

# **Final Report**

## **The Cost of the Troubles Study**

**Unit 14 North City Business Centre  
Duncairn Gardens, Belfast BT 15 2GG**

**April 1999**

## **Table of contents**

<b>Section</b>	<b>Page</b>
Executive Summary	
Project Structure	
Board of Directors	
Advisory Group	
Funding	
Political Climate	
Office Base	
Staff at the Cost of the Troubles Study	
Staff Support and Training	
Projects	
Dissemination of research findings	
Outreach Work	
International Work	
Evaluation	

## Executive summary

### ● **Background to the Project**

After the ceasefires from 1994 onwards, a group of people from all sections of the population in Northern Ireland who had direct experience of being bereaved or injured in the Troubles were brought together to discuss their contribution to the new political situation. The widespread determination to have violence permanently ended seemed to be based on the unspoken recognition of the damage done by the violence of the Troubles. This group formed 'The Cost of the Troubles Study', which became a limited company and a recognised charity. In partnership with academic researchers from the university sector, a study of the effects of the Troubles on the population was planned and initiated. The research is conducted in line with participatory action research principles. This means that the management structure involves a range of people with direct experience of the effects of the Troubles.

### ● **Board of Directors**

The Board of Directors was the executive body who ran the project. The Board met roughly on the monthly basis, and the Chairperson regularly called in to the office to keep in touch with the issues on an ongoing basis.

### ● **Advisory Group**

The Advisory Group for the project was formed with the establishment of the project and was composed of both funders and various others with relevant experience in this field of work.

### ● **Aim of the Project**

The two-year project set out to examine the nature and prevalence of the effects of the violence of the Troubles on the general population of Northern Ireland. The original proposal for the 2-year project detailed the work, which it aimed to produce:

- an annotated directory of self-help groups related to the need of those injured or bereaved in the Troubles
- a mapped distribution of deaths during the Troubles
- an exploration of the relationship between deprivation, and the geographical distribution of deaths in the Troubles
- detailed qualitative illustrations of the diversity and range of experience and needs of those affected by the Troubles
- a measure of prevalence, extent and diversity of the effects of the Troubles on the general population of Northern Ireland
- a measure of the extent and range of services used by those affected by the Troubles, and their evaluation of those services
- a network of groups and individuals working on issues related to the effect so the Troubles.

The project's succeeded in achieving all of those proposed aims through a number of interlinking projects.

## Projects

- **Database on deaths**

This involved the creation of a database of deaths in the Troubles which records data on all those killed from 1969 to date. An analysis of the data on deaths was conducted in order to examine its relationship to other variables such as deprivation, geographic location and economic factors. The database was also used to calculate ward death rates and its analysis was published in two editions. An analysis of this database was published in two editions.

- **Qualitative Data: The In-Depth Interviews**

A series of in-depth interviews with a cross section of people throughout Northern Ireland was embarked upon, which served a number of functions. These interviews were to provide qualitative data on the range and diversity of people's experience of the Troubles. Second, they were to provide subjective assessments of the effects of the Troubles on the range of people interviewed. Third, they were to form the basis for the questionnaire design, which was to be used in the survey. In all 75 interviews were conducted by the end of the project.

- **Field Survey**

The aims of the survey were to establish the prevalence of emotional and physical sequelae arising out of the Troubles in Northern Ireland, and to identify the needs (health, emotional, social, financial) of those affected. This involved administering a questionnaire to a representative sample of the population of Northern Ireland. The results of the survey were analysed and published in a report entitled 'Report on the Northern Ireland Survey: the experience and impact of violence' Mike Morrissey and Marie Smyth (full technical report; short version).

- **Survey of Victims Groups**

The Cost of the Troubles Study were commissioned by the Victims Liaison Unit to conduct a survey of current groups serving the bereaved and injured in the Troubles, in order to establish a good base of information and further government policy in this area. The survey aimed to compile a comprehensive list of all community-based and voluntary organisations whose aim is primarily or more broadly to serve the needs of those bereaved or injured in the Troubles. It also wished to ascertain how each of these two categories of organisation fund their current provision of services to this group in order to establish the long term funding strategies and to explore possible or actual gaps in services provided by these two types of organisation. The final report of the analysis of the survey was completed in February 1999 and presented to the Victims Liaison Unit.

- **Do You See What I See? Project with young people**

This project was designed around focus group interviews with young people, which would then be illustrated by them through the medium of photography. The young people, in small groups explored their experiences of the Troubles and expressed themselves through photographic work, transcribed interviews and poetry. The resultant book is in its second edition, and the exhibition continues to be used by various groups raising issues about children and young people affected by the

Troubles. In all the project lasted for five months, and the young people continued to work with the exhibition.

## Dissemination

- **publications**
- ◆ Mapping Troubles Related Deaths (two editions: 1969-1994 (out of print); 1969-1998) Marie Therese Fay, Mike Morrissey and Marie Smyth.
- ◆ Half the Battle: Understanding the impact of the Troubles on children and young people. Marie Smyth.
- ◆ Do you see what I see? Young people's experiences of the Troubles in their own words and images. Cost of the Troubles Study/ Young people of Sunningdale Youth Group, Survivors of Trauma Woodvale Youth Group, Alexander Park Project and the Peace and Reconciliation Group in Derry, with Joy Dyer.
- ◆ Northern Ireland's Troubles: The Human Costs, Marie Therese Fay, Mike Morrissey and Marie Smyth. London: Pluto Press, April, 1999.
- ◆ Irrecoverable Losses: Personal Accounts of the Troubles in Northern Ireland, Pluto Press, London, 2000. Marie Therese Fay and Marie Smyth. (In preparation)
- ◆ Report on the Northern Ireland Survey: the experience and impact of violence: Mike Morrissey and Marie Smyth (full technical report; short version)

## Exhibitions

### ▪ **Do You See What I See?**

An exhibition of young people's experience of the Troubles using their own words and photographs. The exhibition was created in partnership with young people from Woodvale Youth Group, Sunningdale Youth Group, Survivors of Trauma in North Belfast, The Alexander Park Project in Belfast, The Peace and Reconciliation Group and St. Eugene's Primary School in Derry Londonderry and the Cost of the Troubles Study. Children and young people were interviewed or wrote about their experiences of the Troubles, their views and their hopes for the future. Belfast Exposed worked with the young people in Belfast in training them to take their own photographs, which were used to accompany the text of the book and exhibition.

### ▪ **Do You Know What's Happened?**

The exhibition is composed of over twenty personal stories and excerpts from a further 55 stories. These are presented alongside powerful images and other findings of The Cost of the Troubles Study's research in an exhibition which offers visitors the opportunity of exploring the worlds of others, their experiences of the Troubles, their sorrows, fears, ways of coping and the way their experiences have affected them.

### ▪ **"The Festival of Trees"**

Save the Children Fund invited The Cost of the Troubles Study to contribute a Christmas tree to the “Festival of Trees” at Aldergrove International Airport during Christmas 1998. Children from The Peace and Reconciliation Group in Derry Londonderry, Survivors of Trauma, WAVE and The Victims and Survivors Trust made Christmas decorations which carried messages about the effects of the Troubles on children. Statistics on the number of children killed in the Troubles and other background information was displayed alongside the tree which remained in the arrivals area throughout the Christmas period.

- **Film**

Work will begin in June 1999 on a 35 minute video film based on the work of the project, made by Northern Visions, and financed by the United States Institute of Peace.

- **Webpages**

Excerpts from all publications and the catalogue of the Do You Know What’s Happened? exhibition are posted on the CAIN website, <http://cain.ulst.ac.uk/cts> Lists of publications and ordering details are also provided on the website.

- **Talks, Conference Presentations and Workshops**

During the project period, The Cost of the Troubles team delivered a number of talks, workshops and conference papers which are detailed in full.

- **Media Coverage**

Over the past two and a half years the Cost of the Troubles project attracted a substantial amount of media interest, local, national and international, in both print and broadcast form.

## **Evaluation**

A review of the original aims of the project and comments on how and if they were achieved.

The original proposal for the 2-year project detailed the work, aimed to produce a range of outputs, which are listed earlier in this report. These were as follows:

- ✓ an annotated directory of self-help groups related to the need of those injured or bereaved in the Troubles: *this was provided to the Victims Liaison Unit for publication by them*
- ✓ a mapped distribution of deaths during the Troubles: *this was published as first publication of the project, and reprinted in second edition*
- ✓ an exploration of the relationship between deprivation, and the geographical distribution of deaths in the Troubles: *this was published as part of the first publication and a more extended analysis contained in Northern Ireland: The Human Costs Pluto, 1999.*
- ✓ detailed qualitative illustrations of the diversity and range of experience and needs of those affected by the Troubles: *contained in both exhibitions and in the qualitative illustrations to the survey data, and in submissions to the Northern Ireland Victims Commissions and the Compensation Review Commission.*
- ✓ a measure of prevalence, extent and diversity of the effects of the Troubles on the

general population of Northern Ireland: *this is contained in the survey analysis and in the ward death rates.*

- ✓ a measure of the extent and range of services used by those affected by the Troubles, and their evaluation of those services: *this was contained in the survey data, and in parts of the qualitative data.*
- ✓ a network of groups and individuals working on issues related to the effect so the Troubles: *through the formation of the board, through our method of working by consultation with groups, by providing talks and workshops locally for groups, and through working with various groups and conferences, a more comprehensive network exists now than at the beginning of the project.*

## Exercise in Evaluation

We have available the following feedback on the project work:

- formal written feedback on the exhibitions
- informal comments from participants and consumers of the project material
- deductions on the usefulness of the information generated by virtue of the demand for it, in terms of data requests and requests for publications, presentations and exhibitions
- complaints about the project work

- **The policy impact of the project**

Insofar as this can be gauged at this point, the project has at least succeeded in raising the issue of targeting social need and questioning whether present methods and approaches adequately target those affected by the Troubles. Within the life-time of the project, there is some evidence of the impact of the data. Sir Kenneth Bloomfield in his report to the Secretary of State writes, "I have been able to draw not only upon useful Government statistics, but also upon the work of the Cost of the Troubles Study, directed by Marie Smyth." The project also made detailed submissions to the Victims Commission and responded to the "We Will Remember Them" report by Sir Kenneth Bloomfield. The project was also involved in talks with the Social Services Inspectorate in the process of drawing together their inspection of services to those affected by the Troubles, and made a response to their report, "Living with the Trauma of the 'Troubles'".

- **Impact on public awareness**

To properly evaluate the scale and nature of any impact on public awareness of the work of this project is another project in itself. However, insofar as the project recognised the importance of media coverage in accessing public attention and took steps to impact on public attention through the use of the media, at very least the task was engaged with. Partly due to the political backdrop to the project, media interest in the field was consistent throughout the project period, although some of that interest may not have been coherent with the goals of the project at certain moments.

## Project Structure

After the ceasefires from 1994 onwards, a group of people from all sections of the population in Northern Ireland who had direct experience of being bereaved or injured in the Troubles were brought together to discuss their contribution to the new political situation. The widespread determination to have violence permanently ended seemed to be based on the unspoken recognition of the damage done by the violence of the Troubles. This group formed 'The Cost of the Troubles Study', which became a limited company and a recognised charity. In partnership with academic researchers from the university sector, a study of the effects of the Troubles on the population was planned and initiated.

The research is conducted in line with participatory action research principles. This means that the management structure involves a range of people with direct experience of the effects of the Troubles. There are ethical questions about researchers becoming involved in this field of research which led to the need to make researchers accountable to those with direct experience of bereavement and injury. One of the most devastating after-effects of trauma is the sense of disempowerment that it can bring. Working according to a principle of partnership is an attempt to avoid further disempowering those we research.

The two-year project set out to examine the nature and prevalence of the effects of the violence of the Troubles on the general population of Northern Ireland.

The original proposal for the 2-year project detailed the work, which it aimed to produce:

- an annotated directory of self-help groups related to the need of those injured or bereaved in the Troubles
- a mapped distribution of deaths during the Troubles
- an exploration of the relationship between deprivation, and the geographical distribution of deaths in the Troubles
- detailed qualitative illustrations of the diversity and range of experience and needs of those affected by the Troubles
- a measure of prevalence, extent and diversity of the effects of the Troubles on the general population of Northern Ireland
- a measure of the extent and range of services used by those affected by the Troubles, and their evaluation of those services
- a network of groups and individuals working on issues related to the effect so the Troubles.

The project's success in achieving these goals and the overall aim of increasing public awareness of the situation of those bereaved and injured in the Troubles will be commented on in a later section.

