kismayo, but the Islamist militant group has regrouped, shifting its military strategy from conventional warfare and holding ground in cities to guerrilla warfare. Al-Shabaab's military strength is

estimated at between 3 000 and 5 000 recruits and there are suggestions that the group is increasing its numbers through forced recruitment and inducement. AMISOM's forces seem overstretched and are currently more defensive in their strategy, whereas an offensive approach is necessary to clear the militant group from the other areas and economic avenues that it currently controls.

The PSC, at its 399<sup>th</sup> meeting held on 10 October 2013, endorsed the recommendations made by the Joint AU-UN Review of AMISOM and the benchmarking exercise to increase AMISOM's strength by 6 235 troops and police personnel to bring its total strength to 23 966 uniformed personnel. The PSC also urged that AMISOM be provided with the required force multipliers and enablers. However, this decision needs the approval of the UN Security Council.

On its part, IGAD, following the Westgate Mall attack, observed that increased terrorist attacks in the region would not make IGAD withdraw the region's troops from Somalia. IGAD's Executive Secretary, Engineer Mahboub Maalim, maintained that AMISOM forces would only pull out of Somalia after durable peace and stability had been achieved. He appealed to the international community to support Kenyan and regional efforts to fight all forms of terror. Other regional organisations, such as the East African Community, also condemned the attack and expressed their condolences to the people of Kenva.

Instructively, the Westgate Mall attack rekindled concerns about al-Shabaab's increasing reach outside Somalia's borders. There is a worrying possibility (although there is no concrete evidence so far) that al-Shabaab might be working with other militant groups in Africa such as al-Qaeda in the Islamic Maghreb and Nigeria's Boko Haram, which would make it very difficult to contain the threat of terrorism on the continent.

# **United Nations**

The UN, especially the UN Security Council, has been engaged with the issue of dealing with al-Shabaab for some time now. Following the Westgate Mall attack, the UN representative in Somalia, Nicholas Kay, called for increased financial and military support to the Somali federal government and the AU troops serving there. Meanwhile, UN Secretary General Ban Ki-moon urged AMISOM to launch a new military offensive against al-Shabaab's



insurgents to stem the spread of terrorism in East Africa and ensure the survival of Somalia's struggling government. In that regard, Ban appealed for a temporary military surge of thousands of additional African troops into Somalia in order to deal a decisive military defeat to al-Shabaab. The offensive would aim to deprive the Islamist militant group of the ability to freely recruit new followers and secure the taxes and investments necessary to underwrite its terrorist operations. Ban also appealed to the 15-nation UN Security Council to provide financial and military support to AMISOM, along with attack helicopters and other advanced logistical and intelligence equipment to help take the fight to al-Shabaab's strongholds in rural southern Somalia.

Meanwhile, in October 2013, the UN Deputy Secretary General, Ambassador Jan Eliasson, officially opened the UN office in Mogadishu. This development was aimed at improving the coordination of humanitarian aid and support, decision-making, efficiency and accountability. The world body's efforts to achieve peace, reconciliation and stability in Somalia are being coordinated by the UN Assistance Mission in Somalia (UNSOM). The UN mission is mandated by the UN Security Council to work with the federal government of Somalia to help create an environment in which stabilisation and peacebuilding can succeed.

# **International community**

Various state and non-state actors in the international community reacted to the Westgate Mall attack by condemning it as callous and despicable. In addition, US Special Forces launched a raid on a villa in Somalia's coastal town of Baraawe, located 180km south of Mogadishu, two weeks after the Westgate Mall attack. The target of the attack was not clear, although Baraawe is widely believed to be home to several senior al Shabaab leaders.

The EU has also been engaged in Somalia and the region through different common security and defence policy missions. The EU remains one of AMISOM's strongest supporters and has contributed €440 million since 2007 through the African Peace Facility. Various top EU officials also condemned the Westgate attack and urged continued cooperation in 'freeing Somalia and Kenya from the scourge of al-Shabaab' in order to promote security and development in the region.

# Civil society

Kenyan civil society, too, strongly condemned the Westgate attack as a

barbaric act against unarmed civilians and innocent children. Civil society groups supported this condemnation across faiths and communities, including Christians, Muslims and people of Somali origin. Kenya's civil society organisations even managed to raise money and donate blood to support victims of the attack. The Westgate attack also raised debates among civil society groups and the media about Kenya's preparedness and response to the attack and the country's continued presence in Somalia. Views on these issues remain mixed, although the option of pulling out of Somalia does not seem to have gained much currency. This is probably because of a feeling that the KDF's presence in Somalia is due to a concern for Kenya's own security and national interests. The feeling could also be underpinned by a sense of nationalism in Kenya, where ordinary citizens think that Kenya's presence in Somalia is part of the country's geostrategic positioning as an important actor in the region and on the continent.