The project has employed a range of methods, both qualitative and quantitative, within an action-research paradigm, and the involvement of those directly affected in the Troubles in informing the direction of the research.



.

## Board of Directors

The Board of Directors is the executive body who run the project. The Board met roughly on the monthly basis, and the Chairperson has regularly called in to the office to keep in touch with the issues on an ongoing basis.

Rev Dr David Clements	<i>Chairman of Board of Directors</i>
Marie Smyth	<i>Project Director / Company Secretary</i>
Brendan Bradley	<i>Vice Chair of Board of Directors</i>
Hazel McCready	<i>Treasurer</i>
Sam Malcolmson	<i>Director</i>
Marie McNiece	<i>Director</i>
John Millar	<i>Director</i>
Mike Morrissey	<i>Director</i>
Sandra Peake	<i>Director</i>
Shelley Prue	<i>Director (appointed January 1998)</i>
Mary Donaghy	<i>Director (resigned February 1998)</i>
Linda Roddy	<i>Director (resigned February 1998)</i>

## Advisory Group

The Advisory Group for the project was formed with the establishment of the project and is composed of both funders and various others with relevant experience in this field of work.

**Dr Andrew Finlay**, Department of Sociology, Trinity College Dublin

**Marguerite Egan**, Central Community Relations Unit (retired in 1998 and was replaced by)

**Dr Jill Brown**, Central Community Relations Unit

**Dr John Yarnell**, Health Promotion Agency for Northern Ireland

**Dr Liz McWhirter**, DHSS Statistics

**John Park**, Social Services Inspectorate

**Dr Debbie Donnelly**, RUC Statistics

**Paula Devine**, Centre for Childcare Research, Queens University, Belfast (later replaced by)

**Andrew Percy**, Centre for Childcare Research, Queens University, Belfast

**Damien Gorman** Director, An Crann/The Tree (later replaced by)

**Cathy McKimm** Director, An Crann/The Tree

**Tony McQuillan**, Northern Ireland Housing Executive

## **Funding**

The project attracted £100,000 of funding from the Central Community Relations Unit, through the EU Physical, Social and Economic Programme. The second source of funding was the Special Support Programme for Peace and Reconciliation through the Northern Ireland Voluntary Trust, which granted their maximum amount of £100,000. The Joseph Rowntree Charitable Trust granted £15,000 towards the cost of dissemination of project findings, £27,000 plus additional computer costs were received from Making Belfast Work West and North East Teams.

In addition, during the course of the project, the Cost of the Troubles Study received further funding from the CCRU (£2,500), NIVT (25,000) and Making Belfast Work (2,900).

The Community Relations Council provided £4,500, Barnardo's £1,500 and the Save the Children Fund £2,500. The Victims Liaison Unit of the Northern Ireland Office commissioned the Cost of the Troubles Study to complete a piece of research.

The Belfast European Partnership Board provided £30,000 for funding of the *Do You Know What's Happened?* exhibition.

The Cultural Diversity Group of the Community Relations Council Community Relations Council of Northern Ireland are still processing an application for assistance with the children's publications. Similarly, the Community Relations Council are still considering an application for funding to support a study visit to South Africa.

After the formal end of the project the United States Institute for Peace granted \$45,000 towards the cost of making an educational film about the work of the project. The film was designed by Northern Visions who are currently fund-raising for the remainder of the money required to realise this project.

The Northern Ireland Voluntary Trust granted £10,000 towards the cost of redesigning and improving the main exhibition.

## **Political Climate**

Since the beginning of the project, the atmosphere in Northern Ireland has swung from one of political uncertainty, tension, often spilling into violence to one of rising optimism and confidence as the Good Friday Agreement was signed. At the time of writing, this climate continues, even as the date for implementation of the new assembly is postponed for three weeks, due to the disagreements about decommissioning. The political climate bears a direct impact on the difficulty or ease with which we have carried out the work of this project. First, the willingness or otherwise of people to co-operate with the research varies with the level of security people feel with the political situation. Secondly, the composition of the project itself,

particularly the Board means that at times of heightened tensions the difference between us have tested our trust of each other and our commitment to carrying out this work.

We were not to know when we began this project what the future held in terms of the political arrangements in Northern Ireland. Political negotiations leading to the Good Friday Agreement found us lobbying and talking to parties to the agreement about the inclusion of the interests of those bereaved and injured in the Troubles. We lobbied for the inclusion of victims in the agreement and for specific mention of the situation of children and young people affected by the Troubles. Section on Rights, Safeguards, Equality of Opportunity, Subsection on Human Rights, Paragraph 12 on Reconciliation and Victims of Violence of the agreement sets out the orientation towards victims, and we were pleased that young people are specifically mentioned. The Project was also involved in providing information and in consultations with John Park of the Social Services Inspectorate who conducted an inspection on services to those affected by the Troubles on behalf of the Department of Health and Social Services. The resulting report, "Living with the Trauma of the 'Troubles'" was the first ever government report to recognise the situation of those specifically affected by the Troubles. The wide-ranging recommendations contained in this report were taken up by Sir Kenneth Bloomfield in his report, "We Will Remember Them" which was commissioned by the Secretary of State. Similarly, Sir Kenneth relied on data produced by this project to provide the backdrop to his work. The project team also met with Sir Kenneth and Mary Butcher on several occasions to press particular points or to provide information.

The publication of the Bloomfield report was accompanied by the announcement of £5m expenditure on provision for those affected by the Troubles, and this was described as a "down-payment" by the Secretary of State at the launch of the Bloomfield Report in Stormont in May 1998. However, to date no further monies have been allocated and no plans or mechanisms for channelling money to groups have been established. Suspicion about the announcements of such provisions against a backdrop of the first early releases of political prisoners has contributed to an atmosphere of frustration and growing cynicism on the part of some groups and individuals active in the field.

One of the recommendations of the Bloomfield report was that a "co-ordinator" to represent and monitor victims interests be appointed by government. The Victims Liaison Unit, a unit within the Northern Ireland Office, was created and staffed by civil servants, and this was accompanied by the appointment of Adam Ingram as Minister for Victims. However, some were disappointed by this appointment, given Mr Ingram's already heavy commitments as Minister for Security, and some felt that the dual role was contradictory and/or inappropriate.

On the 15 August, 1998, these concerns were rendered small indeed in the light of a bomb which exploded in a busy town centre in Omagh whilst local people and tourists were doing their Saturday shopping. Twenty-nine people were killed and hundreds were injured, some losing limbs and other serious disabling injuries. The public and unilateral outcry against this bombing led to the isolation of the Republican faction that had carried it out, and to humanitarian focus on Omagh. Money began to be raised and continues to be raised to the present day. The trauma teams and other resources were deployed and public interest and sympathy focussed on the town and

the bereaved and injured. Public resources were made available in unprecedented ways in order to support those affected by the bomb.

For some, bereaved and injured in bombings or incidents in the past, the resources made available in the wake of Omagh serve to remind them of how little was and still is available to them.

In February 1999, a Family Trauma Centre was opened in South Belfast specialising in dealing with the effects of the Troubles.

All of the political parties in the Shadow Assembly have nominated spokespersons on “victims” issues. It remains to be seen how new political dispensations and changes in the political climate will impact in the future on those affected by the Troubles.

## **Office Base**

The Cost of the Troubles office is located in The North City Business Centre, Duncairn Gardens, in North Belfast. The decision to base the project in Belfast was made, in consultation with the Board of Directors, for two main reasons. The transportation to and from Belfast is easier than for other locations in Northern Ireland, and the infrastructure needed to support a sizeable project was readily accessible in Belfast. The need to find a neutral location accessible to both communities, and suitable for our disabled Board members, was also a major consideration. After viewing several city centre offices, the North City Business Centre premises were chosen since they straddle the sectarian divide and are used by both communities, overheads were low and car parking free. The appropriateness of locating the office in North Belfast, the area that has possibly suffered most in the Troubles was not lost on us. Office furniture and equipment was inherited from the Templegrove Action Research project, but we required some minor additional items, such as heaters and desks. Work on establishing the core requirements of the office, from telephone lines to computers was completed in December 1996, although additions have been made in the subsequent two years.

## **Staff of the Cost of the Troubles Study**

### **Marie Smyth, Project Director**

Marie brought together the group of people who became the Board of Directors and worked with them to design the project, and subsequently organised the fund-raising for it. She was seconded from the University of Ulster, to whom the project paid her replacement salary, so that she could work full-time with the project. As project Director, she was responsible for the overall management of the project, including directing the research, staff supervision and administration. She also participated in all aspects of the project – the mapping exercise, the qualitative interviews, questionnaire design, supervision of survey work and training of interviewers, analysis of survey and of qualitative data and preparation of final reports and publications.

**Mike Morrissey, Senior Researcher**

Mike was “bought in” for a total of three months, for which the project paid his salary to the University of Ulster. He undertook the analysis of the database of deaths, and directed the design of sample frame for the survey. He subsequently directed the statistical analysis of the survey data, assisted by Tracey Wong, from the Urban Institute. He jointly prepared publications with Marie Smyth and Marie Therese Fay. He also served on the Board of Directors.

**Marie-Therese Fay, Research Officer**

Marie-Therese began work with the project in December 1996. As Research Officer her first task was to compile the database on deaths. She is responsible for maintaining that database and as its contents have not been made public she also deals with requests for information from outside organisations and agencies on a weekly basis. The second phase of her work comprised the in-depth interviews, which were all conducted by herself and Marie Smyth. When the transcripts were agreed, Marie-Therese directed the coding operation on the interview transcripts, using NUD.IST, a software package for analysing qualitative data. The final phase of work on the interview transcripts involved condensing the transcripts into “poems” – time ordered displays of selected transcripts. These poems form the basis of the main exhibition emanating from the project, entitled, “Do You Know What’s Happened,” Marie-Therese also worked on a number of publications with the two senior researchers as explained elsewhere in this report.

**Sarah Oakes, Project Administrator**

Sarah commenced work in January 1997, and was contracted to work until the end of the project in August 1998. Sarah’s responsibilities were to set up and maintain financial accounting systems and to liaise with funders in respect of grant payments and accounting systems. Sarah was also responsible for the management of the office and for payroll administration. She also acted as secretary to the Board of Directors and the Advisory Group. She was also a part of the team and participated in many of the discussions about the research. During 1997 Sarah became pregnant and applied for maternity leave, which was taken between September 26 and February 16. Sarah produced a healthy son, Sam, during her leave.

**Mark Mulligan, Project Administrator**

To cover this period, Mark Mulligan was recruited and started work on September 5<sup>th</sup>. On her return from maternity leave, Sarah requested a job-share arrangement, and this was organised with Mark Mulligan job-sharing with Sarah. The project life was extended through the provision of additional funding by NIVT and a private donor. However, Sarah successfully applied for another post and left the project in August 1998, which was to have been the end of her and Mark’s contract. The job was advertised and Gwen Ford was appointed as a Project Administrator.

**Gwen Ford, Project Administrator**

Gwen commenced employment as Project Administrator on 24 August 1998. In addition to performing the duties of this post, she undertook the graphic design of the catalogues, posters and flyers for the exhibition 'Do You Know What's Happened?' and associated desktop publishing.

She also undertook additional I.T. duties, seeking the best deal to purchase one new laptop computer and one new desktop system, which she also networked. She installed the peripherals and software for each, standardised the software on all company PCs and is responsible for general maintenance and hardware/software installation for all PCs, in addition to managing the LAN. Individual PC internet access was enabled by the installation of a data-switch box. She has also revamped the company's website, and is creating new pages, including the catalogue of the exhibition 'Do You Know What's Happened?'

She has compiled both a paper and electronic 'funders database', through research mainly conducted via the internet, finding new funding opportunities and has assisted with preparing grant applications. She is currently managing the bookings for 'Do You Know What's Happened?' which is touring at present.

### **Lisa Mitchell, Events and Information Officer**

Lisa Mitchell joined the team in July 1998 with a brief to organise the main exhibition, 'Do you Know What's Happened?' and to manage the children's exhibition, 'Do You See What I See?' Lisa was also responsible for dealing with the volume of enquiries about the project and its outputs, and for acting as Press Officer to the project. Lisa organised press coverage of the exhibitions, maintained records of coverage and updated our press list. She also provided a one-day training course for staff at INCORE on dealing with the press.

### **Gráinne Kelly, Researcher**

Gráinne began work as a Researcher with the Cost of the Troubles Study in October 1998, following a commission from the Victims Liaison Unit for a survey of groups working with those affected by the Troubles. Gráinne worked with the project director in designing the questionnaire and she then carried out the survey, and conducted the analysis of the results. The final report was prepared with the Project Director and was submitted to the Victims Liaison Unit in February 1999. In addition, Gráinne compiled a directory of groups working in the field, and this was passed to the Victims Liaison Unit for publication by them in March 1999.

### **Joy Dyer, Intern, Vanderbilt University**

Joy Dyer found the project on the Internet and emailed asking for an internship. She had worked in Northern Ireland before, and expressed an interest in working with children and young people. The Board of Directors agreed to provide an internship and the Project Director agreed a programme of work for Joy with Survivors of Trauma, Dale Youth Group and Woodvale Youth Group. The project was designed around focus group interviews with the young people, which would then be edited and illustrated by them through the medium of photography. Joy conducted the focus group interviews, transcribed and agreed the editing with the young people. She also co-ordinated the photographic work which was conducted in conjunction with Belfast

Exposed. Joy also participated with the staff team in the design of the exhibition and book, 'Do You See What I See?' Joy's internship finished in May 1998, and internship reports were provided for Vanderbilt University.

## **Staff Support and Training**

### **Staff support**

Due to the sensitive and often stressful information which is handled by the staff in the Cost of the Troubles Study, it was considered important that staff should be offered formalised arrangements for stress management and debriefing. Staff who have been involved in large numbers of interviews and in transcribing and coding interviews often need to 'off-load' the impact on them of handling often distressing material. Formal debriefing arrangements were made for the Project Director and the Research Officer. Karen McMinn provided regular debriefing sessions for the Project Director and after she emigrated to Barcelona, Dick McDonald continued to provide this service. Alison Wightman provided this service for Marie Therese, until she left Survivors of Trauma in May 1998. Sarah Oakes had an informal arrangement, and all staff are encouraged to book aromatherapy, massage or reflexology sessions at times of particular stress. Staff have also been encouraged to take regular physical exercise. Staff meetings also provide a forum for discussion of difficulties and exploration of ideas.

### **Staff training**

Marie-Therese Fay attended a counselling course, as part of her preparations for the qualitative interviews which she undertook. Marie-Therese also took RSA Stage 2 Word Processing and Mark Mulligan took Stage 1 in the same area. Marie Smyth and Marie Therese Fay and Sarah Oakes travelled to Dublin to participate in a training session on the use of NUD.IST in Trinity College, Dublin. Gwen Ford also participated in a three day training course on PC Technical Support.

### **Field-force training**

We provided training for 29 interviewers who were employed by Research Services Ireland to conduct the survey of the population. Interviewers were provided with basic training in dealing with distress and how to refer on interviewees who wish to receive help. Interviewers were provided with information and leaflets on the various helping agencies in the field. Research Services Ireland provided the usual questionnaire administration and interviewing training.

## **Projects**

### **Database on deaths**

This involved the creation of a database of deaths in the Troubles which records data on all those killed from 1969 to date: the date of death, the age, gender, first and second name of the person killed, their home address and postcode, the address at which they were killed and its postcode, their occupation, religion, affiliation (i.e. whether they were a civilian, paramilitary or member of the security forces) and the



identity of the agency responsible for their death. This database was checked with existing sources and subsequently ward codes and district council codes attached to the home addresses and incident addresses for purposes of analysis.

### **Database analysis**

An analysis of the data on deaths was conducted in order to examine its relationship to other variables such as deprivation, geographic location and economic factors. The database was also used to calculate ward death rates. This exercise was originally primarily conducted in order to provide a sample frame for phase three of the research in which it is proposed to draw a sample of 3,000 people throughout Northern Ireland for the survey of population. However, an analysis of this database was published in two editions, entitled Mapping Troubles Related Deaths in Northern Ireland 1969-1994 (first edition) and Mapping Troubles Related Deaths in Northern Ireland 1969-1998 (second edition).

### **Qualitative Data: The In-Depth Interviews**

We embarked on a series of in-depth interviews with a cross section of people throughout Northern Ireland, which were to serve a number of functions. These interviews were to provide qualitative data on the range and diversity of people's experience of the Troubles. Second, they were to provide subjective assessments of the effects of the Troubles on the range of people interviewed. Third, they were to form the basis for the questionnaire design, which was to be used in the survey.

In all 75 interviews were conducted by the end of the project. Since interviews were perceived to have a useful function for some interviewees, we continue to have requests to interview people. Some people feel the need to "tell their story" or have their story acknowledged by someone in a semi-official position, and we have, in part, filled some of this need for some people.

Arguably, the richest data on the experiences and effects of the Troubles in this project was collected in the in-depth interviews. However, it was anticipated that policy makers and others with a policy eye on these issues, might find a survey which 'tested' the wider validity and reliability of the qualitative data useful. Therefore, the qualitative data were collected and alongside being analysed and presented as qualitative data *per se*, they were also used to inform the design of a questionnaire.

### **Field Survey**

The aims of the survey were to establish the prevalence of emotional and physical sequelae arising out of the Troubles in Northern Ireland, and to identify the needs (health, emotional, social, financial) of those affected. This involved administering a questionnaire to a representative sample of the population of Northern Ireland. No existing questionnaire was adequate to the task, and it was necessary to develop an instrument for this purpose. To this end, a tripartite research strategy was employed:

- Phase one produced a database of deaths in the Troubles from 1969 to date. This database was used to calculate ward death rates. The database had been compiled primarily to provide a sample frame for the survey.
- Phase two involved conducting interviews with approximately 75 people to generate in-depth accounts for qualitative analysis. These data also informed the design of a questionnaire for use the field survey of a representative sample composed of 3,000 people drawn from the general population.
- Phase three consisted of the conduct and analysis of this survey. The analysis produced the normal frequency counts on the sample together with analysis of the geographical distribution of experiences and effects, a measure of stress and an analysis of its distribution in the sample population. Other issues for analysis are
  - (1) Household composition & the Troubles
  - (2) legal redress, compensation etc.
  - (3) The Most Affected Wards; and these issues will be dealt with in more detail in reports on further analysis of the survey data.

Phase three also consisted of the dissemination of the results of all findings of the project. This included publications and launches thereof, exhibitions and tours thereof, talks and conference papers.

### **Do You See What I See? Project with young people**

This project was stimulated by Joy Dyer's approach to us requesting an internship. Joy found the project on the Internet and emailed asking for an internship. As was outlined earlier, the project was designed around focus group interviews with young people, which would then be illustrated by them through the medium of photography.

The objectives of the Project were:

- To highlight and increase NGO's awareness of people's experiences of the Troubles and the effects of those experiences on the young people.
- To advocate for European NGO funding and support of work with young people affected by the Troubles
- To empower the young people to develop their own views and present them in exhibition and workshop form.
- To increase the young people's awareness of the experiences of young people in other community.
- To facilitate exchange between young people from both communities in the development and presentation of the multi-media workshop.
- To explore the needs of young people affected by the Troubles.
- To develop a set of advocacy materials that the young people can use in future projects.

The young people, in small groups explored their experiences of the Troubles and expressed themselves through photographic work, transcribed interviews and in the case of the young people from the North West, poetry. They received professional training from Belfast Exposed on how to use images powerfully to represent stories. They encountered young people from the other community in workshops and

encountered the photographic and textual work of the young people both in the exhibition and in the book. The young people were also assisted by project staff to provide educational workshops for adults on the impact of the Troubles on children and young people. The resultant book is in its second edition, and the exhibition continues to be used by various groups raising issues about children and young people affected by the Troubles. In all the project lasted for five months, and the young people continued to work with the exhibition

### **Survey of Victims Groups**

The Cost of the Troubles Study were commissioned by the Victims Liaison Unit to conduct a survey of current groups serving the bereaved and injured in the Troubles, in order to establish a good base of information and further government policy in this area.

The survey had the following aims:

1. To compile a comprehensive list of all community-based organisations whose aim is primarily to serve the needs of those bereaved or injured in the Troubles.
2. To compile a list of organisations in the voluntary sector who offer services to this group as part of a broader range of services to the community.
3. To ascertain how each of these two categories of organisation fund their current provision of services to this group.
4. To establish the long term funding strategies of these two categories of organisation for funding services to those bereaved and injured.
5. To explore possible or actual gaps in services provided by these two types of organisation.

The survey was completed in January 1999. Analysis of the data collected was completed and a first draft of the report was presented to the Victims Liaison Unit at the end of January 1999, and the final report was completed in February 1999.

### **Dissemination of research findings**

The dissemination of the project findings was a priority for us. In order to achieve our goal of increasing public awareness, we had to endeavour to ensure that not only was the information we collected reliable, valid and relevant, but also that it was known and used. Dissemination of our work took a number of forms:

- publications;
  - exhibitions;
  - film;
  - webpages;
  - talks and presentations and
  - media coverage of our work.
- 
- **publications**

**Mapping Troubles Related Deaths (two editions: 1969-1994 (out of print); 1969-1998) Marie Therese Fay, Mike Morrissey and Marie Smyth.**

Two editions of this book were published – the first dealt with deaths from 1969-1994 and when this was out of print, an updated version covering deaths until February 1998 was published.

This publication describes the construction of a database on deaths in the Troubles in Northern Ireland, which includes deaths that have occurred outside Northern Ireland and deaths due to Troubles-related trauma. Existing lists of deaths are reviewed and analysis of the data provided by age, gender, religion, affiliation, perpetrator, ward, district council area and an international comparison is also provided.

**Half the Battle: Understanding the impact of the Troubles on children and young people (1998) Marie Smyth.**

This book is based on an analysis of a subset of the database on Troubles-related deaths, namely deaths under the age of 18 and under the age of 24. It also enlarges on a paper commissioned in 1996 by Barnardo's (Dublin) on the impact of the Troubles on children in Northern Ireland. It provides a summary of the available research and includes some of the qualitative data collected in the work with young people.

**Do you see what I see? Young people's experiences of the Troubles in their own words and images. Cost of the Troubles Study/ Young people of Sunningdale Youth Group, Survivors of Trauma Woodvale Youth Group, Alexander Park Project and the Peace and Reconciliation Group in Derry, with Joy Dyer.**

This is the book of the project described above. Again, two editions of this publication were published, the first now being out of print.

**Northern Ireland's Troubles: The Human Costs, Marie Therese Fay, Mike Morrissey and Marie Smyth. London: Pluto Press, April, 1999.**

This book is based on further analysis of the database of deaths and other data. The purpose of this book is to describe the human costs of Northern Ireland's Troubles, and to set those human costs in the historical, political, economic and social context of Northern Ireland. The book is organised in two main parts. The first part of the book provides a detailed context, both local and international, for the conflict and its human costs that are analysed in the second part. In this analysis, the demography of deaths in the conflict is discussed, and the geographical distribution of deaths and their relationship to other factors such as deprivation examined. Deaths are also analysed by perpetrating organisation and by the affiliations and other characteristics of those killed. Finally, it examines data on the impact of the Troubles on children and young people, and the conclusions look to the future of Northern Ireland in the light of the human costs incurred over the last thirty years.

**(In preparation) Irrecoverable Losses: Personal Accounts of the Troubles in Northern Ireland, Pluto Press, London, 2000. Marie Therese Fay and Marie Smyth.**

This book is based on the interview data collected in the study. The aims of the book are:

1. To provide first hand accounts of a wide range of lived experience of the Troubles.
2. To describe the reality of the impact of the troubles in the words of people from various walks of life.
3. To present edited accounts which illustrate a wide range of diverse experiences and perspectives on the experience of paramilitary activity, violence, imprisonment, injury and death.
4. To provide direct access for the reader into lives and perspectives that are often inaccessible or under-represented.
5. To present personal accounts which respect the manner in which the story was told by the informant.

The book presents selected first hand accounts selected from over seventy interviews with people in Northern Ireland. Individual accounts are presented in the form of “poems” – interview transcripts pared down through successive edits, to provide powerful, direct accounts of life in Northern Ireland, in the words of those interviewed. The diverse voices of the “silent majority” in Northern Ireland are presented: young people who have witnessed killings; clergymen; former paramilitaries, and people who would say that the Troubles have not affected them. All directly address the reader in his or her own words. The effects of these Troubles on their lives lies at the heart of issue: the effect of low intensity conflict on ordinary people. Their accounts provide the answer to some of the key questions about the Troubles. Do those who kill feel remorse? What is it like to live on the Garvaghy Road? Why is marching important to the Loyal Orders? Why does Drumcree happen? The accounts provide insight into how people live with the loss, pain, humiliation and humour that the Troubles have generated.