A concern, however, emanating from the Westgate Mall and other related attacks in Kenya is the possibility of increased inter-communal prejudice and tensions as a scapegoat for the actions of al-Shabaab, especially between the Kenyan Somali population and other ethnic communities.

## **Scenarios**

Given the current situation, the following could take place:

# Scenario 1

There are increased attacks by al-Shabaab, which then leads to an enormous ripple effect not only on innocent lives but also on Kenya's economy. The situation would see investors move elsewhere and the cost of business increasing. Ultimately, the situation destabilises Kenya as it develops into a base for violent extremism.

### Scenario 2

There is an increase in targeted attacks against the al-Shabaab leadership inside Somalia by the international community and pre-emptive measures inside Kenya, which then leads to occasional threats, but diminished actual attacks in Kenya. The situation, in the short and medium term, remains this way with protracted efforts to stabilise Somalia. Eventually, there is concurrence about the need to engage with al-Shabaab, although there is a continuation of low-level threats, especially by international al-Shabaab jihadists.

#### Scenario 3

Al-Shabaab is annihilated by AMISOM's military offensive, which leads to consolidation of peace and stability in Somalia by the Somali federal government and a return to normalcy or the cessation of al-Shabaab attacks in Kenya.

## **Options**

The following options could be considered:

#### **Option 1**

The AU PSC should emphasise the need for additional troops, capabilities and support for AMISOM and the Somali National Army, and the need to invest in development inside Somalia to boost the legitimacy of current interventions and peace efforts.

## Option 2

The Kenyan government should re-calibrate its security forces to make them responsive to the new emerging threats. It should also improve security partnerships with the public, consider rewarding Kenyans who provide vital information that leads to the arrests of terrorist suspects and initiate mechanisms to investigate and allay allegations made against Kenyan troops in Somalia.

## Option 3

The Somali government/IGAD/AU and the international community should consider the option of working with Muslim countries to invalidate the extremist views that sustain al-Shabaab and even consider the option of initiating dialogue with al-Shabaab and/or aim to find a solution with al-Shabaab's mutual cooperation.



# Important dates to diarise

6	November	International Day for Preventing the Exploitation of the Environment in War and Armed Conflict
16	November	International Day for Tolerance
20	November	Africa Industrialisation Day
20	November	Universal Children's Day
25	November	International Day for the Elimination of Violence against Women
2	December	International Day for the Elimination of Slavery
9	December	International Anti-Corruption Day
10	December	Human Rights Day
18	December	International Migrants' Day
20	December	International Human Solidarity Day

Local	20 November 2013
Senate, National Assembly, local	23 November 2013
Presidential	24 November 2013
National Assembly	20 December 2013
	Presidential

Conflict Prevention and Risk Analysis Division, ISS Addis Ababa

Dr Duke Kent-Brown

Conflict Prevention and Risk Analysis Division, ISS Nairobi

Dr Emmanuel Kisiangani

Dr Gino Vlavonou

Ms Hawa Mohammed

Conflict Prevention and Risk Analysis Division, ISS Pretoria

Ms Dimpho Motsamai

Dr Gwinyayi Dzinesa

# **Acknowledgements**

Ms Antoinette Louw

Ms Iolandi Pool

Mr Jean-Guilhem Barques

# **Contact**

Amb. Olusegun Akinsanya Regional Director Institute for Security Studies P.O. Box 2329 Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Tel: +251-11-515 6320/24/67/98

Fax: +251-11-515 6449

Emails: addisababa@issafrica.org

oakinsanya@issafrica.org website: www.issafrica.org

Subscribe electronically to the PSC Report at

www.issafrica.org/subscribe.php

# **Donors**

This Report is published through the support of the Humanity United Foundation and Hanns Seidel Stiftung. The ISS is also grateful for the support of the following key partners: the Governments of Norway, Sweden, Australia and Denmark.

The ISS is a leading African policy research and training organisation. The vision of the ISS is a peaceful and prosperous Africa for all its people. The mission and overall goal of the ISS is to advance human security in Africa through evidence-based policy advice, technical support and capacity building.













# **About this report**

This report is an independent publication of the ISS. It is also available on the ISS website in English and in French and can be viewed together with thematic reports on the work of the PSC at www.issafrica.org/publications/peace-and-security-council-report. The PSC Report can also be accessed in English and French at the ROP website at www.operationspaix.net.

# © 2013, Institute for Security Studies

Copyright in the volume as a whole is vested in the Institute for Security Studies, and no part may be reproduced in whole or in part without the express permission, in writing, of the Institute. The opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the ISS, its trustees, members of the Advisory Council or donors.

Contributors to this Volume