**Report on the Northern Ireland Survey: the experience and impact of violence  
Mike Morrissey and Marie Smyth (full technical report; short version)**

Two versions of this analysis of the survey of Northern Ireland are available, the full technical report, including frequency counts and a shorter version presenting the main findings and analysis. The analysis examines individual and area characteristics, reported experience of the Troubles, reported impact on people’s lives, it constructs an indicator of post-traumatic stress, and examines how it relates to experience of the Troubles and other variables. Further analysis of cases reporting severe and very severe experiences and impacts of the Troubles is also conducted. Sources of help and respondents’ evaluation of support is also provided. Further analysis of the survey data is planned and will be conducted.

- **exhibitions**

**Do You See What I See? Young people’s experiences of the Troubles in their own words and photographs**

This output of the work with young people comprise both an exhibition and a book, both of which were created in partnership with young people from Woodvale Youth Group, Sunningdale Youth Group, Survivors of Trauma in North Belfast, The

Alexander Park Project in Belfast, The Peace and Reconciliation Group and St. Eugene's Primary School in Derry Londonderry and the Cost of the Troubles Study.

Children and young people were interviewed or wrote about their experiences of the Troubles, their views and their hopes for the future. Belfast Exposed worked with the young people in Belfast in training them to take their own photographs, which were used to accompany the text of the book and exhibition. The exhibition was then designed by Potato Bred and was formally opened by Adam Ingram Minister for Victims in May 1998 at the Belfast Campus of the University of Ulster. The exhibition has subsequently been touring not only Northern Ireland, but also England and the Republic of Ireland and groups such as Save the Children and other community based organisations.

**Accompanying materials:** this exhibition is accompanied by an eight minute video presentation conducted by the young people of the material in the exhibition

#### **VENUES TOURED:**

Opened by Adam Ingram, Minister for Victims in University of Ulster, Belfast Campus, May, 1998.

Focus on children conference, Europa Hotel Belfast, June 1998

European Forum for Child Welfare, Bath England, June 1998

West Belfast Partnership Board, Belfast, September 1998

Galway Central Library, Galway, November 1998.

Clifden Library, Co. Galway, December 1998.

Committee on the Administration of Justice Conference, Belfast, January 1999.

Northern Ireland Voluntary Trust conference Templepatrick, February 1999.

#### **Do You Know What's Happened? Personal stories and images of the Troubles**

The exhibition is composed of over twenty personal stories and excerpts from a further 55 stories. These are presented alongside powerful images and other findings of The Cost of the Troubles Study's research in an exhibition which offers visitors the opportunity of exploring the worlds of others, their experiences of the Troubles, their sorrows, fears, ways of coping and the way their experiences have affected them.

The personal accounts are presented in twelve separate categories, for example a section entitled "*One loss after another,*" deals with multiple bereavement, a section entitled "*Lost childhood*" deals with the impact of the Troubles on children and a section entitled "*All in a day's work*" describes the experience of people whose work has taken them close to the worst suffering of the Troubles. The exhibition documents the challenges that people from both of the main traditions have faced and overcome as a result of the conflict in Northern Ireland.

Displayed alongside the stories is a free standing graph composed of a list showing the date, age and gender of all of those killed and representing every Troubles-related death since 1969. The graph rises to 2.16 metres in 1972, the year when the largest number of deaths occurred.

**Accompanying materials:** This exhibition is accompanied by 140 minutes of tape-recordings of the exhibition text, a 16 page catalogue and a publicity poster.

#### **VENUES TOURED:**

Opened by Dr Marjorie Mowlam Secretary of State for Northern Ireland assisted by John Wilson, former Tanaiste and Victims Commissioner for the Irish Government, in the Great Hall, Belfast City Hall, November 1998.

YMCA Wellington Place, Belfast December 1998

Central Library, Foyle Street, Derry Londonderry, December /January 1999

Bangor Heritage Centre, Bangor, February 1999.

Ards Institute of Further and Higher Education, Bangor, February, 1999

The Trian Centre, Armagh City, March, 1999

**Further bookings:** Dublin City Centre, May/June 1999

Enniskillen Together 5-16 July 1999

Omagh District Council, September 1999

Newry District Council, October 1999

Belfast Central Library November 1999

Other undated bookings: The Big Issue, Glasgow

Stormont Buildings (via the political parties)

Westminster (via the Secretary of State's Office)

Due to technical difficulties with the exhibition, namely the blistering of the laminate on the exhibits it has been necessary to do some repair work on it. It is hoped that this work can be fitted in with a rather full booking schedule, by undertaking the work between existing bookings.

### **Christmas Tree**

Save the Children Fund invited The Cost of the Troubles Study to contribute a Christmas tree to the "Festival of Trees" at Aldergrove International Airport during Christmas 1998. Children from The Peace and Reconciliation Group in Derry Londonderry, Survivors of Trauma, WAVE and The Victims and Survivors Trust made Christmas decorations which carried messages about the effects of the Troubles on children. Statistics on the number of children killed in the Troubles and other background information was displayed alongside the tree which remained in the arrivals area throughout the Christmas period.

- **film**

Work will begin in June 1999 on a 35 minute video film based on the work of the project, made by Northern Visions, and financed by the United States Institute of Peace.

- **webpages**

Excerpts from all publications and the catalogue of the Do You Know What's Happened? exhibition are posted on the CAIN website, <http://cain.ulst.ac.uk/cts> Lists of publications and ordering details are also provided on the website.

- **talks, conference presentations and workshops**

During the project period, we delivered a number of talks, workshops and conference papers. These are set out in the form of lists below:

Survivors of Trauma: Address to Meeting: Landsdowne Court Hotel: Belfast September 1996 (Marie Smyth)

United Nations Working Party on the Effects of Violence/Armed Conflict on Children: Belfast September 1996 (participant over 3 days: Marie Smyth)

Barnardo's Dublin: commissioned paper on Effects of Violence on Children: delivered October, 1996 (Marie Smyth)

Briefing to Russian Delegation (INCORE): October 1996 (Marie Smyth)

Northern Ireland Women's Coalition Women's Forum, Wellington Park: October 1996: presentation on victims of the Troubles. (Marie Smyth)

Survivors of Trauma: Weekend Workshop on organisational aims and plans: October 1996 (Marie Smyth)

Northern Ireland Institute for Human Relations, AGM Address on the Impact of the Troubles: November 1996 (Marie Smyth)

Cunamh Meeting: Derry Londonderry: January 1997 on the work of The Cost of the Troubles Study (Marie Therese Fay and Marie Smyth)

Columbanus Community: March 1997 on distribution of deaths in the Troubles (Marie Smyth)

Paper to Worldforum on Child Welfare Workshop, Faro Portugal on the Impact of the Troubles on Children and Young People. October, 1997. (Marie Smyth)

Workshop with young people affected by the Troubles, May 1997 North City Business Centre (Joy Dyer, Marie Therese Fay, Alison Wightman and Marie Smyth)

Ethnic Studies Network: two conference papers on database analysis: June 1997 (Mike Morrissey, Marie Therese Fay and Marie Smyth)

World Congress on Violence, Dublin: two papers on database analysis: August 1997 (Mike Morrissey, Marie Therese Fay and Marie Smyth)

Series of talks at Chaplaincy, University of Ulster, Jordanstown: October-November 1997 (Marie Smyth)

Omagh District Partnership Board Presentation: October 1997 (Marie Smyth and Bel McGuinness)

Paper presented on Research in Divided Societies at CCRU/INCORE conference October 1997 (Marie Smyth)

Presentation at WAVE AGM on the findings of the Cost of the Troubles Study: October 1997 (Marie Smyth)



Seminar, Belfast City Mission: on the findings of the Cost of the Troubles Study  
November 1997 (Marie Smyth)

Presentation at Garvaghy Road on the findings of the Cost of the Troubles Study:  
November 1997 (Marie Therese Fay and Marie Smyth)

Panel Discussion, Media Trust, Elmwood Hall: Media representation of the Troubles  
November 1997 (Marie Smyth)

WAVE Workshop: presentation on the findings of the Cost of the Troubles Study  
November 1997 (Marie Smyth)

Presentation on the database analysis to Civil Servants: Northern Ireland Office:  
December 1997 (Mike Morrissey, Marie-Therese Fay and Marie Smyth)

Survivors of Trauma, North Belfast: Young Women's Group Talk: December 1997  
(Marie Smyth and Joy Dyer)

Survivors of Trauma, North Belfast: Young Men's Group Talk: December 1997  
(Marie Smyth and Joy Dyer)

Presentation on young people and the Troubles: Ardoyne Youth Providers Forum,  
January 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Visit by Guatemalan Delegation: Kinder Not Hilfe representative Dr Christian  
Aponte: February 1998 (Marie-Therese Fay and Marie Smyth)

NIVT Conference Presentation, on the findings of the Cost of the Troubles Study:  
February 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Presentation to the European Budget Committee of the European Parliament on the  
findings of the Cost of the Troubles Study 3 April 1998 (Marie Smyth)

All day presentation and visit for an international delegation for the Save the Children  
Fund, 6 April 1998 (Marie-Therese Fay and Marie Smyth)

Workshop on NUD.IST coding for Northlands Institute: May 1998 (Marie-Therese  
Fay)

Belfast European Partnership Board, Policy Meeting and Presentation: May 1998  
(Marie Smyth)

Columbian visitors – presentation at Save the Children Fund: June 1998 (Marie-  
Therese Fay)

Presentation to Northern Ireland Voluntary Trust conference on the findings of the  
Cost of the Troubles Study: June 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Paper on definitions of victims, perpetrators and dealing with the past presented at  
INCORE Conference on Dealing with the Past: Belfast June 1998 (Marie Smyth)

European Forum on Child Welfare Conference, Bath: June 1998 (Marie Therese Fay, Shelley Prue, Sam McClarnon, Tom Winston and Marie Smyth)

Northern Ireland Voluntary Trust, Prisoners Sub-Committee, June 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Presentation on Victims for Armagh District Partnership Board, Slieve Donard, July 1998 (Marie-Therese Fay and Marie Smyth)

Meetings with Congressmen and White House Officials in Washington providing them with copies of publications and briefings on situation of victims in preparation from President Clinton's visit to Northern Ireland: July 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Presentation for Sri Lankan delegation visit, INCORE: August 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Workshops at Children's Exhibition Workshop, Cultra: August 1998 (Marie-Therese Fay, Shelley Prue, Alison Wightman, Lisa Mitchell and Marie Smyth)

Public Meeting with Victim Groups to consult on Victims Liaison Unit survey, Holiday Inn: August 1998 (Marie-Therese Fay and Marie Smyth)

Vital Voices Conference Waterfront Hall, Presentation "Transforming Culture of Violence" August 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Presentation to Newtownabbey Partnership Board on young people and the Troubles: September 1998 (Marie Smyth)

West Belfast Partnership Board presentation on young people and the Troubles: September 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Public Meeting on the Bloomfield report recommendations and policy development on victims organised by CALMS: Derry Londonderry, September 1998 (Marie Smyth)

St Dorothea's Church, Gilnahirk. Public talk "Victims – Identities in Transition," 1 October 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Newtownabbey District Partnership presentation on young people and the Troubles: September 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Presentation to American-Ireland Fund representative on young people and the Troubles: October 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Meeting with Irish Government Victims Commission and presentation of the findings of the Cost of the Troubles Study: October 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Paper presented at European Conference on Peacemaking and Conflict Resolution, Belfast, October 1998 "Assessing the impact of low intensity conflict." (Marie Smyth)

CRUSE Conference AGM, Lodge Hotel, Coleraine, "The Impact of the Troubles on emotional health." October 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Lisburn District Partnership Board presentation on young people and the Troubles: November 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Northern Ireland Compensation Review Board presentation: follow-up presentation on compensation November 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Presentation to Shadow Assembly members the findings of the Cost of the Troubles Study at Stormont: November 1998 “Definitions of Victimhood: Victims, Prisoners and the Political Process” (Marie Smyth)

Facilitation of public meeting in Armagh on policy for Victims, Armagh District Partnership Board: November 1998 (Marie Smyth & Marie-Therese Fay)

Inequalities and Health Conference, facilitation of a workshop on health and the Troubles: Northern Ireland Health Promotion Agency, November 1998 (Marie Smyth)

Public talk (with Sir Kenneth Bloomfield) on ‘The Effects of the Troubles’ Coleraine Peace Network, Coleraine Town Hall, January, 1999. (Marie Smyth)

Paper to the University of Bristol School of Social Policy conference on Zemiology, Devon, England. February 1999. (Marie Smyth)

Presentation at Northern Ireland Voluntary Trust Conference on Victims, Templepatrick, February 1999, on the findings of the Cost of the Troubles Study. (Marie Smyth)

Paper to the Northern Ireland – South African Colloquium on the Role of NGOs in Peacebuilding, Cape Town and Robben Island, South Africa on “Victims, History and The Nation: reconciling justice, conflict and the memory of conflict in Northern Ireland” February 27 – March 7, 1999. Organised by Northern Ireland Association for the Care and Resettlement of Offenders. (Marie Smyth)

- **media coverage**

- of the ‘Do You Know What’s Happened?’ Exhibition

Lisa Mitchell organised the launch of this exhibition, and the following list details the extent of media coverage achieved.

**Print**

Sunday Life - Double page spread

Belfast Telegraph – ½ page spread

The Guardian – Arts Section – Full Page

Daily Mail – 2 ¼ page spread

Irish News – 1 preview + 1 review piece

The Big Issue – (Scotland) 4-5 page spread

Information was sent to all Northern Ireland regional papers and coverage was given in most of them.

Preview and reviews pictures of Exhibition and Derry launch in Derry Journal and Londonderry Sentinel

**Broadcast**

- The 11<sup>th</sup> Hour, BBC NI Arts programme – Interview with Marie Smyth
- UTV Live - 5 minute piece with Marie and visitors to Exhibition in City Hall
- BBC NI Newslines - 4 minute piece with Marie and visitors to Exhibition in City Hall
- BBC Radio Ulster – All news bulletins on Monday, 30 November  
Good Morning Ulster piece with David Clements, Marie Smyth, Paul Morrissey, Ann Finlay and Bell McGuinness
- BBC Radio Foyle – News Bulletins  
Breakfast programme – Marie Smyth interviewed  
The Mary Harte Show – Marie Smyth and Marie Therese Fay interviewed
- BBC Radio 4 - Interview with Marie Smyth and pre-recorded exhibition excerpts read
- BBC Worldwide - As Radio 4 above
- Cool FM/Downtown- Breakfast/early morning news bulletins
- TnaG - Piece for Nuacht by Maire Killoran of exhibition at City Hall
- TV3 - Interview with Marie Therese Fay by Adrian Horseman at City Hall
- Q102 (Derry)- News Bulletins on day of Derry opening.

- **Coverage of other project work**

**Radio Broadcasts**

Several broadcasts for:

- Radio Foyle

Radio Ulster, Good Morning Ulster  
Radio France  
BBC Radio 4 (also Pick of the Week)  
BBC World Service  
Swedish Radio  
RTE Radio

**Television**

BNN Norway  
BBC Choice  
Danish TV  
Sky News  
Newsnight  
BBC Counterpoint

**Newspapers**

Daily Mail  
Belfast Telegraph  
Irish News  
Newsletter  
Derry Journal  
Londonderry Sentinel  
Washington Post  
Boston Herald  
The London Guardian

**Magazines**

New Internationalist  
Fortnight  
Sojourner

**Outreach Work**

**Work with local Groups**

Throughout the project period, we received ongoing requests to address local groups, university based gatherings, conferences and media audiences on issues related to the effects of the Troubles. The work with local groups, where we visit local communities and discuss local issues related to the Troubles has been an important part of our work. We have engaged in this work as part of our networking and building good collaborative relationships with local communities. We have worked actively with Survivors of Trauma, WAVE, Disabled Police Officers Association, Belfast Interface Project, Greencastle Women's Group, An Crann/The Tree, North Belfast Community Development Project and its constituent groups. We have met and worked with a number of other groups such as Cunamh and CALMS (Derry Londonderry), Garvaghy Road Residents, Belfast Central Mission, Kairos, local prisoners organisations, and many of the partnership boards throughout Northern Ireland. Partly as a result of this work, we have frequent requests to assist groups in compiling statistical and other factual material on the effects of the Troubles on their community. Ward death rates are the most frequently requested statistics and, on average we receive one request per week from local groups for this information.

Increasingly we are also receiving requests from consultants and private companies involved in evaluation work.

## **International work**

It has also been a feature of our work that we maintain a broader view of our work and where possible use international perspectives to sharpen our vision of Northern Ireland. Ongoing contacts through the Worldforum on Child Welfare and the European Forum on Child Welfare have given us good contacts in Guatemala and Cyprus amongst other places – both societies in which armed conflict and division have been features of their past and/or present. Through our work with Save the Children in particular we have established links with children’s projects in Colombia, and through our own contacts we have established contacts and working relationships with colleagues in South Africa and maintained and refreshed those contacts through the NIACRO colloquium in February 1999. In 1997, we planned a study visit to South Africa for some of our board members and others working in the field of “victims” but due to the cash flow situation in the Community Relations Council, we have still not received the grant awarded for this. It is hoped that this visit can take place even though the formal project period is ended. Although at least one of our Board has visited South Africa already, a study visit to examine the developments for those bereaved and injured and focussed on the effectiveness of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission would be of enormous value to those working in local groups.

## **Evaluation**

The type of evaluation possible here is necessarily limited by our proximity to our own work. However, insofar as is possible, the work will be evaluated by

1. A review of the original aims of the project and comments on how and if they were achieved.
2. Examination of feedback available on the project’s work
3. Comments on the policy impact of the project insofar as this can be gauged at this point.
4. Impact on Public Awareness
5. Functioning of organisational structures
6. Staff performances

### **1. A review of the original aims of the project and comments on how and if they were achieved.**

The original proposal for the 2-year project detailed the work, aimed to produce a range of outputs, which are listed earlier in this report. These were as follows:

- ✓ an annotated directory of self-help groups related to the need of those injured or bereaved in the Troubles: *this was provided to the Victims Liaison Unit for publication by them*
- ✓ a mapped distribution of deaths during the Troubles: *this was published as first publication of the project, and reprinted in second edition*

- ✓ an exploration of the relationship between deprivation, and the geographical distribution of deaths in the Troubles: *this was published as part of the first publication and a more extended analysis contained in Northern Ireland: The Human Costs Pluto, 1999.*
- ✓ detailed qualitative illustrations of the diversity and range of experience and needs of those affected by the Troubles: *contained in both exhibitions and in the qualitative illustrations to the survey data, and in submissions to the Northern Ireland Victims Commissions and the Compensation Review Commission.*
- ✓ a measure of prevalence, extent and diversity of the effects of the Troubles on the general population of Northern Ireland: *this is contained in the survey analysis and in the ward death rates.*
- ✓ a measure of the extent and range of services used by those affected by the Troubles, and their evaluation of those services: *this was contained in the survey data, and in parts of the qualitative data.*
- ✓ a network of groups and individuals working on issues related to the effect so the Troubles: *through the formation of the board, through our method of working by consultation with groups, by providing talks and workshops locally for groups, and through working with various groups and conferences, a more comprehensive network exists now than at the beginning of the project.*

## 1. Examination of feedback available on the project's work

We have available the following feedback on the project work:

- formal written feedback on the exhibitions
- informal comments from participants and consumers of the project material
- deductions on the usefulness of the information generated by virtue of the demand for it, in terms of data requests and requests for publications, presentations and exhibitions
- complaints about the project work
- **formal written feedback on the exhibitions**

At each showing of the main exhibition, we have circulated comments books and collected comments from visitors about the exhibition.

- **informal comments from participants and consumers of the project material**
- Reporting of this kind of feedback is necessarily biased by our memory of such comments and our capacity to register criticism and praise. Generally, informal verbal comments have been **positive**, in the following veins

1. the work of the project was important in drawing attention to neglected issues.
2. the analysis of deaths in the Troubles stimulated people to re-evaluate their perceptions of the Troubles
3. the work of the project built confidence in participants, particularly young participants
4. the interviews were for some interviewees an “unburdening” and some reported feeling lighter afterwards
5. the project helped to put “victims” issues at the centre stage
6. the project provided reliable “unbiased” “objective” information on the Troubles and their effects.

7. The project offered an opportunity for individuals and groups from differing backgrounds to work together
8. The data is valuable in assisting with the targeting of Troubles related need
9. The project represents a good model of how universities and academics can work in ways that are relevant and sensitive to communities
10. The project has a good volume of concrete outputs – books, exhibitions, papers and presentations

**Negative** comments have included:

1. The project has used methods and language that is not easily understood by local people
2. The project has not been of any value to local groups
3. The project staff have no personal experience of the Troubles
4. The children's exhibition contains Republican propaganda/ lies (the "lies" were later verified as accurate)
5. The main exhibition: "lacks direction"  
"lacks balance"
6. The project has failed to take sufficient care on the issue of obtaining consent in one case where a photograph was used by the project without the consent of the subject.
7. The project has not produced sufficient data on disablement due to the Troubles/ has focused too much on deaths in the Troubles.

In summary, clearly some of these positive and negative comments are justified, whilst others are a matter for various interpretations, and some are of dubious relevance to the value of the project. It is clear that staff must believe that what they are doing is useful in order to continue to do what they do. Some of the shortcomings of the project – such as 10 above must form the subject of further work, since necessarily what has been achieved is limited by the time and resource limits of the project, as well as by the talents and management of the project itself.

- **deductions on the usefulness of the information generated by virtue of the demand for it, in terms of data requests and requests for publications, presentations and exhibitions**

Project staff have been kept busy meeting demands for data, presentations, publications and exhibitions.

#### **Data**

On average one to three requests per week for data by phone, post and email arrive at the office. In addition, a large number of requests for interviews with the Project Director about the project and its outputs are received – on average two per week. Whilst the requests for data are met, it is not always possible to meet request for interviews, since these can take up to an hour each. A large number of these requests are from undergraduate or postgraduate students undertaking project course work, and some are from other academic or commercial researchers. A policy of advising people to obtain and review the project's publications prior to interview has been developed, and to request an interview when they have specific questions about the work of the project has helped to cut down the resources devoted to individual presentations of project findings.



**Presentations**

Again, as can be seen from the list of talks and presentations, substantial numbers of requests are made for presentations. We see this as an important part of research dissemination, and although time-consuming, it goes some way to redressing any problems there might be with the accessibility to local communities of the project outputs.

**Publications****(a) Quality**

All publications with the exception of the Survey of Groups commissioned by the Victims Liaison Unit and the directory of groups were published by INCORE. Thus, all publications were subject to peer review in the normal academic manner. This is aimed at ensuring the quality of the publications. The peer review process was useful and some minor amendments to publications were made prior to publication as a result of this process. In the case of one publication, *Half the Battle*, short-comings in the final proof-reading procedures and lack of proper liaison with the printer resulted in an unacceptable number of layout errors in the final product. Arrangements have been put in place to avoid this in the future.

**(b) Volume of output**

The outputs of the project have been diverse, ranging from books, monographs, catalogues and posters, to videos, tape-recordings a forthcoming film and exhibitions. Certainly staff have spend substantial amounts of time generating these outputs, which hopefully meet the expectations of our funders and consumers in terms of volume. It is our intention that material will continue to be generated from the data collected beyond the formal end of the project, and staff are committed to continuing to use the data in this manner.

**exhibitions**

Our booking schedule for the main exhibition currently runs to the end of 1999, with others expressing interest beyond that period. Mounting exhibitions as a method of disseminating our findings was a risk, in that we did not know in advance what market there would be for such items. We devoted some effort to marketing the main exhibition, and we are satisfied that the resources devoted to their production have been justified by the level of their exposure both within Northern Ireland and beyond.

**11. Comments on the policy impact of the project**

Insofar as this can be gauged at this point, the project has at least succeeded in raising the issue of targeting social need and questioning whether present methods and approaches adequately target those affected by the Troubles. Presentations of project material have not been limited to presentations to local communities, but have also entered the area of the academic conference, and the policy forum. This has been helpful, not only in targeting a policy constituency but also in fine-tuning the ongoing analysis of the project data. It is difficult to assess the impact of a project so soon after its demise, since policy impacts often take longer to manifest themselves. However, within the life-time of the project, there is some evidence of the impact of the data. Sir Kenneth Bloomfield in his report to the Secretary of State writes, "I have been able to draw not only upon useful Government statistics, but also upon the work of the Cost of the Troubles Study, directed by Marie Smyth."

The project also made detailed submissions to the Victims Commission (see Appendix 1) and responded to the “We Will Remember Them” report by Sir Kenneth Bloomfield. The project was also involved in talks with the Social Services Inspectorate in the process of drawing together their inspection of services to those affected by the Troubles, and made a response to their report, “Living with the Trauma of the ‘Troubles’”.

## **12. Impact on public awareness**

To properly evaluate the scale and nature of any impact on public awareness of the work of this project is another project in itself. However, insofar as the project recognised the importance of media coverage in accessing public attention and took steps to impact on public attention through the use of the media, at very least the task was engaged with. Partly due to the political backdrop to the project, media interest in the field was consistent throughout the project period, although some of that interest may not have been coherent with the goals of the project at certain moments.

Relying exclusively on the media to impact public awareness is hazardous, particularly in a climate when self-scrutiny of their role in the conflict is not an activity that the Northern Ireland media have engaged in – not do they show any enthusiasm for doing so in the foreseeable future. Exhibitions have provided a valuable way of directly accessing members of the public in public spaces local to them. The use of exhibitions is currently being explored, by, for example, providing workshops for the public alongside the exhibitions so that a public space for dialogue about the content and impact of the exhibition is also created. This work is at an early stage, and we look forward to learning more about how to improve on its current impact.

## **13. Functioning of organisational structures**

As set out in the introduction, the project functioned as a limited company, having a Board of Directors composed of individuals with direct personal experience of the Troubles and two of the researchers. In addition, an Advisory Group was established.

The Board of Directors had a valuable role in guiding the researchers and staff around the sensitivities of the research field, and improving the projects practices in relation to the ethics of research in the field. It is doubtful if the research team would have acquired such a depth of understanding of the issues had the Board of Directors been composed of academics, other researchers or representatives of funders. Building close working relationships of accountability with those with intimate knowledge of the research subject was invaluable in terms of the benefit to the outputs of the project. Much of the benefit was acquired, not formally in meetings and discussions, but informally by working through issues, noting responses to events and by learning about the problems and issues faced by those living with the often huge personal consequences of the Troubles. The commitment and dedication of our Board, particularly of our Chairman made an enormous contribution to the successes of the project.

On the negative side, with the exceptions of a number of ‘old faithfuls,’ attendance at Board meetings was often poor and undue burdens were often placed on regular attenders by the absence of the other Directors. Undoubtedly, much of the absence was due to the very thing we were studying – the impact of the Troubles. Directors

suffer chronic pain from injuries, ill-health due to stress and the pressure of other commitments in the voluntary sector. This placed the project in an almost unresolvable dilemma – an no immediate solution sprang to mind, either at the time it first arose or subsequently. Consideration should be given in the future to ways of improving levels of participation in management, given the difficulties experienced here.

### **Advisory Group**

An advisory group was also appointed to the project and met at regular intervals throughout the official project period. The function of the group was to advise the researchers about the research and advise and assist with technical aspects of the research. Some of the Advisory Group also held a brief on behalf of funders. In general, the Advisory Group was very useful and provided detailed feedback on questionnaire design, survey procedures and also made many useful suggestions about literature, other research and suggestions about access to comparative data. Staff turnover in some organisations meant that there was some turnover of membership in the Advisory Group which made for difficulties for some members in keeping abreast of the project. Overall, however, the group functioned well and fulfilled a useful function in the project.

### **14. Staffing**

The project was initially fortunate to attract staff with high levels of competence and commitment. Throughout the project period, there has been some turnover in staff, particularly in the administrative post. Fortunately, this has been managed successfully, and “overlaps” where outgoing staff worked alongside incoming staff were used to ensure smooth transfer of responsibilities. Staff turnover represents extra demands on project resources in terms of recruitment and induction of new staff, and wastage of resources in terms of investments made in staff who leave. However, it is not clear how staff turnover can be reduced in the light of the use of short-term contracts, which makes it inevitable that staff are constantly on the look-out for posts with longer contracts or more security.

The stressful nature of the work, together with the relatively high workload of the project meant that staff support mechanisms were important to the maintenance of staff morale and functioning. Where formal paid staff support systems were in place, these seemed to work well, and some of the informal mechanisms were also effective. However, formal methods seem to be more resilient in times of stress and it seems advisable that these should be put in place for all staff in future projects. The issue of accountability where outside contracts are issued for staff debriefing requires formal contracts specifying the contractors responsibility and any limits on confidentiality.

Overall, staff performance was good, and staff showed a willingness to make the project work from the outset. Whilst there were the inevitable problems, overall, staff performances demonstrated enormous commitment and discipline, together with sensitivity and imagination.

### **Project closure**

The project is now formally at an end. In the forthcoming months, a number of residual activities will take place and complete the programme of work. The publication and launch of the survey report, and this final report, and the briefing seminar on the overall results of the project with victims spokespersons from each of the political parties in the Assembly brings to an end the project work.

The Board of Directors have voted to transfer the non-liquid assets of the company to a new project in the same field, and to change the name of the company to reflect the nature of the new project. The staff will continue to manage the bookings and other matters relating to the exhibitions and other outputs of the project. Three trustees will be appointed by the Board of Directors of the Cost of the Troubles Study to manage requests for access to the data generated by the project. It is the hope of all associated with this project that the work undertaken and the materials generated will benefit those whose lives have been blighted by the Troubles, and that our work will have made some positive contribution to preventing such suffering for others in the future.

Marie Smyth  
Project Director

Gráinne Kelly  
Researcher

March 1999.

### **A Perspective from the Chair**

**(to be written)**

## Appendix 1

### Submission to the Bloomfield Commission

#### People affected by the troubles - what is the scale of the problem?

1. Since 1969, 3,585 people have been killed in Northern Ireland. This means that at very least 6,800\* people have the experience of one of their immediate family - parent or sibling – being killed in a troubles-related incident.
2. According to the official figures over 40,000 people have been injured in the troubles, although this is likely to be a conservative figure. There is not readily available data on how many of this 40,000 suffer from major disability as a result of the troubles.

If we take deaths in the troubles as an indicator of how the troubles, (it is likely that injuries and trauma follow the same pattern as deaths), we find:

3. 91% of those killed were male;
4. 37% were under the age of 24, 53% were under the age of 29, and 74% were under the age of 39;
5. Civilians – those without affiliation to the security forces or paramilitary organisations – constitute the largest group amongst those killed - 53%. Security forces from outside Northern Ireland are the next highest percentage – 14.5% followed by Northern Ireland security forces – 14.3%. Within the Northern Ireland security forces, the RUC account for almost 300 deaths, almost 50% more than RIR/UDR deaths. Republican paramilitaries account for 12.5% of those killed, and Loyalist paramilitaries for just over 3%;
6. More Catholics than Protestants have been killed. The death rates for civilians are 3.01 per 1,000 population for Catholics and 1.26 per 1,000 for Protestants. If we include RUC deaths, the rates become 2.5 per 1,000 for Catholics and 1.9 for Protestants. If we exclude those killed by paramilitaries on their own side (Catholics killed by Republican paramilitaries and Protestants killed by Loyalist paramilitaries) then the rate becomes 2.3 for Catholics and 1.4 for Protestants;
7. Republican paramilitaries have killed almost 59% of the total killed 704 of whom were civilians, Loyalist paramilitaries have killed almost 28% of whom 818 were civilians, and the security forces have killed just over 11%, 204 of whom were civilians, with the British army accounting for over 9% of that total;
8. Over 41% of those killed lived in postal districts BT11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 48 and BT35. Over 48% of those killed in the troubles were killed in those same districts – North and West Belfast, Derry Londonderry City and South Armagh.
9. There is some overlap between the “victim” and “perpetrator” categories: some victims go on to join paramilitary organisations, at least partly due to their experience of victimhood.

**If we can generalise from all this, we conclude that the troubles have been a killer of young males from North and West Belfast, Derry Londonderry or the border areas, and who are rather more likely to be Catholic. This is also the group, which is among the most likely to become perpetrators of acts of violence.**

#### APPROACHES TO THE ISSUE

10. All discussions about “victims” of the Troubles run the risk of becoming politicised in the following ways. Acknowledgement of the damage done to a particular grouping or community can

seem to some as an admission of defeat, which will gladden their enemies, and so is to be avoided. Conversely, acknowledgement of such damage can be a way of highlighting the wickedness of those who are responsible for the attacks, and so can become a political weapon. All of this runs the risk of compounding the damage done to those who have been hurt. It is of crucial importance that all discussion about “victims” or people affected is shifted onto a humanitarian basis, based on an inclusive concern about the human needs and the resources required to meet them.

11. The importance of timing, especially in relation to the risk of the recurrence of violence, is difficult to exaggerate. It has only become possible for some people affected by the troubles to begin to address what has happened to them when the cease-fires were announced. Maintaining a relative absence of violence is crucial to the task of addressing the situation of those affected by the troubles. Should there be a return to violence, it will not be possible to take this work forward in the same way. People who have been drastically affected by the troubles often live with high levels of fear. It is only when this fear is reduced, and when an atmosphere of increased safety is in place that it is possible to work constructively with the issues of coming out of violence. This is not to say that people do not have needs when violence is ongoing, but rather to point out that substantial progress can only be made in the absence of violence. Therefore the peace process and progress therein is at the heart of creating services and measures to address the needs of those affected by the troubles.

## THE LEVEL OF NEED

12. The assumption that people “get over” such things in time is not true. In the case of physical disablement, this is visibly not the case. One study we conducted showed that roughly 50% of people still had symptoms of emotional distress and things like sleep disturbance over 20 years after they had been bereaved in the troubles. This means that the scale of the problem may be very large. If we count only immediate family members, there could be over 41,400\* people in the population whose immediate family death or injury in the trouble has directly affected, and who suffer distress or emotional disturbance as a result. This figure does not include all the eye-witnesses, neighbours, friends, extended family, co-workers and so on who have been affected by deaths and injuries in the troubles. Not all of this 41,400\* need or require, for example, counselling. However, the public acknowledgement of their suffering, and the provision of supportive networks or services for those who need them is an important part of our recovery as a society.
13. The converse of this is that some people who have been affected by the troubles have developed their own way of coping with their situation, and have found ways which work for them. Some of these ways involve not talking about what has happened, or distancing themselves from anything which might require them to think too deeply about what has happened, or to look at the issues from another angle. This must be recognised, and people’s right not to participate must be recognised and supported.
14. Many of those affected by the troubles complain about their lack of control over the use of television or still photography of the circumstances of their loss of injury. The reprinting or broadcasting of such material can be very distressing for families and those close to such incidents, and currently little recognition is given to the distress caused by their use without consultation with those closely involved. Many of those who have been disabled have often been made dependent on benefit, and removed from the job-market. Services for the disabled are often inadequate to their needs, and can leave them bitter about their circumstances. Poverty is also another by-product for many that have suffered in the troubles.
15. There is a particular need for the provision of an effective pain management service to cater for those in chronic pain as a result of gunshot and shrapnel wounds.
16. There is also a need to support carers of those with disabilities acquired as a result of the troubles. We estimate that around 100,000 people in Northern Ireland live in households where someone has been injured in a troubles-related incident. Some of these injuries were relatively minor, but some have been severely disabling.
17. Certain groups of people have specific and different needs. For example, members of the security forces who have been injured may suffer more from isolation as a result of being unable to use

civilian services, or join, for example, voluntary groups for disabled people. Families whose members have disappeared have a need for information about the bodies of their relatives. Those living in areas where levels of troubles-related violence has been high often have their lives made more difficult by repeated experiences of troubles-related violence.

18. Many individuals and groups have a sense of injustice and grievance against the paramilitaries, the authorities, the media, politicians, or the human service organisations. The lack of acknowledgement or denial of their needs, questioning of their rights to be considered sympathetically or the lack of support for them after their bereavement, injury or loss has often exacerbated this.
19. Often the needs and wishes of one group are directly opposite to the needs of another group. There are understandably strong feelings among those injured by a particular grouping about, for example that grouping receiving attention, services or sympathy. This means that the provision of services according to need or the creation of, for example, a monument including all names is unconscionable to some, while others consider such a step as important to their own coming to terms with what has happened to them.
20. There has been an assumption that counselling is the appropriate and sometimes only form of services required by those affected by the troubles. This assumption is questionable. Many people are not in need of counselling, but rather of some other service. Even some of those who could benefit from counselling are reluctant to use counselling because of the stigma attached and the implication that there is “something wrong” with the person being counselled.
21. A small number of people only will need psychiatric, psychological or counselling help. It is erroneous to assume that because so few require or want psychiatric help that the general level of needs of those affected by the troubles is low. Those who do not need or wish to use psychological or psychiatric help often have other needs, such as needs for befriending, social support, relief for carers, physiotherapy, pain relief, public recognition, legal or financial advice, control over old footage or photographs of the incident involving them or at least advance consultation about their use by the media, or further information about the circumstances of the incident which caused their suffering.

## SERVICES TO THOSE AFFECTED BY THE TROUBLES

### STATUTORY SERVICES

22. Many of us, including those providing services to vulnerable people have operated during the troubles by not mentioning the troubles, not identifying ourselves or our true responses to certain situations, and being cautious or silent when troubles related issues were raised. This has meant that there can be a “conspiracy of silence” in organisations about the effects of the troubles. People are often fearful that if the issues are discussed, it will be divisive and lead to conflict, so they are ignored.
23. Currently there is no specialist training available for psychiatrists, psychologists, social workers, health visitors, general practitioners, teachers and other professionals to prepare them for the kinds of effects the troubles may have on their clients and patients, nor is there specific training or information on the range of appropriate services or approaches to use.
24. Currently, there is one trauma team based in Belfast, which caters for the needs of people immediately after a major incident. This does not address the long-term needs of people, not does it cater for individuals injured, bereaved or traumatised in incidents where small number are involved
25. There is an acute shortage of psychiatric help for all adolescents, so adolescents who require such help as a result of the troubles are unlikely to receive it. There are only six beds available in Northern Ireland for adolescents requiring in-patient psychiatric care. In 1994, 242 young people were held in adult psychiatric wards, hardly the place for distressed adolescents. Levels of outpatient support can be similarly totally inadequate. One adolescent we know of in the North West was offered a fortnightly phone call from a community psychiatric nurse as follow-up care after a serious suicide attempt.

## VOLUNTARY SERVICES

26. Currently, the major service providers providing dedicated services for those affected by the Troubles are in the voluntary sector. WAVE, whose main service is befriending and home visiting throughout Northern Ireland and who also provide a counselling service and facilities for children; Survivors of Trauma, who are a locally based self-help group in North Belfast; An Crann/ The Tree who listen and collect people's accounts of the troubles, Cunamh, a locally based project in Derry Londonderry, CALMS a project which offers training in stress management for local groups. Other voluntary organisations, such as CRUSE and Victim Support, which have experience of working in allied areas such as bereavement or the effects of crime, began to become more involved in working with those affected by the troubles after the cease- fires.
27. The system of financial compensation for those who have been bereaved, injured or have had property damaged as a result of the troubles has also caused some disquiet and distress. There are wide disparities between amounts paid to those with apparently similar injuries. Compensation in the case of injury or bereavement is based not on need but on loss sustained, and is partly calculated according to loss of earnings. This means that some have received little or no compensation where the victim was unemployed, where others receive relatively large amounts. This is perceived as some lives being regarded as more valuable than others are. There are strong feelings amongst some that the system is unjust and insensitive.
28. Those suing for criminal damage to property have also found the system of compensation unsatisfactory. Long delays in processing and paying claims, together with interest payment incurred on loans taken to rebuild or repair business premises has caused financial difficulty to claimants, and in some cases the collapse of businesses.

### Where do we go from here?

29. Any initiative in this area carries a heavy emotional charge, and those injured and bereaved have often been used to further political agendas, sometimes at the expense of their own welfare. It is imperative that any new initiatives on so-called victims of the troubles (we prefer the term "people affected by the troubles") avoid further misuse of people's suffering and loss.
30. Provision that has been made elsewhere has fallen into the trap of raising unrealistic expectations on the part of those who have suffered, only to have their disappointment added to their suffering.

### For these reasons the following suggestions are made:

31. That all measures and initiatives are based on a clear understanding **that the losses sustained by many people in the troubles are irrecoverable**, and that no measure or compensation can possibly make good that loss. Everything that we can do is destined to be inadequate. We cannot bring back the dead, restore the maimed, or turn the clock back. Measures should not therefore be based on principles of restorative justice, but rather on the principles of meeting existing and future need.
32. That the timing of such proposals be carefully considered, that nothing is rushed into and that a lengthy inclusive and exhaustive period of consultation with groups in the community is engaged in before any decisions are made or announced. This period of consultation is important given the rate of progress on the political process, and the lack of any settlement. All developments in relation to commemoration are dependent on a cessation of violence for the continued involvement of certain categories of people affected by the Troubles. Should violence recur, certain people may well consider their safety to be jeopardised by continued involvement in cross-community and other measures designed to commemorate or record the situation to victims. We can only hope that the politicians will recognise that their most important contribution to the welfare of victims is to ensure, through their negotiations, a permanent end to violence.
33. For many people who have suffered in the troubles, one of the casualties was their trust in outside authorities. This should be recognised by such authorities, and confidence building measures aimed at those who have been bereaved and injured should be composed of the democratic involvement of this group in decision making about the kinds of services and initiatives to be embarked on. Only in this way can trust be built slowly.



34. There is also a need for people in authority to listen and acknowledge the discontent and anger felt by certain people. It is imperative that the expression of this anger does not lead to defensiveness or reaction on the part of the authorities. Careful listening and acknowledgement, and where appropriate expressions of regret may be all that is required. It would be extremely helpful if authorities (and politicians) would recognise the anger and rage that are part of the response of those who have suffered most. In our view, this anger must be respected, without getting involved in conflict or arguments with people. People have a right to be angry and to express it, and it is a small enough service to listen and acknowledge the depth of their feelings.

### *Aims and Goals*

35. It is also suggested that there is a need for clarity and transparency about the long-term goals of any initiative on the situation of those affected by the troubles. It is suggested that the goal of such initiatives must be linked to the overall political process and should be:

To contribute to reconciliation through healing of individual and collective wounds and hurts

36. This could be achieved through initiatives which manifest:

- **the support of the society for those bereaved, injured or otherwise damaged**
- **the recognition of the society of the suffering and loss sustained during the troubles**
- **the acknowledgement of the sense of injustice of the suffering, which is commonly held but differently understood in the various sections of people who have suffered**
- **the remembrance of those who have lost their lives for what they believed to be just causes**
- **the practical support of those who have been injured in the Troubles**
- **the specific acknowledgement of the suffering of civilians and non-combatants**
- **a new willingness to acknowledge the suffering of people from all walks of life and sections of the community**
- **a new willingness on the part of all of us to take responsibility for our part in creating and maintaining a society which has hurt so many of us**
- **The regret and remorse of all of us about the hurts that has been caused.**

The following practical measures and stages are suggested:

#### **37. PHASE 1:**

**A BODY TO PROMOTE SERVICES TO THOSE AFFECTED BY THE TROUBLES:** In parallel to the measures suggested above, any process should not ignore the direct practical needs of those affected by the Troubles. There has been a total absence of public policy in relation to this area, a total lack of professional training and very little or no support for initiatives in the voluntary sector. This is partly due to a culture of silence and denial around issues related to the Troubles, which was part of our survival and coping strategies whilst the violence was ongoing. There is a need for an independent public body to act as a catalyst to “ginger up” existing service providers to make good the deficits in their policy, training and provision for people affected by the troubles.

38. Part of this will involve the re-orientation of professional and organisational cultures, which is long term work. However, in the shorter term, as their part of the peace process, service providers must now be encouraged to re-examine their own orientation and practice, and to develop policy and practices which reflect the past and are appropriate to the new situation. Since the cease-fires, new needs have emerged and people have felt safe to come forward and seek services. We can expect that this trend will continue for some time to come

39. Such a body could be composed of :

- representatives of service providers who are open to re-evaluation and re-examination of their services to those affected by the troubles

- representatives of medicine, psychology, psychiatry, psychotherapy, teaching, social work, nursing,
  - representatives of diverse victim advocacy groups - and the proceedings must be designed to empower them to participate
40. Such a body would have the remit of examining the current provision for those affected by the troubles in terms of :
- Medical services (including implications for medical training)
  - Psychological, psychotherapeutic and psychiatric services (including implications for training in these fields)
  - Financial compensation
  - Aids adaptations and support for carers of people disabled in the troubles.
  - Support groups and networks and the financial and other support for them
  - Provision within the education system, (including the management in schools of behavioural sequelae in children, the implications for teacher training, literacy and educational performance, and special educational provision)
41. ***Such a body would be empowered by central government to report to them, and to liaise with and receive co-operation from the various professional bodies and government departments in preparing their reports and recommendations.***
42. Funding to support innovations, additional training and the improvement of services to those affected by the troubles must be made available to ensure that the work of such a body is actualised. Such a body could also be granted fund-raising powers, and could seek such funding in Europe or internationally.

### ***PROPOSAL FOR A MONUMENT***

43. It is tempting for some to rush into establishing measures which “put the past behind us.” However, the danger is that any such measures are premature. Many tensions still exist, and the talks process has not arrived at any settlement or conclusion. Furthermore, even were a settlement in place, the proposal to erect a memorial for those killed in the Troubles, whilst emanating from a laudable desire to commemorate and honour the memory of people killed, has great potential for increasing division and conflict.
44. The issue, for example of whose names might be engraved on such a monument is highly contentious, yet exclusion of some names, and who makes such decisions to exclude, will not contribute to building an inclusive and peaceful society. For these reasons, it appears that to pursue the construction of a monument with names at this stage is not advisable. Should such a project be pursued at a later stage, it might be advisable to focus on a symbolic monument, which does not contain names.
45. Such memorials have been constructed in situations where there has been a clearer demarcation between enemy and friend, and where the enemy is often from another country. In Northern Ireland, the conflict is much more characteristic of ethnic conflict, and so the task of commemorating the dead is much more complex and riven with hazards.
46. For this reason, it is important that the work involved in establishing measures to commemorate the dead or consider the situation of victims should move very slowly indeed, to avoid any pre-emptive action, and that generous amounts of time devoted at every stage of such work to public consultation. It is important that the process is informed by a set of principles and not deflected from those principles, yet is flexible and sensitive enough to respond to public responses and changes in the political context.
47. It is important that a set of aims and principles on which such work is based are in the public domain, and are adhered to by those embarking on the work (see 36 above for a suggested set of principles.) This is crucial in order to avoid the inevitable to direct such work in a particular direction, and away from “the other side.”

48. It is particularly welcome that the Victims Commission is considering a wide range of ways in which the dead can be commemorated. Whilst the establishment of, for example, a public work of art will be important to certain sections of the community, it is important that commemoration is a process which is diverse enough to be accessible to people in all walks of life, and with widely differing priorities. The commissioning of a public work of art runs the risk of criticism on the grounds that the money would be better spent on those who have suffered. For this reason, a range of initiatives catering for a wider constituency is important.
49. Commemorating the dead could be approached in a creative way, and in a manner, which directly addresses the individuals, groups, and communities worst affected by the Troubles. Forms of memorial which are socially relevant and which document and educate us about our differences and the diversity of our experiences could be included. The following is a possible package of measures which would meet these requirements:
50. **PHASE 2: ESTABLISHING AN INDEPENDENT PUBLIC BODY: Public consultation & fund-raising.** The establishment of an independent public body which would carry forward the work of commemoration and integration of the lessons of the past would be an important first step. Such a body must be independent, since the role of government in the conflict is not perceived to be neutral by all parties. This body could have the following remit:
- to publicly consult and make recommendations and oversee the establishment of a Museum of the Troubles (see 45 below); a permanent monument to those killed (see 52 below);
  - to oversee the awarding of scholarships, bursaries (see 51 below); and
  - to oversee and manage the support to communities (see 49 below)
  - to seek international funding for such a project, which would be potentially very attractive to international funders.
51. The composition of such a body could be a mixture of appointments and nominees from with various communities and other organisations with the relevant credibility, expertise and diversity. It is crucial that such a Board is representative of communities (both geographical and communities of interest) worst affected by the Troubles, as well as containing the relevant technical and other expertise.
52. **PHASE 3: ESTABLISHING A MUSEUM OF THE TROUBLES:** I would recommend that consideration be given to announcing the establishment of a museum of the Troubles, to which individuals, groups and communities be invited to contribute. Such a museum could act as an archive and as an educational and research resource and which could be open to the public and to schools. Contributions from, for example the Political Collection of the Linenhall Library, An Crann/ The Tree, and The Cost of the Troubles Study could immediately provide the backbone of such a collection.
53. **PUBLIC & COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION:** Invitations to anyone who wished to contribute to such a museum could be issued, and the collection set up in such a way that it can contain conflicting and opposing perspectives, which can be cross-referenced to each other. These views would include those outside Northern Ireland whose lives have been touched by the Troubles.
54. **Technical and research support to communities** and other parties who wished to create local displays or commemoration, and/or who wished to contribute to the museum's collection would be an important part of the museum staff's brief. Staff appointed should be capable of work in local communities as well as having research, display or historical expertise. This support should include financial support for communities in order to assist them establish appropriate local memorial events or symbols.
55. Some geographical communities and communities of interest are beginning at this stage to "write their own history" in terms of what has happened to them during the Troubles. This is a very important development, which should be supported. By collecting such information, the past is being re-organised in a way that could be an important part of healing. This might eventually facilitate such communities in becoming more focussed on a future which is informed rather than determined by the past.

56. **CONTAINING DIVERSE VIEWS AND OPPOSING ACCOUNTS:** It would be important that a variety of views, some of them opposing, could be contained in such a Museum, and that sensitive curating and cross-referencing be a part of standard practice. There are some models of good practice in this area, such as Brian Lacey's Siege Museum in Derry Londonderry.
57. In our experience of mounting public exhibitions and in conducting research on troubles-related issues, it is also crucially important the those making contributions to public displays or exhibits are fully engaged and consulted about issues such as anonymity, libel and the dissemination of material that is likely to jeopardise safety. Delicate negotiations and tough decisions are part of this work. The right of the individual to speak out with immunity, versus the legal and moral requirements on those displaying the material is part of the balancing act. However, the end result is more than worth the effort. Making publicly accessible information about the views, experiences of the "other" community to people have proved to be of great interest to people who would otherwise have no access to such information. One can envisage such a museum containing various rooms in which diverse materials are displayed and that the overall museum contains a microcosm of the Northern Ireland conflict.
58. **PHASE 4: OUTREACH** Such a museum could also act as a proactive educational resource, which encourages the re-examination of the history of the troubles in ways which allow us to learn from the past, and apply those lessons in designing the future. Schools programmes, such as the existing EMU (Education for Mutual Understanding) programmes could be involved in using such a facility. It could also be used by further and higher educational programmes in Peace Studies, Politics, Anti-Sectarian Training, History and other forms of civic education.
59. An important part of such a project would be an out-reach programme for communities, voluntary organisations, and others. This programme could take the spirit - if not all the contents - to the more inaccessible parts of Northern Ireland, where people have suffered as a result of the Troubles, or where people may wish to increase their understanding.
60. **BURSARIES AND SCHOLARSHIPS:** Various memorial scholarships be established, perhaps in association with the Museum project so that:
- resources are directed at increasing educational opportunities for those most affected by the Troubles, and that
  - scholarship and ethical and relevant research on the needs of those affected by the troubles, for example the development of pain management methods, is encouraged and supported.
61. **A MONUMENT:** Part of the brief of the Board of the independent body could be to investigate and report on the establishment of a permanent monument to those killed in the troubles. This brief could include recommendations about the method by which it is designed, its location, and how the public might be involved in decision-making about it. If such a public monument is to be constructed, the design might be selected from entrances to a public competition. If the commission is to be given to professional artists, it is important to avoid associating it more with one part of the community than another. Consideration might be given to commissioning a consortium of local artists whose origins lie in the various parties to the conflict, and who are willing to work together in a manner which produces a monument which represents the tensions, diversity and possibility for creative collaboration between these parties.

Marie Smyth  
 Project Director, The Cost of the Troubles Study/  
 Research Fellow, INCORE  
 December 3, 1997.

\* Calculations on estimated numbers of immediate family are based on the average household size for Northern Ireland (2.9) less the member of the household killed or injured. We calculate the total number of immediate household members affected by bereavement or injury by multiplying the average household size minus one by the total number killed and injured.

## Second Submission to the Bloomfield Commission

### **Residual matters relating to victims of the Troubles in the light of the Agreement document.**

(To be read in the light of the earlier paper)

I have made the following notes based on my understanding of the Agreement document, and the concerns it raises in relation to victims. It has been read avidly by those we work with, and generally the response has been favourable. Therefore I think it is important, given that the Victims commission is mentioned in the Agreement, that any undertakings in the Agreement are seen to be delivered on.

The second stimulus to the following remarks is a consciousness that we as an organisation have been performing some of the functions outlined below, particularly those in relation to providing information and non-financial resources to local groups, and those of providing information on international approaches. We, however, will go out of business at the end of this year, when the funding for this project finishes. In my view, this work is valuable, particularly in supporting and bringing together those working in this field, and in encouraging local communities to begin to audit the effect of the Troubles on them, as a precursor to developing local initiatives. It is important that this work should be continued by someone.

1. **Crucial role of Victims Commission:** Whilst the inclusion of victims in the agreement document of 17 April, 1998 is welcome, it refers and relies on the work of the Victims Commission to provide the substance of the response to the situation of victims. This means that any findings or measures recommended by the Victims Commission will be linked to the agreement, and the ethos of the agreement.
2. **International expertise:** The agreement makes particular mention of areas worst affected by the troubles, and the need to support community based initiatives in such areas, which should not only be financially supported, but should also be resourced with expertise based on “international best practice” established in other societies coming out of violence. This will involve locating such international expertise, and making it accessible to local communities, in accordance with community development practice.
3. **Deconstructing silence and denial:** Many of the established voluntary and statutory organisations operating in this field have not addressed the issue of victims of the Troubles, and may have some difficulty in doing so, due to the long-standing culture of silence and denial that has surrounded these issues. Such organisations should be supported, through training, organisational development and other initiatives, to begin to formulate organisational policies and goals around meeting the needs of those who have suffered in the Troubles.
4. **Allocation of resources:** The agreement also makes mention of “services that are supportive and sensitive to the needs of victims... channelled through both statutory and community based voluntary organisations facilitating locally based self-help and support networks. This will require the allocation of sufficient resources, including statutory funding as necessary, to meet the needs of victims and to provide for community based support programmes.” It will be important that those responsible for resource allocation have a sound understanding of the field and are able to evaluate proposals from a broad perspective. It is to be recommended that those with personal experience of bereavement or injury are involved in these processes. It is also crucial that some objective method of evaluating need is adopted, so that resources can be directed at the communities and groups that have suffered most, not merely at those who are good at obtaining resources. Support should also be provided to communities in order to assist them to access resources where the level of need is high, but where the community infrastructure does not exist to obtain resources.
5. **The need for a dedicated Trauma Centre:** As we mentioned in our earlier meeting, the needs of victims are diverse, with a small number requiring skilled psychotherapeutic treatment of conditions such as Post Traumatic Stress Disorder and the aftermath of torture. We have found that even though the numbers requiring scale of this need are limited, the situation of people is often

totally disabling, and the need is not likely to disappear for at least a generation. Visitors to Northern Ireland are shocked that there is not a professional Trauma Centre already established, and in our experience, there is a skills deficit in the professions in recognising and treating such Troubles related conditions. Furthermore, some professionals appear to think that no special skills or knowledge is required for treating, for example, victims of torture. Local practice has been to rely heavily on medication, which is not in accordance with the state of knowledge in the field. Given that there are, in our estimation, several hundred people at least who suffer severe symptoms as a result of failed assassination attempts, witnessing brutality and so on, we would argue in favour of establishing a specialist service. This should be located outside of the normal mental health services perhaps housed within an independent body, in order to avoid stigmatisation and local professional politics. In such an initiative, local professional people coming fresh to the problem can be trained according to international best practice, and sent if necessary to Helsinki or Cape Town to gain the requisite skills and expertise. In my view, such an initiative should glean what it can from international experience in the field, and the appointment of advisors from international sites of excellence, who can act as sources of advice and support would be an invaluable resource.

6. **Services for young people:** Furthermore, there is a shortage of NHS facilities in mental health in general, with a doubling since 1992 of children and young people held in adult psychiatric wards in Northern Ireland. There are a total of 6 residential psychiatric beds for young people in Northern Ireland.

<b>Children and Adolescents in Adult In-Patient Psychiatric Facilities in Northern Ireland</b>			
<b>Year</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>% increase over previous year</b>	<b>% increase over 1991/92</b>
1991/92	112	base	base
1992/93	125	11.6%	11.6%
1993/94	137	9.6%	22.32%
1994/95	179	30.7%	59.82%
1995/96	232	29.6%	107.1%

Source of baseline data for each year: Mental Health Inpatient System: Department of Health: increases calculated by author.

**Young people, particularly young males as a priority:** Given that the agreement document specifically prioritises young people, and given that our research shows that young people, particularly young (Catholic) males are at the highest risk from death in the Troubles, it is important that the support services and provision to young people are urgently reviewed. The major children's charities should be galvanised in this work, to lend it credibility and independence in the communities worst affected. In such communities, both Catholic and Protestant there is widespread disaffection from government agencies, and I fear for the effectiveness of any new initiative from that source. Services to children and young people are currently woefully inadequate, and require urgent review.

7. **Family support and therapy:** Specialist family therapy services will also be important in providing support for families who have not been able to cope with, for example, the impact of bereavement. We have evidence of parents being unable to fulfil their parental responsibilities because of the impact of a death or trauma on them.
8. **Rebuilding the social fabric of communities:** Much of the thinking about victims of the Troubles has focussed on individuals and families. However, whole communities and communities of interest have been damaged, the culture of violence has been established in such communities and the social fabric seriously damaged. If there is to be a lasting peace, the work of rebuilding that social fabric in such communities is of crucial importance. This has been a challenge faced by many societies coming out of violence, and again, we should learn from the experience elsewhere.
9. **Training for mental health and general practitioners:** Some of the resources allocated should, in my view, be used to provide better and further training for mental health and general

practitioners in recognising, referring on and treating the mental health sequelae to the Troubles. What is urgently required is a competent service to which they can refer on, and this point was dealt with above in relation to the establishment of a Trauma centre.

10. **Training for new and existing professionals:** In other professions, such as social work, teaching and nursing, professional bodies should be provided with effective incentives to initiate the inclusion of new training at basic, post-qualifying and in-service levels. This new training would ensure that people practising in these professions are equipped to recognise and deal appropriately with the effect of the Troubles on people they come into contact with.
11. **Resources to support self-help and social support initiatives:** Many of those who have suffered require social support and self-help opportunities. Contrary to what might be supposed, the establishment of social support networks and facilitation of self-help initiatives is skilful and work, which requires a sound knowledge base in human services. Specifically, workers in this field must be able to build the capacity in local communities and support local initiatives with expertise, information and access to a wider network. People who have been victims of the Troubles, in our experience, often do not have the personal resources to manage and operate organisations without the support of paid workers who can carry the day to day responsibilities on their behalf.
12. **Democratising services & accountability:** It is crucial that such initiatives remain genuinely in the control of users, since the ‘professionalising’ of services may well provide cues for professionals, but it further stigmatises and disempowers people. What is called for is a new professionalism that makes itself genuinely accountable to its patients and clients in a way many of the professional services in Northern Ireland have not done until now.
13. **Employment of former victims:** Where possible local people and those who have personal experience of surviving loss in the Troubles are employed in such schemes, and in any new initiatives for those affected by the Troubles.
14. **Establishment of an independent body of “experts” with personal experience of loss/injury:** Consideration should be given to a permanent independent body or commission that would advise, support and promote work with victims of the Troubles. Such a body should be multi-disciplinary and accountable to (or composed of) a Board of people who have personal experience of loss and injury in the Troubles. Its remit could be to influence existing services to gear themselves towards Troubles-related needs, and to advise and provide resources for local communities who wish to establish local self-help and other services.
15. **Trust and acceptability of new services:** In the light of recent developments and the response to the Victims Commission, thought must be given to the participation and accessibility of any new arrangements to both of the main traditions in Northern Ireland. It should be remembered that those bereaved and injured by security forces are often understandably mistrustful of state provision, and often reluctant to participate in, for example the consultative exercise on the Victims Commission, or to use state services. It is part of the healing process that provision should take these fears into account and provide services that are acceptable to the people who need them.
16. **Public awareness:** In the course of our research, we have concluded that there are two worlds in Northern Ireland. The first world is the mainstream one, where the impact of the Troubles is limited to news broadcasts and occasional fear, inconvenience or upset. The other world is that inhabited by those who have been severely affected by the Troubles, where everything is significant in relation to the Troubles, every street has memories or dangers, anniversaries bring it all back. Most people do not know about this second world. Yet an appreciation of how much people have suffered is an important motivator for people in the task of building a peaceful society. Educational programmes, that are not sensationalist, or focussed on one incident or group of people should be established so that public understanding of victims’ medium and long term experience is increased.
17. **Truth and justice:** For some people who have lost family members, there are strong feelings of injustice in cases where there are unresolved justice issues, missing bodies, unanswered questions. For these people, resolution or healing is often impossible in the absence of knowing more about the circumstances of what happened to their loved ones. The Victims Commission must address the situation of these people, by some formal public means, so that their quest for more

information and public acknowledgement of what happened is satisfied as best it can be. We recognise that this is a difficult area in the context of a wider agreement involving prisoners and parties with links to paramilitaries. However, the situation of these people could be put to those parties, with a view to coming up with an agreed mechanism by which the situation of victims' families could be realistically addressed.

I hope these remarks are helpful.

Marie Smyth  
Project Director  
The Cost of The Troubles Study  
INCORE  
The United Nations University /University of Ulster

22 April, 1998.